Another World Mission Conference: What Impact?

This issue, which marks the completion of twenty years of publication of the INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN, comes off the press on the eve of a major world conference on mission and evangelism. “Called to One Hope: The Gospel in Diverse Cultures,” sponsored by the World Council of Churches, will meet in Salvador, Brazil, November 24–December 3, 1996. It is the eleventh in a series of world missionary conferences that began with Edinburgh 1910. The preparations for this conference echo Edinburgh in that many study groups around the world have been involved for two years or more in examining local issues of the Gospel and culture, and in drafting materials for illuminating the conference theme at Salvador. We join the conference coordinators in praying that through the conference God’s people will “be strengthened in their cultural identity, renewed in their Christian life, and equipped for authentic witness in each context” (see “Prayer,” p. 149).

On the eve of Salvador, the INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN offers a major review and evaluation by Norman E. Thomas of the impact of world mission conferences. Charles W. Forman follows with a response to Thomas, adding important detail regarding the ongoing contributions of selected mission conferences. Some readers may find it hard to believe that, as Thomas states, no less than eleven mission consultations and prayer conferences, in ten countries, were held in 1993 alone. Even more startling is the statistic cited by Forman: there were about 600 ecumenical consultations held between 1948 and 1982—almost twenty per year!

What impact have conferences such as these had on the world Christian mission? Out of his review of nearly a century and a half of Protestant world mission conferences, Thomas identifies eight categories of impact, both immediate and ongoing. He acknowledges what we might well expect, that not all impacts of all conferences were positive—as, for example, in the case of the call for a moratorium on missionaries (Bangkok 1973). Both Thomas and Forman lament the decrease in recent years of preconference preparation and study papers and postconference publication of papers and reports. This issue of the INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN will help us appreciate the heritage of 150 years of world mission conferences and whet our appetites for the outcome of Salvador 1996.

On Page

146 World Mission Conferences: What Impact Do They Have? Norman E. Thomas
149 A Prayer WCC Conference on World Mission and Evangelism
155 Response to Norman Thomas Charles W. Forman
157 Latin America’s Fifth Wave of Protestant Churches Clayton L. Berg, Jr., and Paul E. Pretiz
160 From the Evangelical Alliance to the World Evangelical Fellowship: 150 Years of Unity with a Mission W. Harold Fuller
162 Noteworthy
163 The Legacy of Charles Henry Brent Mark D. Norbeck
167 Reader’s Response
170 My Pilgrimage in Mission Eugene Heideman
174 Book Reviews
182 Index 1993–1996
192 Book Notes
On May 15, 1806, William Carey, the pioneer Baptist missionary to India, wrote from Calcutta to Andrew Fuller, secretary of the Baptist Missionary Society:

The Cape of Good Hope is now in the hands of the English; should it continue so, would it not be possible to have a general association of all denominations of Christians, from the four quarters of the world, kept there once in about ten years? I earnestly recommend this plan, let the first meeting be in the Year 1810, or 1812 at furthest. I have no doubt but it would be attended with very important effects; we could understand one another better, and more entirely enter into one another’s views by two hours conversation than by two or three years epistolary correspondence.

Carey’s vision was remarkable, for it took the world church and the ecumenical movement another hundred years to achieve Carey’s bold proposal at the World Missionary Conference in Edinburgh, Scotland, in 1910.

What has been the impact of world mission conferences? Now, 190 years after what Carey called his “pleasing dream,” and almost 90 years after Edinburgh, it is time to take stock. This overview will be limited to selected Protestant world mission conferences. The first part provides a brief historical overview. The typology of impacts in the second part has been developed inductively from the reports of planners and participants in the conferences themselves.

Four Streams to Edinburgh

In 1854 the British and American branches of the Evangelical Alliance sponsored the Union Missionary Convention in New York with Alexander Duff, the well-known missionary from India, as keynote speaker. With “the evangelization of the world” as its central concern, the convention demonstrated “that Christians of every shade of denominational opinion can here find a common ground of Christian philanthropy, and for Christian cooperation and effort.” In a great public service in the Broadway Tabernacle, with “some hundreds” turned away for lack of space, Duff challenged the convention to “prove that we are one in Christian enterprise—one in burning desire and self-sacrificing effort of this world’s evangelization.” This was the prototype of 150 years of world mission conferences to follow.

W. Richey Hogg delineated four streams of nineteenth-century missionary cooperation that flowed together in 1910 to make possible the famed Edinburgh Conference. The first of these is missionary-convened conferences held overseas on local, regional, or national levels to explore issues of mission theory, practice, and organization. As nineteenth-century missionaries met together in India, China, Japan, and the countries of Africa and Latin America, they experienced a oneness in Christ across mission society and denominational lines. By the 1830s those in India met interdenominationally in Bombay, Calcutta, and Madras. In the 1860s they formed North and South India missionary conferences and envisioned for the first time a “Church of Christ in India.” The series of still-larger “decennial conferences” for all workers in India began in 1872; these were the first to include Indian pastors as participants. Parallel developments took place among missionaries in other countries and continents. These conferences resulted in “a greatly heightened sense of Christian unity,” agreements to plan cooperatively in mission (e.g., comity agreements for the allocation of mission fields within a country), and joint endeavors in medicine, education, Bible translation, production of Christian literature, and so forth.

Two missionary conferences at the turn of the century were Edinburgh prototypes. The Madras Missionary Conference (for all India) in 1900 was innovative in both representation and procedure. Instead of a large missionary convention, each missionary society elected or appointed official delegates to represent them. No papers were read. Instead, delegates worked in nine committees wrestling with problems, drafting resolutions, and submitting them to the entire conference for discussion and action. The 1907 Shanghai Conference, in contrast, blended features of both convention and conference models. Although 3,445 Protestant missionaries in China attended this great Centenary Conference of Chinese Missions (almost one-third of the Protestant missionaries in China), only 509 were voting delegates, representing 63 mission societies.

A second stream took place in Europe and North America in the form of large missionary conventions to awaken public support for missions. Embryonic beginnings (New York and London 1854) were followed by successively larger Anglo-American consultations in Liverpool (1860) and London (1878). Two years of planning preceded the next convention held in London in 1888 and billed as the Centenary Conference on the Protestant Missions of the World. Intentionally international in participation, the 1,579 delegates from 139 different denominations and mission societies represented ten countries of North America and western Europe, although more than 80 percent were from Great Britain and the British colonies. Although A. T. Pierson, editor of the prestigious Missionary Review of the World, extolled it as “the grandest ecumenical council ever assembled since the first council in Jerusalem,” Gustav Warneck, Germany’s pioneer missiologist, lamented that no resolutions touching mission issues were allowed. Warneck proposed that henceforth in each decade a “General Missionary Conference be held composed of official delegates from all Protestant missionary societies,” with a “Standing Central Committee” with power to act between meetings—a vision not realized until Edinburgh 1910. In contrast to the 1888 London assembly with its disappointing public response, the New York “Ecumenical Missionary Conference” of 1900 was by far the largest missionary conference of the century, with daily crowds overflowing Carnegie Hall and an estimated 170,000–200,000 persons in total attendance, although only 2,500 were official delegates from 162 mission boards. During ten days of meetings 500 platform speakers (but just 8 from younger churches) addressed every conceivable mission topic; inspiring worship and fervent prayer motivated attendees to support missionary efforts generously. “Such conferences,” wrote Robert E. Speer, “though they serve to do little . . . yet serve always to reveal the great and irresistible movements of the spirit of God.”

A third stream of missionary cooperation in Europe and

---

Through the student movements, future mission leaders learned skills for united witness and action.
resulted from the 1908 report of the Joint Committee. Concerning the object of the proposed conference, the committee's judgment was that it "should not be devoted primarily to educational and inspirational purposes" but rather should feature "thorough study and consultation by the leaders of the foreign missionary forces of the world concerning the large and most vital questions of missionary opportunity and policy." Official delegates were to be restricted to under 1,200, but every Protestant missionary agency was invited to send official delegates with proportional representation according to the relative size of the missionary force or budget, including leaders "on the Mission fields." Another distinctive proposal was that the conference consider reports from special study commissions working as far in advance as possible.

An international committee accepted the proposed model, naming Mott as general chairman and J. H. Oldham as the conference's full-time salaried secretary. The price of full Anglican participation was a proviso that questions of doctrine and church polity be excluded where participating societies differed among themselves. A further proviso excluded almost all missions to Latin America and Europe, since such missions did not send missionaries "among non-Christian peoples."11

Reflecting on Edinburgh 1910 as the "ecumenical keystone," W. Richey Hogg identified three operating principles as keys to its effectiveness: convening only officially appointed delegates, maintaining broad denominational inclusiveness, and operating cooperatively on essential tasks while neither requiring theological consensus nor compromising any conviction. Fifty years after Edinburgh, Oldham, its organizing secretary, judged the appointment by the conference of its Continuation Committee (which became the International Missionary Council in 1921) to be "the decisive event which made possible the growth of the ecumenical movement."12

Three Streams from Edinburgh

From Edinburgh flowed three streams of international mission conferences. The first has been called the ecumenical stream. With a growing number of participants from the "younger churches," the International Missionary Council (IMC) sponsored major missionary meetings at Jerusalem (1928); Tambaram/Madras (1938); Whitby, Canada (1947); Willingen, Germany (1952); and Accra, Ghana (1958). While each had public sessions as well as deliberative meetings of official delegates, Jerusalem and Madras, with their multivolume production of preparatory papers and reports, emulated Edinburgh (1910), while the post–World War II meetings had more modest study components. Following the integration in 1961 of the IMC into the World Council of Churches (WCC) as the latter's mission arm, the tradition of mission conferences has continued: Mexico City (1963); Bangkok (1973); Melbourne, Australia (1980); and San Antonio, Texas (1989), with the 1996 conference to be convened in November, in Salvador, Brazil.13

The second stream is the succession of evangelical world mission conferences that lay claim to Edinburgh's evangelical fervor for mission and evangelism. In 1960 the Interdenominational Foreign Mission Association (IFMA) organized a World Missions Conference, held at Moody Church in Chicago. Its closing statement echoed the rallying cry of the SVM's two generations earlier. The IFMA delegates called for "total mobilization...of men and of means [so] that the total evangelization of the world may be achieved in this generation." Six years later, meeting at Wheaton College in Wheaton, Illinois, IFMA and the Evangelical Foreign Missions Association (EFMA) jointly sponsored a world missions congress, at which claim was laid to the evangelical heritage of Edinburgh 1910. IFMA and EFMA together accounted for more than 13,000 cross-cultural missionaries; at the Wheaton congress they were represented by 938 delegates from 71 countries. The congress was hailed by Christianity Today as "the largest ecumenical strategy conference of Protestant missionaries ever held in North America."14 Five months later, with support from Billy Graham, that prestigious journal sponsored the Berlin Congress on Evangelism (1966); this gathering again claimed as the goal of world mission the SVM's watchword, "The evangelization of the world in this generation." The focus on evangelism continued at regional conferences in Africa, Asia, Latin America, and North America—preludes to the International Congress on World Evangelization, held in Lausanne, Switzerland, in 1974 and attended by 2,430 participants from 150 countries. Two legacies of Lausanne gave evangelicals a distinctive unity: the fifteen-point Lausanne Covenant provided a theological consensus, while the Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization gave permanent leadership. The latter has sponsored successor world conferences, of which Pattaya, Thailand (1980), and Lausanne II, Manila (1989), are the most significant.15

However, the evangelical stream is broad. It includes the World Consultation on Frontier Missions, held in Edinburgh (1980), sponsored by the Pasadena ad hoc committee chaired by Ralph Winter; the international congresses for itinerant evangelists, held in Amsterdam (1983 and 1986), sponsored by the Billy Graham Evangelistic Association; and the Global Consultation on World Evangelization by the Year 2000 and Beyond (GCOWE '95), held in Seoul (1995).

A third stream from Edinburgh has taken the form of focused study conferences on specific topics. Most world mission conferences since 1961 have been devoted more to educational and inspirational purposes than to thorough study and consultation on mission issues. The latter objective instead has become the goal of sponsored study conferences. For example, there was the 1977 consultation in Chiang Mai, Thailand, on dialogue. In 1979, at its meeting in Jamaica, the WCC Central Committee approved

World mission conferences since 1961 have been devoted more to education and inspiration than to study and consultation.

"Guidelines on Dialogue with People of Living Faiths and Ideologies," reproducing almost word for word the report of the 1977 study meeting. Chiang Mai, in turn, was but one in a series of conferences on that theme held by the WCC. Simultaneously the Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization (LCWE) sponsored its first post-Lausanne consultation, dealing with the homogeneous unit principle (Pasadena, California, 1977), which was followed by Gospel and Culture (Willowbank, Bermuda, 1978), Simple Lifestyle (High Leigh, England, 1980), and Evangelism and Social Responsibility (Grand Rapids, Michigan, 1982). These became models for numerous study consultations to follow, with eleven consultations and prayer conferences in ten countries in 1993 alone.16

148 INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN OF MISSIONARY RESEARCH
Impacts of Mission Conferences

What has been the impact of international Protestant mission conferences over the past 150 years? My initial research into the intentions of their planners, responses by participants, and later reflections by missiologists leads me to suggest the following eight impacts: uniting in prayer, broadening koinonia, networking for mission, training for ecumenical leadership, inspiring for world evangelization, transforming mission theology, deepening analysis of mission contexts, and envisioning new wineskins. Evidence of these impacts can be found across both confessional and generational lines. The examples given below are suggestive and not exhaustive.19

Uniting in Prayer

"I have great pleasure in meeting the members of the Evangelical Alliance in this place, for united prayer and supplication," the Rev. J. Leifchild declared to the 1858 meeting in London. For a hundred years the alliance issued a "call to prayer to Christians over the world," with the churches' world mission as a major concern.18

Participants at world mission conferences often strike the same chord. "The heart of Edinburgh was not its speeches but its periods of prayer," Hogg wrote. Sometimes innovative worship evoked deep prayerful responses. Participants at the WCC's San Antonio (1989) assembly one early morning walked symbolically "the way of the cross" from Gethsemane to Calvary. "The sound of hammering. This will be my abiding memory of San Antonio '89," wrote one participant, recalling how participants "wrote our sins of commission and omission and nailed them to the cross." At GCOWE '95, David Bryant led in a "Concert of Prayer," and the United Prayer Track encouraged prayer movements beginning at the Korean churches' prayer mountains to focus their prayer ministries "on accomplishing the task of establishing a Church for every people and making the Gospel available for every person by the year AD 2000."19

Broadening Koinonia

"Co-operation and Unity" was one of eight themes at Edinburgh (1910). Concerning the value of conferences in the mission field, the study commission concluded: "Missionary workers who have once been drawn together are not readily sundered, and the spirit of co-operation widens with experience." Although only Protestants participated at Edinburgh, Silas McBee, the Anglican vice-chairman, read to the conference the irenic letter of the Roman Catholic bishop of Cremona, who commended the conference's unifying element and noble aspirations and asked: "Are not these elements more than sufficient to constitute a world evangelization, transforming mission theology, deepening analysis of mission contexts, and envisioning new wineskins. Evidence of these impacts can be found across both confessional and generational lines. The examples given below are suggestive and not exhaustive."19

A Prayer

for the Conference on World Mission and Evangelism
Salvador, Brazil, November 24–December 3, 1996

Gracious God,
who from the day of Pentecost
has called to one hope all peoples everywhere
through the embodiment of the gospel in diverse cultures:
grant us, we pray, a vision of your love in Jesus Christ
that embraces within its transforming power
the rich plurality of the human race.

In your grace,
bless and guide the preparations
for the Conference on World Mission and Evangelism in
Salvador, Brazil,
that through it your people may be
strengthened in their cultural identity,
renewed in their Christian life,
and equipped for authentic witness in each context.

In the power of the Spirit,
lead them to discern and celebrate
the wondrous variety of expressions of the Christian faith
and the unity that binds them together.

Inspire in your church
a rich sharing across cultures
so that the heritages of all peoples may be offered to you,
Triune God,
who alone are worthy of glory and honour,
at all times and in all places,
through Jesus Christ. Amen.

World Council of Churches
San Antonio (1989), in contrast, understood conflict as part of the quest for unity. The ecumenical conference affirmed that the church, as Christ's living body, "demonstrates the power of God's love present in the struggles of the poor as they confront their powerful oppressors." "The hands of all people must join to weave a new world community," the conference Message declared, and Christians must join in "bearing witness to the gospel through renewed communities in mission." 27

Networking for Mission

At its inauguration in 1948, the WCC joined together the older churches of the North with the younger churches of the South. In his opening speech John R. Mott recalled the contribution of mission conferences to such networking: "Beginning at the World Missionary Conference at Edinburgh in 1910, at which time there were only two national or international missionary councils in the world, this vital agency [IMC] has helped establish some thirty or more national and international missionary bodies thus uniting increasingly the forces of leadership of the Older and Younger Churches." 23

In 1966 evangelicals left the World Congress on Evangelism (Berlin) with a new vision for evangelism on their respective continents. Regional gatherings were held to infuse other national leaders with enthusiasm for cooperative evangelistic efforts. Among the most important new programs were Evangelism in Depth in Latin America and New Life for All in Africa. Networking within countries and continents, begun after Berlin, accelerated as an outcome of increased vision and personal contacts made at Lausanne in 1974. 24

Training for Ecumenical Leadership

In 1891 Nathan Soderblom, a young Swedish Lutheran, attended the Northfield Student Conference in Massachusetts. After meeting for the first time students of many denominations, he wrote in his diary: "Lord, give me humility and wisdom to serve the great cause of the free unity of Thy Church." Out of that ecumenical seedbed the future leader of the Faith and Order movement would grow. Again and again ecumenical leaders have testified with Soderblom that world conferences inspired them with ecumenical ideals and tutored them in how to apply those ideals in cooperative endeavors for mission and evangelism. 25

In his opening address at Jerusalem (1928), John R. Mott shared the "organizing idea and very genius" of the assembly—that "two great streams of experience, insight, and sacrificial devotion" from the older churches of the North and the younger churches of the South "may be blended and united as never before." Jerusalem, as the "first globally representative assembly of non-Roman Christians," provided a unique training ground both for Christian unity and for mutuality in mission. 26

To Amsterdam (1986)—the Second International Congress for Itinerant Evangelists, sponsored by the Billy Graham Evangelistic Association—came 8,160 evangelists (chosen from more than 20,000 applicants) plus 2,000 other Christians. Together they represented some 173 countries and territories, with 78 percent coming from Two-Thirds World nations. "The primary purpose is . . . to encourage, to equip, and to motivate the evangelists of the world," declared John Corts, the congress's program director. The nine-day program, designed in response to feedback from Amsterdam (1983) participants, sought to be 70 percent encouragement, 20 percent specific training, and 10 percent motivation. Participants chose among five "how-to" seminars according to region and language, and among 141 workshops on specific kinds of evangelism. Each participated in a "day of witness" to try out new skills in street preaching, music, drama, and personal faith sharing. 27

Inspiring for World Evangelization

Much of the Student Volunteer Movement's early dynamic resulted from the clarion call of its watchword, "The evangelization of the world in this generation." Edinburgh (1910) was John R. Mott's opportunity to inspire not only students but their elders to endorse that lofty goal. The mood was "futurist rather than eschatological." "The evangelization of nations, the Christianizing of empires and kingdoms, is the object before us," Edinburgh declared. "The work has to be done now. It is urgent and must be pressed forward at once." 28

Berlin (1966) picked up the Edinburgh mantle with the same priority and urgency. "Our goal is nothing short of the evangelization of the human race in this generation, by every means God has given to the mind and will of men," the congress declared in its closing statement. 29

In 1974 "the evangelization of the world was Lausanne's chief concern," judged Harold Lindsell. In his opening presentation "Why Lausanne?" Billy Graham called for a return to nineteenth-century zeal for evangelism, and for leaders who are biblically oriented, believe strongly in conversion, and are convinced that the primary mission of the church is to declare the Good News of Jesus Christ. "Evangelism and the salvation of souls is the vital mission of the Church. . . . This is our calling. These are our orders," Graham declared. But the emphasis on world evangelization was not simply an academic one at Lausanne. One Sunday the 4,000 participants joined a crowd of 25,000-40,000 at a mass meeting where Graham preached and hundreds responded to the invitation to decide for Jesus Christ. In Lindsell's judgment, "It was an impressive illustration of mass evangelism and a moving demonstration of how the Spirit works when the Gospel is preached in all its simplicity and richness." 30

Transforming Mission Theology

Should theological debate be a major focus of world mission conferences? Edinburgh (1910) answered no. Anglo-Catholics, led by Bishop Charles Gore of the Church of England, agreed to participate only if no resolution would be allowed involving "questions of doctrine or Church polity with regard to which the Churches or Societies taking part in the Conference differ among themselves." Charles H. Brent of the Philippines was among those who experienced the "magnanimity" and "constructive temper" of the conference despite theological differences. Later he joined with others to launch the Faith and Order movement for the very study of issues of faith and polity. 31

Not all global mission conferences, however, followed Edinburgh by eschewing theological debate. By the 1960s any attempt to define either sin or salvation in strictly individualistic terms seemed anachronism to missiologists engaged in confronting the challenge of secularization. Choosing the theme "Salvation Today" for its Bangkok (1973) conference, the WCC highlighted the following question: "If the word salvation in the Bible means rescue or liberation, does it include secular, historical, corporate liberation, or must it be limited to individual liberation from inward bondage to sin, selfishness and bad habit?" The conference proceeded to define salvation in four dimensions: for economic justice against exploitation, for human
sensus mind and mood of the congress. While the theological orientation remained firmly evangelical, the focus broadened in the affirmation that “world evangelization requires the whole Church to take the whole gospel to the whole world” (par. 6), and that “evangelism and socio-political involvement are both part of our Christian duty” (par. 5). Rodger Bassham believes that the Lausanne Congress marks “the highpoint in the development of evangelical mission theology.”

Deepening Analysis of Mission Contexts

Edinburgh (1910), in its two-year preparatory study process, set the standard for deeper analysis of mission contexts through world mission conferences. It is Hogg’s judgment that “never before had the paramount problems of the world missionary enterprise been so thoroughly surveyed, studied, and evaluated.”

“The balance between the insistence on personal evangelism and the insistence on the redemption of the social order,” William Paton declared, was a major achievement at Jerusalem (1928). Concern for the latter was buttressed by trenchant analyses of key social problems. A study document entitled The Christian Mission in Relation to Industrial Problems in Asia and Africa sensitized delegates to the challenge of secularism on those continents. At Jerusalem (1928) a pioneer study by J. H. Oldham, the IMC secretary, entitled Christianity and the Race Problem, introduced issues of race relations for the first time into the world mission agenda.

Fifty-two years after Jerusalem, “good news to the poor” became at Melbourne (1980) a “commanding missiological principle for our missionary obedience today.” A succession of mission leaders from Africa, Asia, and Latin America reinforced that judgment by Emilio Castro, the CWME’s general secretary, in presentations to sections called Good News to the Poor and The Kingdom of God and Human Struggles.

Six weeks after Melbourne, evangelicals gathered in Thailand for Pattaya (1980), the Consultation on World Evangelization. This follow-up to Lausanne (1974) was designed to include seventeen miniconsultations. Each concentrated on Christian witness to a particular people and produced a report published subsequently as a Lausanne Occasional Paper.

Envisioning New Wineskins

New directions for mission have been proposed or highlighted at successive world mission conferences. Many Edinburgh (1910) participants judged “most memorable” a short (seven-minute) but powerful speech by Cheng Chingyi (Cheng Jingyi) of China. The youngest delegate present, and one of the few from Asia, Cheng welcomed cooperative efforts by the missions in evangelism and education but then spoke plainly: “We hope to see in the near future a united Christian Church without any denominational distinctions.” His call for three complementary unities—of nation, of family, and of church—was to become a priority for the Chinese church and a challenge to denominational Christianity in the decades to come.

One of Cheng’s concerns—the selfhood of the church—emerged again sixty-three years later at Bangkok (1973) in the moratorium debate. The issue arose from the need felt by church leaders, notably from Kenya and the Philippines, to discover new patterns for mission. In response, the Bangkok report supported a cessation of funds and/or personnel for a period and in some circumstances to allow “the receiving church to find its identity, set its own priorities, and discover within its own fellowship the resources to carry out its authentic mission.” The idea of a moratorium was to become a controversial new wineskin in the following years.

“The unevangelized world consists of large unreached populations,” Billy Graham declared at Lausanne (1974). Donald A. McGavran and Ralph Winter of Fuller Theological Seminary followed up with major addresses developing the unreached-peoples strategy for world evangelization. After Lausanne the people-group strategy received overwhelming acceptance.

Conclusion

Planners of every international mission conference face an inherent tension. Shall the primary purpose be to inspire and educate for mission? Or shall the purpose be to study thoroughly and reach a new consensus on vital questions of mission thought and action? The genius of Edinburgh (1910) planners was that they achieved both goals. One secret of success was their vision of the conference as the climax of an essential process of study, reflection, and action that began in 1908 and continued in 1912. The Edinburgh Continuation Committee, through follow-up conferences, stimulated the formation of missionary councils on national and regional bases, which became building blocks of the future ecumenical movement.

Few conferences before or after Edinburgh aspired to or achieved such lofty goals. Planners of both San Antonio and Lausanne II/Manila in 1989 gave priority to attracting participants from as many churches in mission around the world as possible. As a result, 80 percent of official San Antonio delegates were attending their first international mission conference. Building upon previous study and deliberation was judged impractical; education and inspiration became the unspoken goal. Reflecting on a century of mission conferences in preparation for Salvador (1996), Franciscan Sister Mary Motte hoped that “out of the dying and rising experienced in such a diverse and committed gathering, new hope will be born, new spaces of mission will be discovered and new challenges to unity among the disciples chosen to communicate the good news, will emerge.”

A second inherent tension is between the local and the global. “It is not easy to stand firm in face of this tension between the growing fellowship among Christians and the task of each
individual church," Lukas Vischer wrote in 1963. In his judgment, reports of international conferences again and again were "lacking in penetrating insight and lucid formation." "So many contradictions and difficulties remain," Vischer continued, "that no real testimony is achieved." The mandate and task "of confessing and bearing witness to the truth of Christ in the absolute-ness of its claim" continues to lie with the individual churches. Christ’s promise of the gift of the Holy Spirit is theirs.44

Is a new model of international mission conferences possible in the twenty-first century? Will it address needs both for inspiration and collective action?

Notes


9. These include with abbreviations and dates of their founding the Young Men’s Christian Association (YMCA, 1844), the Young Women’s Christian Association (YWCA, 1854), national student Christian movements (SCMs, 1880s and 1890s), the Student Volunteer Movement (SVM, 1889), and the World’s Student Christian Federation (WSCF, 1895). For concise surveys, see Hogg, EF, pp. 81–96, and Rouse, “Voluntary Movements,” in HEM, pp. 324–29.

10. Quoted in Hogg, EF, p. 81.


16. Reports of the early LCWE consultations are published as Lausanne Occasional Papers. See Stott, “Twenty Years.”

17. It is hoped that this typology may stimulate reflections concerning the impact of mission conferences at national and regional levels, and in other confessional traditions (Roman Catholic, Orthodox, etc.)—areas beyond the scope of this study.


Resources for Mission Education

MISSIOLOGICAL EDUCATION FOR THE 21ST CENTURY
The Book, the Circle, and the Sandals
J. DUDLEY WOODBERRY, CHARLES VAN HENGEN
and EDGAR ELLISTON, Editors

Thoughtful and original contributions from 21 missiologists in a volume dedicated to Paul E. Pierson outline an agenda for mission education that will provide lively discussion for years to come. 335 pages $15.00 paper

THE AGITATED MIND OF GOD
The Theology of Kosuke Koyama
DALE T. IRVIN and AKINTUNDE E. AKINADE, Editors

Theologians from around the world and from diverse traditions explore the work of Kosuke Koyama, one of the key architects of the ecumenical endeavors to contextualize the Christian gospel, particularly in Asia. 250 pages $25.00 hardcover

ANTHROPOLOGY FOR CHRISTIAN WITNESS
CHARLES H. KRAFT

This thorough, basic introduction to the study of anthropology for those who plan careers in mission or cross-cultural ministry represents the synthesis of a lifetime of teaching and study by the author of the classic Christianity and Culture. 600 pages $25.00 paper

MISSION IN BOLD HUMILITY
David Bosch's Work Considered
WILLEM SAAYMAN and KLIPPIES KRITZINGER, Editors

Scholars assess the work of the late South African missiologist David Bosch: as a missiologist, as one who labored courageously on behalf of peace and justice in his native South Africa, and as the author of the magnum opus Transforming Mission. 250 pages $20.00 paper

PIETY AND POWER
Muslims and Christians in West Africa
LAMIN SANNEH

Sanneh provides a unique perspective on historical patterns of religious interaction in West Africa and their meaning for world Christianity and Islam today, especially in an area where the confrontation between the two is particularly intense. 140 pages $20.00 paper

RELIGION IN THE MEGACITY
Catholic and Protestant Portraits from Latin America
PHILLIP BERRYMAN

Focusing on two representative "mega-cities," São Paulo, Brazil, and Caracas, Venezuela, Berryman introduces the people and forces that are shaping the latest "religious revolution" in Latin America. 200 pages $18.00 paper

PASTORAL THEOLOGY FROM A GLOBAL PERSPECTIVE
A Case Method Approach
H. S. WILSON, TAKATSO MOFOKENG, JUDU POERWOWIDAGDO, ALICE EVANS
and ROBERT EVANS

Brings applicable resources in five central areas to Christian leaders around the world struggling with problems of pastoral care. 224 pages $17.00 paper

LIBERATION AND ORTHODOXY
The Promise and Failures of Interconfessional Dialogue
YACOB TESFAI

"Makes skillful analysis of the bi-lateral and multi-lateral ecumenical dialogues of the past 50 years, arguing cogently for heightened inter-change and discussion between liberational and doctrinal orthodoxy."
— REV. CANON PETER B. PRICE

196 pages $20.00 paper

ORBIS BOOKS
Depr. FA 6, Box 302
Maryknoll, NY 10545-0302

At bookstores or direct
MC/VISA 1-800-258-5838

23. "From Edinburgh to Amsterdam," Yale Divinity School Archives, Mott Papers, Box 137/2205.

24. Bassham, Mission Theology, pp. 256–90, contains a summary of this regional networking.


35. Hogg, EF, p. 117.


Response to Norman Thomas

Charles W. Forman

We must thank Norman Thomas for a perceptive and helpful study of a difficult, yet important, subject. The importance is indicated by the fact that world mission conferences continue to be held at frequent intervals, consuming large amounts of time and money that could otherwise be put directly into mission work. There is need to consider carefully whether these resources would be better spent in the work rather than in conferences about the work. The importance of the question increases as the number of conferences increases. Ans van der Bent has published a book giving the basic facts about six hundred ecumenical consultations held between 1948 and 1982, and of course more have been held since 1982. Not all of these were missionary conferences, but all were related to missions in one way or another.

The great size of the problem indicates the difficulty of dealing with it. How can any coherent judgment be made on so large a phenomenon? Even if our purview is limited strictly to the world missionary conferences, the problem is still an enormous one. There have always been people who doubt the value of these large meetings, saying they are just extravaganzas, and without a careful study it is difficult to gainsay them.

What Norman Thomas has done is to provide that study, looking at the whole range of world mission conferences. His essay lists eight major positive effects flowing from the conferences. These eight seem to divide into two equal groups. On the one hand are the effects that operate primarily within the conferences themselves, making an impact on the people in attendance. On the other hand are the effects that flow from the conferences and make their impact more widely on missions in general. I would classify the impacts related to prayer, koinonia, inspiration, and theology as being primarily internal in their operation, and the other four as being primarily external. The division is not a sharp one, for all effects can be seen to operate partly within and partly beyond the conferences. At first glance, the impact Thomas labels "uniting in prayer" would seem to be concerned only with the people in attendance. But then we remember that it was apparently during a prayer session at Edinburgh in 1910 that Bishop Charles Brent of the Philippines was inspired to start the Faith and Order movement, which reached far beyond the people in attendance.

The second impact in Thomas's list, "broadening koinonia," might better be entitled "intensifying koinonia." It is true that at a world mission conference relationships that might have been only professional become personal, and koinonia is greatly strengthened. But much of the broadening of the koinonia had already taken place before the conference began; in fact, this is what enabled the conference to be held. So, for example, the Anglicans were brought into Edinburgh 1910 on a fateful night in 1908 when J. H. Oldham engaged in an intense, nightlong discussion with the crucial High-Church Anglican bishop and convinced him that Anglican presence would be appropriate. Thus the broadening took place before the conference rather than stemming from the conference. Similarly Roman Catholic presence in ecumenical mission conferences increased to significant proportions after Vatican II, with its informal links with Protestant leaders. The fellowship between Catholics and Protestants that took place in and around Vatican II opened the way. Likewise the Wheaton and Berlin conferences of 1966 were held after the commonalities of evangelicals had been recognized, even though they had not yet been made evident in assembly. In each case the conference intensified and strengthened the broader koinonia that had already come into being.

Another impact that has affected primarily the people participating in the conferences is the one entitled "inspiring for world evangelization." Indirectly, this impact spreads through those present to those absent, but it is first and foremost something that touches the people who are on hand. This inspirational and emotional element has been present in all missions conferences, inspiring the participants for evangelization. But it may be worth pointing out that the inspirational and emotional element has come more to the fore in recent years. Especially since the 1960s, conferences have had less the character of deliberative assemblies and more the character of mass celebrations. I was present at the 1968 Uppsala Assembly of the World Council, which was in part a missions conference, and the change in character was marked at that time and was a point of considerable contention. Since then the celebratory and inspirational mode has become even more prevalent. This may well be a reflection of the change in Western culture, the loss of confidence in reason, the end of the modern age of dominant rationalism launched by Descartes three centuries ago, and the consequent rise of postmodernism and deconstruction. Leaders of our culture more and more seem to recognize the old truth that human reason is always tainted by self-interest when dealing with human affairs and therefore cannot be fully trusted. So there are some valid Christian as well as cultural reasons for welcoming a greater emphasis on inspiration and celebration, though we may well regret the decline in deliberation and thorough study. Thomas mentions the splendid multivolume reports that issued from Edinburgh 1910 and Madras 1938; we regret that such thorough reports are less common in our postmodern age.

The impact entitled "transforming mission theology" is something that may appear both within and without the conferences, but I would like to call attention to its power within them. People from one tradition or region meeting people from another tradition or region have found themselves challenged in ways that transformed their theology. The most important example of this is the way in which delegates from the Third World pressed for change in the outlook of delegates from the dominant Western world. At Lausanne and at Manila, at Melbourne and at San Antonio, the largest number of delegates calling for a radical concern for the poor and a vigorous involvement of missions in...
ies have provided a continuing focus for worldwide fellowship and counsel among missions. Therefore I think we must say that these two conferences have had a greater effect on missions than had been proposed before the conference began, but the proposal Westerners sometimes changed enough to accept positions that faced their home constituencies, who had not shared in this transforming experience. The transformation brought about by interregional contacts is one of the most important impacts of the conferences.

The most important impact comes, I believe, at another point. It is connected with the one Thomas entitles “networking for mission.” Here we pass from the impacts within the conferences to those on the mission at large. Thomas speaks explicitly of the encouragement given for networking in countries and continents, but I think we must go beyond what he mentions and speak of the action taken for establishing ongoing worldwide networks of organized mission fellowship and consultation, continuing the collaboration begun at the conference. There were just two conferences that did this major work—Edinburgh 1910, which set up the Continuation Committee that led to the International Missionary Council, and Lausanne 1974, which set up the Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization. Both these bod-

The call of Madras 1938 for educating indigenous leadership was perhaps the most effective proposal of any mission conference.

ies have provided a continuing focus for worldwide fellowship and counsel among missions. Therefore I think we must say that these two conferences have had a greater effect on missions than have any others. In each case the idea of a continuing structure had been proposed before the conference began, but the proposal also seemed to arise as a fresh groundswell from the delegates while they were assembled.

These two conferences also made the greatest contribution to another kind of impact in Thomas’s list, the one called “deepening analysis of mission contexts.” Thomas mentions the analysis carried out in the preparations for Edinburgh, but it was perhaps even more in the follow-up of the conference that the analysis took place. As part of the follow-up, national missionary councils were organized throughout the mission fields. They proceeded to analyze the mission coverage in each nation and arrange for a more complete and rationalized distribution of mission work. The World Dominion Surveys of the 1930s were an outgrowth of this process, with some twenty volumes published on various countries and areas. Similarly the Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization created its Strategy Working Group, which investigated the unreached peoples of the world, looking again for a better distribution of mission work. It held conferences on the unreached peoples and, from 1979 to 1987, produced a series of studies and listings of such peoples. These studies not only advanced the analysis of the context of missions but had, and still have, an impact on the operation of missions.

The unreached-peoples emphasis was not just an example of analyses arising from conferences; it was even more, as Thomas reports, an example of another type of impact, that which he labels “envisioning new wineskins,” that is, proposing or highlighting new directions in mission that were subsequently widely adopted.

When it comes to new wineskins, I would like to mention what I believe was the most widely adopted and influential new program proposal to emerge from any world mission conference. That was the call sent forth from the Madras conference in 1938 for a major concentration by missions on the education of the indigenous ministry, which it identified as the gravest need of missions at that time. As a result, the International Missionary Council went to work on the problem. A book on ministerial education in India and a series of detailed team-surveys of ministerial training in each part of Africa were produced. A large fund was raised and administered by an international committee to improve ministerial training in all the developing nations. These efforts attracted further funds and efforts from missions and indigenous churches, so that the whole level and quality of seminary work was raised impressively. I can think of no conference proposal for mission work that has been equally effective.

It must be acknowledged that we have been considering the points where conferences have proved effective. There have also been points of ineffectiveness, as is always the case in human affairs. I think the proposal for a moratorium in missions, which was recommended at the CWME Bangkok Conference in 1972–73 and by the East African group at Lausanne 1974 as well as at the All-African Conference of Churches meeting in 1974, is an example of a proposal that proved largely ineffective. Another example is the series of consultations labeled “Missionary Structure of the Congregation” held by the World Council in the 1960s, which created a great stir at the time but had an effect on no more than a handful of congregations. Yet even after allowance is made for some fruitless conference efforts, we must recognize that the raising of new ideas and subjecting them to wide discussion, even if they are eventually rejected, is an important part of the developing life of missions.

Looking over the scene as a whole, certainly Norman Thomas has shown us enough of the effectiveness of world missionary conferences to justify abundantly the continued holding of such meetings, and therein he has performed a valuable service.

Notes

Latin America’s Fifth Wave of Protestant Churches

Clayton L. Berg, Jr., and Paul E. Pretiz

Visiting a church convention, we found that the Christian mariachi band, silver buckles sparkling on black uniforms, was the high point of the afternoon. Downstairs, huge sides of beef hung from the ceiling. On the fire were enormous pots of mole, the traditional hot sauce. The rhythms, the smells from the kitchen, the preaching style, and the happy confusion made the gathering unmistakably Mexican.

The churches represented here had developed entirely out of Mexican soil, without any involvement of expatriate missionaries. Not only in Mexico but throughout Latin America today, in tents, storefronts, former cinemas, factories, and homes, as well as church buildings, autochthonous congregations are bursting into life by spontaneous combustion. People are coming to know Christ and are sharing the Good News through the ministries of churches entirely independent of traditional mission influence.

In The Gospel People of Latin America we identified five waves of Protestant advance, the fifth being the rise of autochthonous, or grassroots, churches. While much missiological literature covers the African Independent Churches, little has been written describing the corresponding phenomenon in the Americas.

By “autochthonous” we mean churches that (1) have developed spontaneously, without a history of missionary involvement; or (2) were planted by missionary efforts of other Latin American autochthonous churches; or (3) were formerly mission related but have broken foreign links and reflect the people’s culture in the deepest sense.

The two criteria are autonomy and contextualization. To determine whether churches in the category of “formerly mission related” should be considered autochthonous is admittedly difficult because it involves an attempt to measure the degree of contextualization. Many so-called indigenized churches follow the patterns of the parent mission society. But other groups, though formerly mission related, have become truly contextualized and can be considered autochthonous. A case in point is the Methodist Pentecostal Church in Chile. Autonomous since 1909, despite its early Methodist background it is universally recognized as autochthonous because of its contextualization into Chilean life and culture.

With their rate of growth, autochthonous churches may now represent over half of Latin America’s Protestants.

Estimating Number of Autochthonous Churches

In the *World Christian Encyclopedia* researcher David Barrett identifies “nonwhite indigenous” churches as a separate stream of the world Christian community. Though hardly a proper label for some middle-class Latin American autochthonous churches with some very European-looking people, the churches he identifies as “nonwhite indigenous” in Latin America are the autochthonous churches being addressed in this article.

Most of these churches are considered evangélico (or Protestant) in Latin America. On the basis of Barrett’s numbers, autochthonous churches in 1980 constituted 40.6 percent of all Protestants in Latin America. The proportions ranged from a meager 2.7 percent in Honduras to 88.9 percent in Chile. Given their rate of growth, they may now represent over half of Latin America’s Protestants. The accompanying table, based on more recent surveys, summarizes our own estimates of the number of churches and church members of such autochthonous groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Autochthonous Churches and Their Members as a Proportion of All Protestant Churches in Latin America</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of Churches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medellin, Cali, Cartagena, and Barranquilla, Colombia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lima, Peru</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rio de Janeiro, Brazil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>São Paulo, Brazil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caracas, Venezuela</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buenos Aires, Argentina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guatemala (as a whole)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Origins and Variations

We have spoken of this movement as a “fifth wave” because so many of the churches are of recent origin. However, some have a long history. Perhaps the first autochthonous “churches” in Latin America were the non-Roman Catholic religious societies that Mexican President Benito Juárez promoted in the 1860s. Jean Pierre Bastian describes how the historic Protestant denominations in Mexico in many cases built upon the foundation of these autochthonous groups.

Early in this century a ripple effect from the 1906 Azusa Street Pentecostal revival in southern California gave birth to several movements in Mexico, Puerto Rico, Chile, and Brazil. More recently there have been breakaway groups from historic Protestant churches, notably the charismatic counterparts to each of the major Protestant denominations in Brazil. Former Roman Catholic charismatic groups that have joined the evangelical stream are also among Latin America’s autochthonous churches. And many have arisen spontaneously, such as the Apure movement, founded by Aristides Díaz, a Venezuelan cattle dealer who experienced a conversion after purchasing a Bible from a colporteur.

As Ed Rene Kivitz, a Baptist pastor in São Paulo, has ob-

Clayton L. (Mike) Berg, Jr., and Paul E. Pretiz are veteran missionaries with the Latin America Mission. Both have served in a variety of ministries and responsibilities since the 1950s, including Berg as LAM’s president and Pretiz as vice president. Their most recent joint work was Spontaneous Combustion: Grass Roots Christianity, Latin American Style (Pasadena, Calif.: William Carey Library, 1996).

October 1996
served, older movements tend to be sectarian, isolating themselves from other Protestants. They may sacralize their worship patterns or even their hymnals, not admitting any innovation. Rigid rules may result in legalistic behavior. The Congregação Cristã of Brazil is an example. Newer movements may feature contemporary music (sometimes including Christian rock), make heavy use of mass media, and be more permissive in what is expected of their followers’ behavior. Groups such as the Brazilian Renacer em Cristo are attracting many young people. They often have loose ties to similar groups elsewhere, sometimes adopting current trends such as “health and prosperity” concepts. The Ondas de Amor y Paz (Waves of love and peace) movement in Argentina is another example.

There are other variants—for example, the Apostolic Church of Faith in Christ Jesus (Mexico), which follows the Pentecostal oneness stream regarding the Trinity; the Israelites of the New Covenant (Peru), which observes Old Testament feasts and sacrifices; and the Mitsas (Puerto Rico), whose founder claimed to be the incarnation of the Holy Spirit. Because of the pervasive influence of spiritism, many movements in Brazil (e.g., the God Is Love Church) emphasize exorcism. Critics feel that this focus, by overshadowing other aspects of Christian faith, weakens Christian moral responsibility. Everything evil is blamed on demons, and every solution is found in exorcism.

The highly centralized authority of some groups permits them to concentrate their financial power to build up TV and radio stations to proclaim their message, and to purchase cinemas where their congregations can meet. The Igreja Universal del Reino de Deus (Universal church of the kingdom of God), in Brazil, is a prime example.

Despite the aberrations of some groups, most Latin American autochthonous movements form a part of the evangélico stream and relate well to other Protestant denominations. The largest autochthonous single congregation in Latin America may be the Brazil for Christ Church in São Paulo, with a hangerlike building seating more than 20,000 people. The founder, Manoel de Mello, broke with Pentecostal tradition by relating to the World Council of Churches, promoting favored political candidates, and displaying a social concern atypical of Pentecostals of his time. His son, pastor Paulo Lutero de Mello, is less involved ecumenically and politically, but he continues to mix a strong social concern with his evangelistic ministry.

Breaking the Stereotypes

Latin American Protestants traditionally have been accused of subverting Latin America’s unity by introducing religious forms that run counter to Latin culture. Traditional Protestants may well stand accused of such foreignness. But the autochthonous churches—with their rhythms, charismatic leaders, passion, personal sacrifice, and openness to the miraculous—are not only highly contextualized but, according to some, may be more attuned to the region’s culture than traditional Roman Catholicism.

Another charge is that Latin Pentecostalism (most autochthonous groups are Pentecostal) serves merely as an escape from the harsh realities of life faced by Latin America’s poor. Christian LaLive’s Haven of the Masses perceived these Christians as being on “social strike,” refusing to participate in community or political efforts that might improve their lot and the lot of their neighbors. But the title of a recent book by a group of Dutch anthropologists signals a change in the perspectives of some observers. Describing current Latin American Pentecostalism, they call it algo más que opio (“something more than an opiate”). In addition to the improvement in individuals’ lives, the Gospel as preached in these churches is becoming a force that is beginning to affect society.

Not only are social scientists turning around in their judgments. Latin America’s evangelicals themselves, especially those in autochthonous churches, are changing as they abandon the “politics is sinful” posture. Although their political forays are sometimes naive, as their numbers grow and as Latin American countries are generally recovering democratic systems of government, evangélicos are increasingly forming their own evangelical parties and supporting candidates that represent their views.

### A Protestant “Popular Religion”

In recent years Catholic folk religion—religiosidad popular (“popular religiosity,” as it is known in Latin America)—has received much attention and analysis. Far from lofty philosophical and theological heights of official Catholicism, and equally far from the politically radical views of liberation theology, the down-to-earth practice of Latin America’s masses revolves around tangible practices and objects such as pilgrimages to shrines, religious fiestas, water from sacred springs, and objects with curative powers. Some look with disdain upon this popular religion. Others countenance religiosidad popular and hold in prospect the possibility of building upon it to lift the masses to a higher and more spiritual faith.

It has not escaped the attention of many that Latin America’s autochthonous Pentecostalism, with its emphasis on cures and material blessings, may be a Protestant equivalent of Catholic popular religiosity. Observers share the same contrasting perspectives—disdain or appreciation. Some see only the crude manifestations of Protestant “popular religiosity”; others, thanking God that the masses are being reached, anticipate a growing maturity in these movements.

The charges that Protestant autochthonous movements are susceptible to syncretistic influences is countered by some autochthonous leaders who draw attention to syncretistic “Romish” influences in the historic Protestant churches. Such leaders also point out that historic churches in Latin America pay little attention to the demonic and may easily overlook the persistent superstitious or even occult practices of their members. Autochthonous groups, in contrast, recognize the existence of the spirit world and demand that new converts renounce all non-Christian practices.

### A Missiological Challenge

Churches arising through “spontaneous combustion” pose questions regarding our missiological task. Since an average of five new evangelical churches are founded each week in Rio de Janeiro, it can be inferred that the growth of these churches is not a random phenomenon but rather a response to a need in the community. Missiologists must address this growth and its implications for the church’s mission in Latin America.
Janeiro, for example, many of them by groups unrelated to expatriate mission, is there a need for missionaries from the outside? In such cities missions obviously must realign their priorities. Among other things, they can focus on planting churches that can be models of worship and outreach for social and ethnic groups that autochthonous churches may not yet be reaching.

The best of the autochthonous movements are models for mission-related movements, and we can profit by studying their patterns of growth and their forms of contextualization. Such studies should not be limited to superficial observations of their musical styles and worship forms. The real issue is whether mission-related churches can understand and adopt the best of a pre-Enlightenment worldview that is common to the masses in Latin America. This is a view that is open to the miraculous, to God’s intervention in daily experience, to biblical confrontation with the demonic, and to a focus in worship that emphasizes reveling in God’s presence rather than passive participation in a cerebrally oriented service.

At the same time, traditional churches and missions can share their theological experience with autochthonous leaders. The lay pastor of the small autochthonous storefront church may be too busy because of his secular employment, or too embarrassed because of his lack of preparation, to enroll in a formal program of theological education. The leader of a large movement may feel too self-sufficient to bother. But sharing of literature and tapes, developing personal friendships, conducting short workshops and courses, as well as offering more traditional academic programs at the appropriate time and place, are ways to overcome such barriers. The Pentecostal Bible Institute of Santiago, Chile, is directed by a missionary sensitive to the situation of autochthonous church leaders, and the institute meets an evident need. The Mennonites’ experience working with African Independent Churches demonstrates that the missionary task should be more than just “planting more churches of our own kind.” Missions and missionary preparation should develop a concern to relate to other parts of the body of Christ, especially the autochthonous movements, without creating dependency and without de-indigenizing them.

The cutting edge of the church is often at the social and religious periphery, notably so in these autochthonous movements. But as many believers move upward socially and educationally, their spiritual needs often require the depth that more traditional churches offer. In one country pastors affirmed that much of the growth in the traditional churches was due to people whose initial contact with the Gospel was in autochthonous churches, and who came to the traditional churches looking for other spiritual values. To prepare the pastors of autochthonous churches for the changing needs of their members is a task that could conceivably be assumed by the older churches—but in humility, since not many traditional churches have learned to cope with the pressures of modern society and secularism.

Autochthonous movements by nature are expansionist. Brazilian groups are sending missionaries to Africa. Those in Spanish-speaking countries are opening churches in North America.
From the Evangelical Alliance to the World Evangelical Fellowship: 150 Years of Unity with a Mission

W. Harold Fuller

One of the least publicized stories of Christian unity and mission celebrates its 150th anniversary this year. The Evangelical Alliance (EA), which began in 1846, today embraces some 150 million Christians globally through its outgrowth in the World Evangelical Fellowship (WEF). As John Stott has stated, “The story of the World Evangelical Fellowship, with its roots in the Evangelical Alliance (which is more than one hundred years older than the World Council of Churches), deserves to be better known.” Billy Graham adds, “WEF has been a major force in uniting evangelicals throughout the world.” The evangelical movement, highlighted by the 150th-anniversary celebrations of Britain’s Evangelical Alliance in November 1996, makes a fascinating study in missiology. Its growth has been fueled by its core characteristic—the evangel, the preaching of the Gospel worldwide. WEF itself is, in a sense, the bottom line of mission: churches planted as a result of mission, forming a fellowship to help each other disciple the nations.

The world of 1846 was a restive one socially and ecclesiastically. Karl Marx and Friedrich Engels were publicly debating their ideology, preparing to publish the Communist Manifesto (1848). Charles Darwin was developing his theory of evolution, to be published in the next decade. In church circles, the Scottish Disruption and John Newman’s conversion from Anglicanism to Roman Catholicism reflected the sectarian unrest of the era. Against that background a contrasting force was at work—a growing desire on the part of Protestant evangelicals to demonstrate spiritual unity. The Second Great Awakening (the spiritual revival of 1791–1842) fed that desire. In Switzerland in the 1830s, the church historian Merle D’Aubigne proposed a “fraternal confederation.” In 1843 a meeting in Scotland commemorating the 200th anniversary of the Westminster Assembly issued a plea for closer unity. The same year, Presbyterian William Patton of New York wrote to British Congregationalist John Angell James, recommending an interchurch conference to outline the truths on which churches agreed. A series of discussions and prayer gatherings led to a General Conference held in London August 19 to September 2, 1846. Eight hundred leaders from fifty-two “bodies of Christians” in eight nations decided to form a confederation under the name “The Evangelical Alliance.” The delegates agreed upon a doctrinal statement of basic evangelical views. They pointed out that they were not forming “a new ecclesiastical organization” but expressing the spiritual unity that already existed “among all who, loving the Lord Jesus Christ, are bound to love one another.”

The remarkable fact is that the Statement of Faith drafted in 1846 has weathered the theological debates of the intervening decades and continues as the basis for the doctrinal statement of WEF, the global organization that grew out of the EA. For a century, in the absence of any formal international structure, this statement and an annual Week of Prayer were the main visible connection between national committees of the EA. Not surprisingly, Britain’s EA was the major player, with its international connections in the Commonwealth.

In the United States, the slavery issue slowed the formation of a national alliance. Although church leaders succeeded in forming an evangelical alliance following the Civil War, it faltered early in the twentieth century. Eventually, in the United States the Federal Council of Churches was formed; while it represented mainline Protestants, it did not win over and embrace conservative evangelicals.

Unfortunately, the fundamentalist controversies of the 1920s (stereotyped by the media in the Scopes “monkey trial” in Dayton, Tennessee) labeled theological conservatives as reactionary and anti-intellectual. Responding to the need for a positive, pro-active expression of unity, the National Association of Evangelicals was formed in 1942. Its leaders soon began to receive strong signs of interest from other countries. Discussions between leaders in North America, Europe, and Asia revealed that national bodies of evangelicals wanted to connect with each other worldwide but did not feel theologically comfortable in the orbit of the World Council of Churches (WCC), formed in 1948. In 1951 at Woudschoten, Netherlands, 91 men and women from 21 countries met as the International Convention of Evangelicals. They voted to establish the World Evangelical Fellowship. Two Anglican theologians, A. Jack Dain and John R. W. Stott, provided a biblical outline of the threefold purpose of WEF:

1. The furtherance of the Gospel (Phil. 1:12).
2. The defense and confirmation of the Gospel (Phil. 1:7).
3. Fellowship in the Gospel (Phil. 1:5).

Evangelicals have since looked upon WEF as the organizational fulfillment, on an international basis, of the original vision of 1846—a global umbrella for national alliances. As church historian Mark Ellingsen notes, “No history of the Evangelical Movement can ignore the founding of an international organization in 1846, the Evangelical Alliance (the predecessor body of the present-day World Evangelical Fellowship).”

Today WEF, headquartered in Singapore, embraces 150 million evangelicals in 112 national and regional fellowships representing an estimated 600,000 churches. A Filipino lawyer/clergyman, Agustin Jun Vencer, is international director, responsible to an International Council elected by member bodies.

Why Is WEF Not Better Known?

One reason that WEF is not better known is that it does not attempt to make corporate decisions for its members, so it does.
not capture headlines. Instead, it is a rather loosely knit “commonwealth” of national evangelical fellowships without any central power base. For most of its history it has not even had a permanent international office. Remarkably, this somewhat amorphous movement—understaffed, minimally funded, and scattered throughout the world—has not only survived but also grown in strength. The main reason for WEF’s lack of visibility is that it has deliberately adopted a low profile in order to be more effective in its main goal, which is to strengthen its member bodies. Therefore the public is much more likely to be aware of the national fellowships than of the worldwide body.

Why Was the WEF Needed?

From the first, the concept of an evangelical alliance was that “as soon as a sinner accepts Christ as Saviour, he becomes one with all members of the Body of Christ throughout the earth.”12 In 1846 the founders of the EA placed this principle in the context of its Statement of Faith. Succeeding generations of members have confirmed the Statement of Faith as expressing the basic, scriptural essentials of the Christian faith.13

When the WCC was formed in 1948, it helped to fulfill the strong desire of the major denominations for a visible, institutional unity. Many evangelicals were involved in the churches that became WCC members. However, as a council of churches, the WCC did not meet the EA’s concept of a global fellowship of believers based upon spiritual unity rather than church structure. Many evangelicals felt more at home theologically in WEF, formed in 1951 as the EA’s global organizational structure. To them it represented a biblical ecumenism, transcending partisan and sectarian boundaries.14

From the start of the EA, the emphasis was on positive unity and not on controversy. In 1951 the EA national organizations that formed WEF specified that WEF was not to be “in opposition to any other international or interdenominational organization. It seeks to work and witness in a constructive manner, ever maintaining the truth in love.”15 Whereas some evangelicals have at times been reactionary and defensive, African theologian Tokunboh Adeyemo, chairman of the WEF International Council, positions WEF positively. “We do not define ourselves by what we are against as much as what we are for,” he says. “That includes the inspiration of the scriptures, the deity of Jesus Christ, salvation by faith alone in the finished work of redemption provided by Jesus Christ, and the unity of the Spirit among all who confess Jesus Christ as their personal Savior.”16

Because of its positive, well-defined position, WEF is now recognized by WCC and other global councils as representing a distinct worldwide constituency. For instance, WEF participates in the annual Conference of Secretaries of World Christian Communities, for purposes of communication. WEF also maintains close ties with other evangelical global organizations. The Lausanne Committee for World Evangelism (LCWE, or “Lausanne”) and WEF at times have formed joint task forces and copublished reports. The two movements are currently examining a closer relationship, while recognizing their distinctives: WEF derives its authority from ongoing evangelical fellowships, while Lausanne functions through ad hoc committees.17 Another global evangelistic conglomerate, AD2000, often works through WEF leaders and personnel in national projects.

What Has WEF Done?

The EA grew out of a strong desire for unity, but there was always the danger that members might “only come together to proclaim ‘We are one,’” without doing real work.18 In its first century the EA was active in defending religious liberty and human rights, but its national bodies were less active in the mid-twentieth century. Today, however, WEF has developed programs to help national fellowships become pro-active within their societies, through the work of WEF commissions and departments: Church and Society, Missions, Prayer and Renewal, Religious Liberty, Theology, Women, and Youth. The impact of this effort may be seen in several results.

Unity. WEF has helped evangelicals to express visibly their spiritual unity. Because of their emphasis on personal salvation, evangelicals tend to be overly individualistic. WEF has increased the recognition of its members that the body of Christ is indeed global. For Westerners this has produced a healthy antidote to their culturally bred individualism. For non-Westerners it has had a strengthening influence, as they realize they do not stand alone.

Enriching the church. WEF provides a global forum that enables members to benefit from the exchange of information, views, concerns, and skills. This has encouraged a greater sense of accountability and responsibility for one another.

Presence. In many lands, nonevangelical Christianity and non-Christian faiths have the advantage of a power base, leading to the marginalization and isolation of Christians, especially evangelicals. The visibility of WEF gives local evangelicals a presence that helps secure a hearing in the public forum.

Social action. The natural reaction of a minority group, such as evangelicals find themselves to be in many lands, is to retreat into defensive isolation. WEF encourages them to find creditable ways to address their community’s needs, such as relief and development, reconciliation, and special problems such as may be found, for instance, among women and youth.

Religious liberty. WEF helps to bring international public opinion to bear on regimes that violate human rights, particularly religious liberty. As well, the size of its global constituency can cause a government to respect local minorities, whether Christian or of other faiths.

Mission. Since active witnessing is one of the distinctives of evangelicals, WEF helps to motivate, mobilize, and equip member bodies to share the Gospel throughout their nations, and to reach across political and cultural boundaries. WEF’s global span has helped to change missions from “the West to the Rest” into a reciprocal activity involving the church in every country. The vibrant witness of missions arising in the Two-Thirds World has helped to revitalize the sometimes weary Western agencies.

Theology. The study and application of theology has found new inspiration as non-Western scholars have applied the Scriptures in their own contexts. WEF’s Theological Commission has encouraged evangelical scholarship to enunciate unchanging biblical doctrines in a world marked by relativism and theological compromise.
What Is the Future of Evangelicalism?

WEF does not pretend to represent all evangelicals. But it does maintain the essentials of the evangelical faith, and it shares the evangelical vision of being "salt and light" in our world. Evangelicals face the same temptations as other men and women; they will be taken seriously only as they keep to the scriptural precept of "speaking the truth in love."

Perhaps just as remarkable as their long history is the phenomenon of evangelicals being on the growing edge in many areas of the world. British theologian Alister McGrath goes so far as to state that evangelicalism "provides global Christianity with a firm theological foundation and motivation for evangelism. It is no exaggeration to suggest that the future of Christianity will depend on this continuing motivation."19 Wolfhart Pannenberg predicts that the next century will have room for only three major Christian groups: Roman Catholicism, Eastern Orthodoxy, and evangelicalism.20 "These are bold claims made by others," says WEF's Veneer. "If they are right, we must assume increasing responsibility to reach the world for Jesus Christ. We are committed to enable the church to do this in every country."21

Notes

14. Dutch church historian J. C. Hoekendijk states that "the contribution made by the Evangelical Alliance to the ecumenical movement has not been sufficiently appreciated" (quoted in Christien Breman, The Association of Evangelicals in Africa [AEA] [Zoetermeer, Netherlands: Boekencentrum, 1996], p. 338).
17. In 1980 WEF actually proposed a merger with LCWE (Fuller, People of the Mandate, p. 68).
19. McGrath, Evangelicalism and the Future, pp. 12, 165. McGrath is principal of Wycliffe Hall, Oxford University, and lecturer at Regent College, Canada.
21. Ibid.
The Legacy of Charles Henry Brent

Mark D. Norbeck

In Lausanne, Switzerland, in a section of the Bois de Vaux cemetery reserved exclusively for distinguished foreigners, there is a 7' x 3' granite grave marker with an eloquent Celtic cross carved into its top. Etched into the stone are the following words:

Charles Henry Brent, 1862–1929
A servant of Christ
A servant of Humanity
An Apostle of Christian Unity
Bishop of the Philippine Islands, 1901–1918
Bishop of Western New York, 1918–1929
Chief of Chaplains American Expeditionary Force, 1917–1918
President First World Conference on Faith and Order, 1927

The epitaph alone leads one to conclude that under this stone lies the earthly remains of a unique, energetic, multitalented leader of the modern church.

But exactly who was Charles Henry Brent? For many outside the circle of ecumenical and missionary scholars, Brent remains an obscure figure. It is hoped that this survey of Brent’s life and legacy will help secure the bishop’s place as one of the great twentieth century.

The Making of a Missionary

Charles Henry Brent was born on April 9, 1862, the third of ten children of the Reverend Henry Brent and Sophia Francis Brent. Brent grew up in the small town of Newcastle, Ontario, where his father was the local Anglican rector. After attending the town’s public schools and graduating from Trinity College school in Port Hope, Ontario, Brent enrolled in Trinity College, University of Toronto, and majored in the classics. Graduating in 1884, he studied privately for the priesthood. In 1886 Brent was ordained a deacon in the Anglican Church of Canada. However, because there were no openings in his diocese, he left Canada and sought employment in the United States. One year later, he was ordained to the priesthood and found work in Buffalo, New York.

Brent’s residence in Buffalo was brief, and in 1889 he moved to Boston, where he lived in an Episcopal monastic order, the Society of St. John the Evangelist. The Cowley Fathers, as the society was popularly known, put Brent in charge of St. Augustine’s, a small chapel erected to minister to the African-Americans living in Boston’s dilapidated West End.1

Brent managed the assignment well, probably because of the constant support and spiritual discipline he gained while living in the Cowley community. Historian Michael C. Reilly has suggested that although Brent never took any vows, his three years with the Cowley Fathers had a profound impact.2 Late in life Brent confirmed that analysis, remarking that his training with the Cowley Fathers was “so sound and inspiring that I could covet it for every young priest.” He elaborated: “Daily medita-

Brent held that “God never considers men apart from, but always as part of, a great social order.”

with notables in the settlement movement such as Robert Woods. Yet, his theology of social reform rested on biblical foundations and focused on Christ’s summary of the law: “Thou shalt love the Lord thy God with all thy heart, and with all thy soul, and with all thy mind. And ... Thou shalt love thy neighbour as thyself.” In his first book, With God in the World (1900), Brent wrote: “The Master gave a new commandment of love, a commandment new not in essence but rather in intensity and comprehension... If the first part of the commandment of love calls us to a study of theology, the second demands a study of sociology—an old science under a new name.” Brent added, “God never considers men apart from, but always as part of, a great social order—a social order that is not a concourse of independent units, but a body instinct with life, a society which is not an organization but an organism.” Thus, for Brent, loving one’s neighbor had broad implications that extended beyond one’s immediate friendships and were to be applied to the whole of humanity.
Christ’s great commandment also had a profound impact on Brent’s thoughts about missions. In 1898 he wrote, “It is so thoroughly unnatural for a Christian not to hope and pray and work for the widest conceivable extension of the Church’s boundaries that it is hard to understand how a man can be a sincere Christian and not see this at once.” Indeed, Brent concluded that through baptism all Christians are called to be missionaries.

The year 1901 was a watershed. There were both personal losses and new opportunities. Brent’s mother died, and he became financially responsible for a younger sister. Furthermore, his friend and colleague, Torbert, also passed away, leaving him in charge of St. Stephen’s. At the same time, W. S. Rainsford, rector of the prestigious and progressive St. George’s Episcopal Church in New York City, offered Brent a position on his staff. The University of the South elected him to their faculty, while General Theological Seminary, New York, was seriously considering him for the position of dean.

Then, quite unexpectedly, Brent was elected missionary bishop of the Philippines. He was both elated and terrified. Except for work in Liberia, China, and Japan, the Episcopal Church’s missionary record was dismal at best. Indeed, Episcopalians as a whole were generally apathetic about foreign missions. However, after confiding with close friends and after many days of prayer, Brent accepted the post. He was consecrated missionary bishop of the Philippines at Emmanuel Church, Boston, on December 19, 1901.

The Work in the Philippines

It took eight months for Brent to arrive in the Philippines after his consecration. The long interim was due to several months touring the United States and raising funds, developing tentative plans for the mission, and making important contacts with government officials. This time proved well spent. It allowed Brent the opportunity to meet President Theodore Roosevelt, his cabinet, and William Howard Taft, the newly appointed governor of the islands. Brent developed lifelong friendships with Roosevelt, Taft, and other prominent officials that eventually proved beneficial to all. Whenever Brent was outraged by some government policy or his mission faced difficulties with minor colonial officials, he often found immediate recourse through direct access to the highest authorities. In turn, when the colonial governor or president needed an official or unofficial diplomat, Brent often filled that role.

Brent’s holdover in the United States also allowed him time to consider a more personal matter. Brent was in love with a young woman identified in his diaries only as Mary. Despite their professed love for each other they agreed that it would be best not to marry. However, love letters continued between the two, and during a stopover in Rome, Brent wrote Mary asking her to be his wife. Though she declined, she continued to send amorous notes to the bishop. When several more marriage proposals were rebuffed Brent complained, “I have everything [Mary’s love], yet nothing [no hope of marriage]!” Finally, the relationship ended on August 29, 1904, when Mary wrote, “another hand has come into my life.” Brent responded by immersing himself in his work and devoting himself to a life of celibacy. Thus the bishop never married; the resulting loneliness frequently left him depressed in later life.

When Brent arrived in the Philippines on August 25, 1902, he found much missionary work ahead. The Episcopal Church had been established in the islands in 1898 by the efforts of several military chaplains and lay members of the Brotherhood of St. Andrew. However, much of their enterprise disintegrated because the chaplains fell ill or were transferred elsewhere. The Episcopal Board of Missions sent out two priests in 1900 to fill the void. But it was too late. All that was left of the Episcopal mission in 1902 was a small American congregation worshiping in a borrowed schoolhouse.

As he reorganized the missionary diocese, Brent decided that the Americans in the Philippines were his first concern. His goal was to establish a Christian influence on the colonial government. It was very important to Brent that American rule be just and display a sense of disinterested benevolence. Only then could the United States justify its presence in the Philippines.

It was very important to Brent that American rule in the Philippines display a sense of disinterested benevolence.

Only then could it properly fulfill its mission to build a democratic and Christian republic in the Far East.

To this end, Brent erected an impressive cathedral in Manila that could seat over one thousand people. To help young Americans combat the “vices of the Orient,” the Columbia Club, a YMCA-like organization, was founded at the cathedral’s parish house. Its facilities included a basketball court, tennis courts, bowling alleys, showers, and a swimming pool; all proved to be a great success. At the height of its popularity the club claimed more than 450 members.

In the summer capital of Baguio in the mountains of northern Luzon, two schools were established for American boys and girls so American families would not have to send their children back to the United States for their education. The boys’ school was financed solely through Brent’s private efforts. In Zamboanga, on the southern island of Mindanao, another small church was founded for American civil servants and military personnel.

Among the predominantly Roman Catholic Filipinos of Manila, Brent drew upon his social gospel experience by establishing a settlement house in the slums of Tondo. The settlement flourished and spawned an orphanage, numerous boys’ and girls’ clubs, sewing classes, and a profitable secondhand exchange. An impressive hospital and nurses’ training school also trace their origins from a small dispensary established in the settlement. These projects of social uplift were intended to address the physical needs of destitute people. As for their spiritual needs, Brent built a small Filipino chapel and staffed it with a Filipino priest. Nevertheless, he was heavily criticized by the Board of Missions because he refused to “build up a constituency by deliberately drawing upon the Roman Church.” Brent felt that by acts of sharing, teaching, and healing, the Episcopalians exhibited Christ’s divine character and his Gospel was implicitly proclaimed. If this brought Filipinos into the Episcopal fold, so be it. However, if the Filipinos returned to the Church of Rome, that also deserved his benediction. Unlike many evangelicals inside and outside the Episcopal Church, Brent insisted that the Roman communion was an authentic expression of the Christian faith.

A third constituency that the Episcopalians worked with in Manila were the Chinese merchants from Amoy, China. Brent recruited Hobart Studley, a former missionary from the Reformed Church of America who had years of experience in
At Asbury Seminary, we view the whole world as a mission field—from New York to New Delhi. That’s why we’ve developed the only graduate school of mission which teaches missiological strategy for North America and Europe, as well as the “Two-Thirds” world. Our innovative faculty instruct from experience, not just theory. Students are trained to creatively engage all cultures with the gospel, including their own. At Asbury, you’ll learn to see beyond borders, over obstacles and past prejudice to touch the total person and entire communities with the greatness of Christ. So if you’re passionate about reaching the world—and your neighbor—prepare for service at Asbury.

ESJ School Degree Programs: Master of Arts, Master of Theology, Doctor of Missiology, Doctor of Ministry and Doctor of Philosophy.

Dr. George Hunter, Dean of Asbury Seminary’s ESJ School and author of the best-selling book, *How to Reach Secular People.*
Amoy, to work with the Chinese. Studley was so successful that the Methodists and Presbyterians eventually turned their own work over to the Episcopal Church.10

Besides work in Manila, extensive efforts were made to evangelize pagan head-hunting tribesmen in the mountains of northern Luzon. Three centers of activity were established. In Baguio, Easter School for Igorot boys was organized. Further north, in Bontoc, a mission church was founded and vigorously evangelized the local Igorots. In addition, the Bontoc missionaries wrote the first Igorot grammars, which were quickly published by the colonial government.

Between Baguio and Bontoc there stood perhaps the most impressive work of the Episcopalian. At the town of Sagada, Father John A. Staunton established a church, hospital, sawmill, and extensive industrial training school. Brent put particular interest in vocational training. “To train the head of the average native without training his hand,” said Brent, “unfits him rather than fits him for life.”11

This same attitude led Brent to establish the Moro Agricultural School for Muslims on the southern island of Sulu. Brent took particular interest in the Moros. He realized that strained feelings created by years of Moro resistance to Spanish and then American rule would take generations to overcome. Therefore instead of proselytizing, the bishop sought ways to provide fellowship between the Westerners and the Moros. He built a hospital, a settlement house, a press, and a school in Mindanao. Brent felt the need for mutual understanding was so important that, when the Board of Missions refused to support his efforts, he made the Moro mission his personal enterprise and raised money from friends at home.

**Evaluation of Mission Strategy**

A cursory review of the Philippine Mission in 1914 would leave one with the impression that the diocese was a great success. However, there were serious problems that Brent never overcame. First, staffing the mission was incredibly difficult. For example, St. Luke’s Hospital in Manila suffered because of the constant turnover of nurses. Often Brent had to recruit army and civil service personnel, many of whom were affiliated with other denominations. “Truly it is a great disappointment,” complained head nurse Ellen Hicks, “to pretend to be a missionary of the [Episcopal] Church and have only the satisfaction of working in a general nonsectarian Hospital.”12

A second problem with the missionary district was due to its geographic breadth and its multiethnic diversity. Brent originally envisioned Manila as the center of the diocese, from which all other ministries would radiate. However, because of the distance between the capital and the mission stations in northern Luzon and in the southern islands of Mindanao, travel was often so expensive and perilous that only the Manila clergy could attend the annual convocations. Vincent Gowen, one-time Philippine missionary and critic of the bishop, stated that “it was easier for Brent to get from Manila to San Francisco than from Manila to Zamboanga.” In addition, Gowen noted that even if the indigenous people from the far-flung stations of the mission did get to Manila for official gatherings, their distinct languages and social customs made communication difficult at best.

A third problem within the district was caused by Brent’s frequent absences from the Philippines. He was gone so much that his critics referred to him as “the bishop from the Philippines.” His absences allowed his staff the freedom to initiate several expensive projects without careful consideration of their long-term viability.13 Thus, several grandiose projects were created that put a severe strain on the mission’s finances.

Undoubtedly these were glaring deficiencies over which Brent despaired. But to be fair, most of the long sojourns away from the islands were unavoidable. The bishop was often called to the United States because of death in his family, poor health, triennial General Conventions, and the constant need for fund-raising. Furthermore, in 1903 Brent became a leading figure in an international crusade against the opium trade.

**The Antiopium Crusade**

Soon after his arrival in the Philippines, Brent discovered that opium addiction was the islands’ most pressing social problem among the Chinese community and that the malaise was spreading into the rest of the Filipino population. Brent and other religious leaders demanded that the colonial government put an end to this evil. In response, the Philippine Commission agreed to study the matter and formed an Opium Committee to investigate how other countries dealt with the problem; Taft appointed Brent to the committee.

After months of research and traveling, Brent and the Opium Committee made the following recommendations. First, an immediate government monopoly should be placed on the narcotic. Second, over a three-year period, importation of opium would be phased out until it was finally prohibited from the islands altogether, except for legitimate medical use. Third, confirmed addicts would be licensed and given free medical attention. Finally, an antidrug campaign would be launched in the islands’ schools.

The Opium Committee’s report had a widespread impact. Within four years the United States and the Philippines officially prohibited opium. The report was translated and circulated throughout China, which bolstered its own government’s growing antiopium movement. In England the report reopened the debate on the morality of the trade and eventually forced Parliament to refrain from using opium exports to finance its Indian empire.

Brent continued as a key figure in the international antiopium crusade for the next quarter of a century. Indeed, it was at Brent’s suggestion that the United States organized the first International Opium Conference, in Shanghai, China, in 1909. Brent served as an official representative of the United States and was reappointed to The Hague Conference in 1911. He presided at both conferences. After World War I he also participated in two more such conferences. Historian Arnold H. Taylor has written that Brent’s participation in the opium conferences was “fortunate for the antiopium movement as a whole.” Brent was a man of great moral conviction, which was coupled with “an ability to analyze issues realistically”; thus, he gave the international movement “the character of a moral crusade.”14 Brent’s participation in the antiopium crusade made him an international figure and statesman.
Faith and Order

Brent's international celebrity grew in religious circles after he attended the 1910 World Missionary Conference at Edinburgh, Scotland. From the beginning of his episcopate, Brent was deeply interested in ecumenism. He sincerely believed that the disunion and competition between the various denominations left non-Christians bewildered. Even so, Brent had serious misgivings about the Edinburgh Conference. He noted the absence of Roman Catholic and Orthodox participation. In addition, he felt the conference's agenda evaded fundamental theological and polity issues that divided Christendom. "It is worse than folly," he wrote, "to pretend that such things matter little or do not matter at all." He felt that unless these issues were frankly addressed, true unity would always remain illusory.  

Despite his initial doubts, Brent left Edinburgh a renewed ecumenist, and he committed himself to mending the tattered seams of the universal church. In October 1910 Brent thus went before the General Convention of the Protestant Episcopal Church, asking that it take the lead in planning the first world conference on Faith and Order. Brent's proposal was accepted, and for the next ten years an Episcopal commission worked faithfully to keep his dream alive, in spite of the ravages of World War I.  

After seventeen years of preparation, finally, on August 3, 1927, a total of 406 delegates, representing 108 denominations, met in Lausanne, Switzerland, for the First World Conference on Faith and Order. Brent was the unanimous choice for president. In his opening remarks, he reminded the delegates of the fact that total agreement was not the aim of the conference, nor was a federation sought. Instead, Brent insightfully warned, true unity would be a long, agonizing process. Before Christendom's harmony could be restored, the various communions would first have to learn to fellowship with one another, to listen sympathetically, and to open themselves to the guidance of the Holy Spirit. Faith and Order, Brent claimed, was an important first step in a long pilgrimage to restore the true catholic church.  

Brent's leadership was crucial for the success of the first Faith and Order conference. His sense of humor, his diplomatic skill, and his patience kept the conference from breaking up on several occasions. Arguably, this was Brent's finest hour, but it was bittersweet. To many of his friends, it was obvious that he was in poor health.  

For more than a decade, he had been suffering from recurring heart attacks that left him temporarily incapacitated. Although dismayed by these spells, Brent refused to cut back on his responsibilities. For example, on October 20, 1917, he resigned his missionary post in the Philippines, only to begin more stressful duties in Europe as Senior Headquarter's Chaplain of the American Expeditionary Forces. After the war, Brent assumed the post of bishop of Western New York, where his schedule was so busy that he became notorious for speeding his car throughout the diocese, going from one appointment to the next. Moreover, Brent's last years were filled with nine more trips to Europe. In 1921 he delivered the Duff Lectures at Edinburgh. He continued to work toward the eradication of the opium trade through the League of Nations and international conferences. And he helped plan and attended Faith and Order and also participated in other ecumenical gatherings. His heart finally could not take the strain, and on March 27, 1929, he died in Lausanne, Switzerland. Ironically, he was en route to the Mediterranean for a much-needed vacation.  

By the time Brent died, he had become perhaps the best-known Episcopal clergyman since Phillips Brooks, and his friends were many of the secular and clerical leaders from around the world.
world. As stated above, Brent was never an original theologian, nor was he an innovative mission strategist. Nevertheless, he left an indelible mark on the modern church. Although he lived to see only one Faith and Order conference, his vision continued under the able leadership of Archbishop William Temple, Bishop Yngve T. Brilioth of Sweden, and a Continuation Committee for another venue, the universal church, which “partly is and wholly hopes world. As stated above, Brent was never an original theologian, an indelible mark on the modern church. Although he lived to see only one Faith and Order conference, his vision continued under independence and became the Commission on Faith and Order in the newly founded World Council of Churches. In this new venue, the universal church, which “partly is and wholly hopes to be,” continues its work for understanding and wholeness. Brent’s legacy also remains alive in current international diplomacy and law enforcement. Today the international community still struggles to free its citizens from the curse of illicit drug use and trade. While defending his participation in the antipoopum crusade, Brent asked rhetorically: “Can any Christian afford to abstain not only from that which, directly or indirectly, encourages drug abuse, but also from a planned and intelligent attack upon it?” On a deeper level, Brent asked Christians, and indeed all citizens of the world: Are we going to tolerate this evil in our midst? If not, how are we going to eradicate it? This remains a fundamental question for the local, national, and international community to resolve. Brent’s example challenges us to work for viable and humane solutions.

Notes
7. Lawrence to Brent, July 15 and July 20, 1901, Brent Papers, LOC, Box 5.
8. Diaries, 1901–1904, Brent Papers, LOC, Box 1. Brent edited any mention of Mary out of his diaries with ink and a blue crayon, and none of their correspondence survives. Fortunately for the historian, the original writing has bled through over the years and much of it can be read with the aid of a magnifying glass. It is appropriate to disclose the bishop’s relationship with Mary at this time because of a recent biography by Douglass Shand-Tucci, Boston Bohemia: 1881–1900, Ralph Adams Cram: Life and Architecture, vol. 1 (Amherst: Univ. of Massachusetts Press, 1995). Although a biography of Cram, Shand-Tucci also touches upon the relationship of Brent with his Cowley superior Arthur Crawshay Hall; he claims that Brent had a homosexual disposition that manifested itself in a life-long “marriage of the soul” with Hall (see pages 184–199). Although Shand-Tucci provides circumstantial evidence for such a claim, the only hard evidence of Brent’s sexual orientation, noted above, suggests heterosexual inclinations. Furthermore, all surviving correspondence between Brent and Hall found in Brent’s papers housed at the Library of Congress and the Archives of the Episcopal Church, in Austin, Texas, reveal only a close mentor/student relationship that eventually matured into a deep friendship. Without a doubt, Brent and Hall were confidants; however, I am uncertain when such a relationship can be classified as homosexual.

Selected Bibliography

Works by Charles H. Brent
Brent published over twenty books during his lifetime, and a few more were published posthumously. Most are devotional in nature or collected works of sermons. Listed below are some of the more substantial works.

Works About Brent
Women and men from around the globe are attending Fuller Theological Seminary to become effective pastors, leaders, and teachers. These graduate students will be among this generation's world changers.

Fuller's School of World Mission is unique. Its sixteen faculty members offer the possibility of specialization in many areas, and its students, coming from more than sixty-five countries and even more denominations, will make your studies an incredibly enriching experience. Academic programs at the master's and doctoral levels offer extraordinary opportunities for church leaders and missionaries to study, reflect and do research on a variety of aspects of the missionary task.

If you are considering graduate training in cross-cultural studies or world mission, consider Fuller.

For more information about Fuller's School of World Mission, call or write today. We'll be happy to answer your questions.

Call 1-800-235-2222 and ask for Admissions at ext. 5400, or write

Office of Admissions
Fuller Theological Seminary
135 North Oakland Avenue
Pasadena, California 91182

FULLER THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY
School of World Mission
My Pilgrimage in Mission

Eugene Heideman

A pilgrimage calls up visions of a person intentionally on a long and difficult journey to a holy place or spiritual goal. In that sense it is difficult to think of my journey as a pilgrimage. From the time of my birth in Plymouth, Wisconsin (at a hospital cost of $52.50), I have been loved into being by Christian parents, uncles and aunts, neighbors and friends. They reared me in an atmosphere of grace and acceptance in family, church, and community. The community of my youth was a place in which God was present. Worship in church, work in the cheese factory and grocery store, and competition at the softball stadium represented one integrated whole.

The journey has proceeded since my teens with a sense of calling rather than as a search. It has been more of a call to rest in the Lord’s direction than to engage in a wrestling with the powers of this age or the search for a specific mission in life. Calls to serve have come often as a surprising change of direction in ministry as our family moved from Canada to India, from India to Iowa, then to Michigan, and finally to New York. A doctorate in dogmatic theology has mutated into the broad spectrum of an academic and ecclesiastical generalist.

The warm evangelical Reformed faith of boyhood was to be challenged by study in Iowa at Central College, a liberal arts college closely associated with the Reformed Church in America. Truth began to fragment as I read Plato, Descartes, Kant, and other philosophers at the same time as I took courses in Bible. World history was more complex than the history of a small town in Wisconsin. The role of religion in public life was becoming more open to question than it had been in the American Protestant era before World War II. Later experiences in cross-cultural international environments only served further to increase the sense of the broken nature of the world in which we live. The unity of truth under God was to become an eschatological concept that enables one to wait upon the Holy Spirit to lead us into all truth, even while confidently affirming that Jesus Christ is the way, the truth, and the life.

Family relationships play a crucial role in my understanding of mission and faith. Mary Menninga, a fellow student at Central College, and I were married in 1952 following her graduation from college and my first year at Western Theological Seminary, in Holland, Michigan. She has constantly taught me to be sensitive to the needs of people around us and to keep in touch with the daily practical necessities of life on earth. Marriage and family has become a central point of theological understanding and reflection, particularly in recognition of the threefold nature of love as friendship (philos); as the appreciation of the good, the true, and the beautiful (eros); and as forgiving, redeeming love (agape). We have four children, the third of whom has Down’s syndrome. Her presence in our family has heightened recognition of the good news that God’s love reaches out to each of us because we are here in his creation, regardless of how we are valued in the economic, political, and cultural systems of this world.

Netherlands and Canada: Ecumenical Apostolate

Doctoral studies in theology at the National University of Utrecht, in the Netherlands, under A. A. van Ruler during the years 1954–56, provided a theological basis for an understanding of church and culture that has undergirded my theology of mission. Those were great years in the life of the Netherlands Reformed Church. It rejoiced in its faithful witness during the German occupation in World War II. The World Council of Churches had been inaugurated in Amsterdam in 1948. Several of its leaders, such as W. A. Visser’t Hooft and Hendrik Kraemer, were with the World Council of Churches in Geneva. Hans Hoekendijk was teaching in Utrecht. The new Reformed church order was providing the church with a sense of direction and new freedom of purpose. The church was defined in terms of its apostolate or mission in the world. It was to be a church turned inside out, with a passion for social justice, a calling to proclaim the Gospel, and a search for the full unity and catholicity of the church.

In the decade and a half following World War II the Dutch government entered into immigration agreements with countries such as Canada, the Republic of South Africa, and Australia. These agreements enabled those countries to gain a well-trained work force while furnishing a measure of relief for a severe housing shortage in the Netherlands as it was rebuilding following the damages of the war. The Netherlands Reformed Church simultaneously entered into agreements with churches in the Reformed tradition in those countries concerning the reception of its emigrating members. The Reformed Church in America as well as the United Church in Canada became partners with the Dutch church in helping settle new immigrants into Canada. After twice refusing invitations to serve in Canada, I accepted a call to serve as “missionary pastor” in the First Reformed Church in Edmonton, Alberta, beginning in January 1957.

The theology of the ministry of the church as apostolate became a matter of daily practical concern in Edmonton. The church had to reach out to assist annually between sixty and eighty family or individual immigrant units to resettle in Canada. Pastoral ministry included assisting people to find living quarters and employment, to overcome language barriers, and to understand the educational system and the immigration bureaucracy. Culture shock, unemployment, stress in family life, and loss of self-esteem called for pastoral care, especially among men, when a licensed butcher had to work as a night janitor, a former newspaper editor became a copy reader, and a father of eight remained unemployed. The unity of the church became an issue, not only in regard to relationships with congregations of other denominations, but especially within the congregation. People who would seldom have interacted with each other in the Netherlands now found themselves living together in one congregation.

God reaches out to each of us, regardless of how we may be valued in the systems of this world.

Eugene Heideman, Secretary for Program, Reformed Church in America (retired), was a Reformed Church missionary in South India.
The whole issue of contextualization in mission had to be faced in the ministry with immigrants in Edmonton. As Christians in the Reformed tradition, Dutch immigrants had a strong conviction that they had to be servants of God in Canadian society. The Gospel had to take on Canadian forms in their ministry. But no question was more to be debated than what it is to become “Canadian” where breakfast cereal boxes are printed in English on one side and French on the other. One had to deal with the issue of the international character of the church in relation to contextualization. The Reformed Church in America was based almost exclusively in the United States. Would it be willing to accept Canadian perspectives into the denominational stance and identity?

In an immigrant situation, one learns again that human beings are not isolated individuals, even in an Age of Enlightenment, when individualism is said to run rampant. While faith is and must be personal, it is seldom individual. Language as a communal and covenanted reality holds us in its grasp, with the result that people feel a need to worship God in their mother tongue, using their own cultural forms.

It was in the Netherlands and Canada that Mary and I really learned that we are Americans. We had both grown up in communities that were still consciously Dutch in character. Living outside U.S. borders, we came to feel the undercurrents of resentment in Europe against American power and America’s ways of doing things. While Americans often forget that there is a border between the two countries, Canadians never do. We came to understand that as long as we are willing to carry U.S. passports, we can never fully divorce ourselves from the decisions and actions of our country and our culture. While we can celebrate the good aspects of our national heritage, we must confess that our nation’s sins are also our personal sins. In our missionary situation we can never overcome the tension between being an ambassador of Christ and at the same time a representative American.

India: Participation in Nation Building

Missionary service from 1960 to 1970 in the Madras Diocese, Church of South India, was a great privilege. We entered India just thirteen years after the country had gained independence and after the Church of South India had come into being in one of the outstanding success stories of the ecumenical movement. Many of the older missionaries had retired or left, and vigorous Indian leadership was providing direction to the church and its related institutions. With the encouragement of Indian leaders such as Paul Devanandan and M. M. Thomas, the church understood one of its tasks in India to be Christian participation in nation building. The Diocese of Madras was fully committed to that task as it managed and strengthened hundreds of village schools, many high schools, several colleges, and a wide range of medical, agricultural, technical, and other development projects.

In bringing together Anglican, Reformed, Presbyterian, Congregational, and Methodist churches, the Church of South India had agreed upon a thirty-year period of growing together, divisions in the church. All of the confessions and liturgical traditions of the entering churches were to be respected in the new church. Its constitution ruled that the church was to be “comprehensive without compromise.” The Diocese of Madras assigned us to live and work in Vellore, the site of the Christian Medical College and Hospital, the leading medical facility in India, cooperatively supported by more than fifty denominations and Christian organizations. We lived in the bungalow in which Dr. Ida Scudder had begun her medical mission. Through life in that setting, and assignment for a time to be pastor of St. John’s Church, which served the medical community, we came to appreciate an even wider range of Christian community. An understanding of the unity of the church as a gift of Christ and an article of faith, and of ecumenism as a call to be “comprehensive without compromise,” has been a guiding principle for us.

Assignment to be the director of the Tamil-language Light of Life Bible correspondence course and of the India Home Bible League entailed major involvement in evangelistic outreach in Madras State (now Tamil Nadu). The correspondence course enrolled approximately 25,000 persons per year, of whom 85 percent were Hindu and 5 percent Muslim. Between 200,000 and 500,000 Bibles and Scripture portions were sold annually. Because there was considerable debate among advocates of one or another method of evangelism, a survey was conducted among persons who had converted and been baptized. The finding of the survey was that no one method by itself is adequate and that most of the converts had been reached by nine or ten methods prior to their decision. The one common element was that in almost every case there had been an encouraging relationship with a friend or relative. At about the same time, the Christian Institute for the Study of Religion and Society held a conference of about twenty-five persons who had converted to Christianity. The conference was called to hear their response to whether the God of Jesus Christ to whom they now prayed was the same as or different than the god to whom they had prayed prior to their conversion. The persons attending divided, with about half saying that Jesus was the same God and half denying that he was.

The issue of indigenization of the Gospel, as it was then called, was a central concern for many. Church buildings were at times erected on the pattern of Hindu temples; Tamil lyrics were more popular than Western hymns in village congregations. Efforts to indigenize the basic liturgy of the church were being made. Yet such efforts had their limits. To incorporate more Hindu metaphors could alienate those with a Muslim background. The leading political party was opposed to “Brahmanism” and was attempting to replace Sanskrit roots by older pure Tamil words, similar to attempts to replace Latin-root words by Anglo-Saxon English.

It was in India that we learned that we were among the rich of the world. An unforgettable experience was on our first American Thanksgiving Day, when we with a number of other American missionaries met to have a meal together. While seated on a veranda eating our Thanksgiving feast, I looked out and saw four beggars on the lawn watching us eat. The old parable of the rich man and Lazarus took on new meaning and has remained with me to this day as the reality of the world in which I live.

In India we had to learn to live among the poor as forgiven sinners. Charity that is done out of a sense of guilt is likely to be damaging both because it fosters paternalism and dependency and because it is so subject to the whim of the moment rather than
thoughtful faithfulness to human need. Fortunately, during those years the church had gained considerable experience with empowering the poor, and we could work with the church in meeting human developmental needs. We would be helped further in later years by the advocates of liberation theology with its emphasis on being in solidarity with the poor as crucial in making resources available.

**Mission in the American Academy**

Faced with the necessity to return to the United States to meet our daughter’s need for special education, an offer to teach at our alma mater, Central College, was accepted. There for six years I taught courses in religion and philosophy and also served much of the time as college chaplain. While one does not normally consider teaching in a church-related college as “mission,” the cultural dynamics of the American scene were very much a part of college life. In the early 1970s the antiwar movement was very strong on campus, and the Great Society programs were still providing funds for those who wished to be socially involved following graduation. Psychology and sociology majors drew the largest numbers of students on campus.

A major challenge in the role of chaplain was conducting worship and preaching at Sunday morning worship on campus. Now the task was to contextualize the Gospel into the language of American culture and academic life. Here the challenge was to communicate the Gospel to those who view themselves as cultured and mature—those who are the rich young rulers (Mt. 19:16-23)—who need it just as much as the poor and the “sinners” (Mt. 9:10-13). I had first become conscious of the need to preach clearly to the “mature” in India when I was pastor of congregations filled with well-educated leaders in society and in their professions. It is one thing to preach weekly to the Mary Magdalenes and the publicans of society; it is more challenging to tell the Good News to those who are seeking to become the rich, young educated rulers and respected leaders of society. In my years at Central College, where it was constantly necessary to translate theological language into sociological and psychological terminology, I faced a task as formidable as it was for an American to preach in the Dutch language in Canada or in the Tamil language in India.

Following our time at Central, I was on the faculty at Western Theological Seminary in Holland, Michigan, for six years, where I could at last feel that my theological language was being understood. The issue for mission now was whether anyone outside the theological community really understood it.

**Mission Administration in New York**

Serving as secretary for World Mission and director of Reformed Church World Service with the Reformed Church in America from 1982 to 1994 required that I visit once again all of the issues in mission that had become paramount at one time or another over the decades. During those twelve years international long-distance telephone service to isolated areas greatly improved; fax, computers, and e-mail made international communications almost instantaneous. Air travel became relatively inexpensive. These advances in transportation and communication facilities were bringing about a sea change in how a larger number of people could become directly involved in cross-cultural mission.

In the first two decades following World War II the ecumenical network of cooperating churches and councils developed by the major denominations was clearly the most efficient means of carrying out long-term international mission and mission communication. In the 1980s the ecumenical communication structures were slow by comparison with the potential for rapid and direct information flow between churches and individuals who were eager for personal involvement in mission outreach. Until my retirement I continued to face a dilemma confronting many administrators in mission. On the one hand, one desires to encourage the witness of those who, facilitated by modern communications and transportation channels and endowed with financial resources, have a vision for direct and immediate involvement in mission in other countries. On the other hand, I tried to resist such outside initiatives when they might result in undercutting the longstanding patterns of self-reliance of our partners in mission in other countries.

The 1980s was also the decade in which American Christians finally began to be aware of the existence of vital Christianity in Asia and Africa. Many had traveled broadly and made Christian friends living in other continents. At the same time, it was the decade in which they became aware of immigrant Asian Christian churches in North America. They saw Hindu temples and Muslim mosques erected as well as the arrival of other religions, new and old. They now discovered what Asian Christians had known all along—the Christian faith must be lived in a radically pluralistic world, and Christians cannot avoid living in dialogue with neighbors of other faiths.

 Somehow, although the forms of the issues in mission change, the issues themselves tend to remain. In decades of extremely rapid change, I found myself going back repeatedly to a question that had to be faced everywhere: What is the Good News? To an immigrant in Canada, it was the apartment and job located with assistance from the church and the opportunity to worship God in church in one’s own language in a new country. To a patient at the Christian Medical Hospital in Vellore, it was the healing hand of a doctor or nurse. To a person being treated for leprosy, it was acceptance into a Christian community and restoration into the life of a family. To a murderer on death row in the Vellore prison, it was the message of forgiveness of sins. To a famine-stricken person in Ethiopia, it was a small bag of grain, a blanket, and water purification tablets. In the nineteenth century Jesus had been sung about triumphantly as Christ for the nations; in home missions Jesus had been understood to be like a mother, sweetly and tenderly calling her wandering boy to come home. In our century we have known him as the man for others, as the liberator, as the savior who came and will come again and as the servant who suffers in solidarity with others, and as a nurturing Sophia who overcomes gender and arrogant patriarchy. It is this Jesus, universally and locally present with the Good News for each person, who continues to call me in the journey of faith, love, and hope.
CRISIS AND HOPE IN LATIN AMERICA
An Evangelical Perspective (Revised Edition)
by Emilio Antonio Nunez and William Taylor
1996, paperback, 544 pages.
The authors expand their earlier work on Latin America. This revision incorporates a new title, an insightful essay by Peruvian missiologist Samuel Escobar, an updated section by Nunez and Taylor, and an expanded annotated bibliography. Panoramic yet thorough. Part 1 by Taylor examines the historical, socio-political and religious backgrounds of Latin America as well as personal insight into the Latin personality. In Part 2 Nunez probes issues and challenges such as post-conciliar Roman Catholicism, liberation theology, the charismatic movements, contextualization, and social responsibility. In Part 3 both authors update their original material, and Taylor concludes by exploring the implications of this book for the church, mission agencies and expatriate missionaries serving in Latin America.
WCL766-4 Retail $17.95 Postpaid Discount $13.00

THE KALEJIIN HERITAGE
Traditional Religious and Social Practices
by Burnette C. Fish & Gerald W. Fish
1996, paperback, 400 pages.
A marvelous description of the centuries-old traditional religious and social practices of the Kalenjiin of Kenya. The Fishes came to Kenya in 1944 and ministered to the Kipsigiis (Kalenjiin) until their retirement in the early 1980s. The study approach taken by the authors is scholarly. It demystifies the worship of Asis and brings into focus its corresponding redemptive analogies with the God of Abraham as contained in the Bible. The book includes 17 full-color illustrations of life, customs and dress of the Kalenjiin.
WCL769-9 Retail $16.95 Postpaid Discount $12.50

ON BEING A MISSIONARY
by Thomas Hale
On Being a Missionary is not designed to be a theoretical textbook. It does not put forward new theses, new approaches to mission nor does it attempt to break new ground. Instead the author tries to absorb and then to present in a readable way the ideas, experiences, and insights of over a hundred missionary writers.
WCL255-7 Retail $16.95x Postpaid Discount $15.00

TO ORDER
Send check or money order in U.S. funds to:
WILLIAM CAREY LIBRARY, P.O. Box 40129, Pasadena, California 91114
Add $2.00 for handling. California residents add 7.25% for tax. L.A. County add $8.25%. To place your order using MASTER CARD or VISA phone TOLL FREE 1-800-MISSION (647-7466) Prices are subject to change without notice.
Call 1-800-777-6371 for a complete catalog.
Indigenous Responses to Western Christianity.


Well known for his studies on the Falashas, Steven Kaplan, along with six fellow essayists, here explores the metamorphosis of Western missionary Christianity through its appropriation by peoples of Peru, Mexico, Africa, India, Sri Lanka, Thailand, China, and Japan. Each demonstrates that any faith-tapestry must inevitably and necessarily incorporate local fibers and manifest the tastes and temperaments of indigenous artisans; that Christianity is at once the prisoner and the liberator of culture; that conversion across cultures is dynamically and profoundly reciprocal.

In the first chapter, arguing that Western missionary roles in the Africanization of Christianity are neither as inconsiderable nor as monolithic as popularly thought, Kaplan traces the contours of their variegated contributions through application of six broad, dynamically suggestive, and at times overlapping, typologies: tolerance, translation, assimilation, Christianization, acculturation, and incorporation. Ensuing chapters directly or indirectly elaborate this point. Erik Cohen explores "the process of mutual adaptation of Christianity and indigenous religions in Thailand" (p. 29), concluding that the interfacing of the two cultures simultaneously issued in the Christianization of local culture and in the indigenization of Christianity; Jan Szeminski shows that the Catholic doctrine of original sin was never able to supplant the extant Inca understanding of sin but was itself significantly modified.

Subsequent chapters—by John F. Howes on Uchimura Kanzo's understanding of the relationship between Christian and state in the Japanese postwar context; by D. Dennis Hudson on Tamil Hindu responses to Protestants in the late nineteenth century; by Daniel H. Bays on the True Jesus Church, a Pentecostal example of indigenous Chinese Christianity during the earlier third of this century; and by Eric van Young, entitled "The Messiah and the Masked Man: Popular Ideology in Mexico, 1810–1821"—all illustrate the essential coherence of the book's thesis: both Christian thought and praxis are profoundly conditioned by local contexts, undergoing a metamorphosis at least as profound as the conversion its Western emissaries aimed to produce.

—Jonathan J. Bonk

Jonathan J. Bonk is Professor of Global Christian Studies, Providence Theological Seminary, Otterburne, Manitoba, Canada. He spent a number of years in Ethiopia as the son of missionaries and as a missionary himself.


"Case studies . . . facilitate our understanding of others, and even more important, they assist us in understanding ourselves" (p. xx). With over twenty years of experience using case studies in teaching mission, most recently at Princeton Theological Seminary, Alan Neely is well qualified to make this evaluation. The value of using case studies in theological education today is generally accepted, but as Neely notes, the use in teaching about Christian mission is still very much neglected. This volume will go a long way toward filling that lacuna and should encourage others to contribute their own case studies. It is a joy to see that this is not merely a volume of stories, but it is a nicely conceived and carefully produced textbook on the use of case studies for teaching Christian mission.

Neely understands the use of case studies in mission as a matter of understanding context and contextualization. Following Lubetzak's definition of culture, there is a tightly worded eight-page discussion of contextualization and its related concepts. Next, Neely gives a helpful introduction of how case studies arose and how they are to be used. With the extensive use of stories, critical incidents, and case studies in theological education today, it was a wonderful decision of the writer and the editors to include both "The Case Study Approach to Teaching and Learning" (pp. 13–19) and four appendices, which provide guidance in the writing and using of case studies.

A very high standard is set in the eighteen case studies recorded in this volume. Each study begins with an explanation of the context (often including social, political, and religious considerations and a map), followed by a bibliography, the case itself, study questions, and finally, suggested biblical texts for reflection. The studies are all engaging and frustrating, covering issues of syncretism, ecumenism, money, and relations with other faiths among others. Orbis Books has now provided us with a trinity of texts eminently useful in teaching Christian mission: David Bosch's *Transforming Mission*, Norman Thomas's *Classic Texts*, and now Neely's *Case Study Approach*.

—Scott W. Sunquist

Scott W. Sunquist is Associate Professor of World Mission and Evangelism, Pittsburgh Theological Seminary. He previously served eight years at Trinity Theological College in Singapore.


In the book under review, Adrian Hastings, who is professor emeritus at Leeds University in England, has returned to a subject he has treated before and expounded it with fresh eyes and in a lively style. By placing his own personal stamp on the subject, he gives the book its distinctive flavor.

The book is structured into three main chronological periods: the medieval, covering 1450 to 1780; the era of abolition, from 1780 to 1890; and the era of missions, from 1890 to 1960. The medieval period is dominated by the history of Christianity.
in Ethiopia and the Kongo, a history Hastings develops in its Orthodox and Roman Catholic forms. What is striking here is how medieval Christianity conceived itself and was conceived in territorial terms, not simply by incorporating lands and territories into the church’s sphere of influence, but by co-opting the state machinery as the engine of evangelization and as the unit of religious identity. Christianity, in turn, would be co-opted by the state to enforce political and social cohesion. Both Ethiopia and the Kongo conformed to this medieval pattern of Christianization, both sharing in the political appropriation of the religion that, by the same token, came inevitably to be affected by political developments. Historians are united in the view that such a medieval version of religious territoriality possessed little promise for Africa, and that, by the nineteenth century, medieval Catholicism in the Kongo and elsewhere vanished almost without trace, though Ethiopian Christianity survived, if merely imprisoned now by its own national circumstances. Hastings would add the imposition by Rome of the rule of priestly celibacy as another cause for the failure of medieval Catholicism.

The era of abolition, from 1780 to 1890, was also phase 1 of the era of Christian missions in Africa, and the two shared chronology for better than fortuitous reasons. The campaign to abolish the slave trade, finally won in 1807, was the engine that moved the modern missionary movement, especially the Protestant missions. We could, in fact, argue that Africa emerged into modern history on the back of this missionary movement. It was during this period that the geography of the continent, especially its great riverine and lacustrine systems, was mapped, its rich ethnic and linguistic heritage documented, its political systems observed and recorded, its religious traditions and cultures described in ethnographic studies, and its mineral and natural wealth targeted for development and control.

The evangelical movement, which played such a prominent role in the abolition campaign, realized that moral sentiments alone would not be enough to respond to the powerful pro-slavery planter interest in Parliament and society at large. So the movement looked to empirical evidence and the marshaling of hands-on experience to dislodge prejudice and undermine slave-based market arguments. One strategy deployed by the abolitionists was to recruit Africans who themselves had been enslaved but were now free and whose voice would add an authentic, concrete dimension to the controversy. Hastings describes this strategy at great length. There had, of course, been Africans in earlier periods who wrote and campaigned against slavery and traveled abroad in that cause, but never before had a global movement arisen in which such representative Africans could play a role so natural to their experience and circumstances and so effective to the purpose, a situation with enormous, and as yet unforeseen, unsettling implications for the colonialism that would emerge later. Thus a straight historical line can be traced from the anti-slavery campaigns of emancipated slaves like Olaudah Equiano, Ottobah Cugoano, Paul Cuffee, and David George to patriotic and nationalist champions like Samuel Ajayi Crowther, James “Holy” Johnson, and Herbert Macaulay, a colorful nationalist hero whose mother used to dress him “in a suit of purple velvet knickerbockers with a purple velvet coat and shining silver buttons” (p. 341). These so-called recaptive Africans, Westernized and Christianized, would form the crucial buffer between an ascendant, exploitative Western colonialism and a weakened African continent, more brokers and mediators than collaborators. It was, it could be argued, by their agency that the tribes of

---

**THE PEW CHARITABLE TRUSTS**

**Research Advancement Grants for Projects on Christian Mission and World Christianity**

The Religion Program of The Pew Charitable Trusts invites proposals for large-scale projects that will enhance team research and publication in studies of Christian Mission and non-Western Christianity. Grants will be made on a competitive basis for two- to three-year collaborative projects that will contribute significantly to the advancement of scholarship on cross-cultural mission and/or the development of Christianity in the southern and eastern continents. Grants will range from $50,000 to $100,000 (U.S.) per year.

Projects should be directed by one or more established scholars, have access to appropriate research facilities, involve scholars from two or more regions of the world, and contribute to the intellectual and cross-cultural vitality of the global Christian movement. Projects that are interdenominational and interdisciplinary and that elicit significant contributions from the non-Western world are particularly welcome. Two or three grants will be awarded at the end of 1997, subject to the quality of proposals received and the availability of funds.

The deadline for receiving initial proposals (maximum four pages) for 1997 Research Advancement Grants is May 1, 1997. For further information and instructions please contact:

**Geoffrey A. Little, Coordinator**

**Research Advancement Grants**

**Overseas Ministries Study Center**

490 Prospect Street

New Haven, Connecticut 06511-2196

U.S.A.

Tel: (203) 865-1827

Fax: (203) 865-2857

E-mail: glittle.rag@OMSC.org

---

**October 1996 175**
World Mission

Rethink your understanding of mission. Prepare to work in other cultures or at the very edges of your own. Earn a degree or spend a productive sabbatical. Study with the imaginative and resourceful missionaries and missiologists on Catholic Theological Union’s faculty.

Claude-Marie Barbour
Stephen Bevans, SVD
Eleanor Doighe, LoB
Gary Riebe-Estrella, SVD
Archimedes Fornasarit, MCCJ
Anthony Gittins, CSSp

John Kaserow, MM
James Okoye, CSSp
Jamie Phelps, OP
Ana Maria Pineda, RSM
Robert Schreiter, CppS
Roger Schroeder, SVD

CONTACT: Eleanor Doighe, LoB
5401 South Cornell Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60615 USA
312.753.5332 or FAX 312.324.4360

Catholic Theological Union
Member of the Chicago Center for Global Ministries

Learn Another Language on Your Own!

Learn to speak a foreign language fluently on your own and at your own pace with what are considered the finest in-depth courses available. Many were developed by the Foreign Service Institute of the U.S. Department of State for diplomatic personnel who must learn a language quickly and thoroughly. Emphasis is on learning to speak and to understand the spoken language. A typical course (equivalent to a college semester) includes an album of 10 to 12 audio-cassettes (10 to 18 hours), recorded by native-born speakers, plus a 250-page textbook. Some of our courses:

- Arabic, Saudi $185
- German I $185
- Egyptian $185
- Bulgarian $245
- Cantonese $185
- Catalan $185
- Czech $125
- Danish $135
- Dutch $125
- Estonian $295
- French I $185
- French II $215
- Hungarian $195
- Italian $185
- Japanese $185
- Khmer $225
- Korean $195
- Romanian $115
- Russian $225
- Slovak $185
- Swahili $225
- Swedish $185
- Tagalog $225
- Thai $225
- Turkish $225
- Ukrainian $195
- Urdu $185
- Vietnamese $225

You can order now with a full 3-week money-back guarantee.

Call toll-free 1-800-243-1234, fax (203) 453-9774, e-mail 74537.550@compuuserve.com

Or clip this ad and send with your name and address and a check or money order—or charge to any major credit card, by enclosing card number, expiration date, and your signature. Ask for our free 36-page Whole World Language Catalog with courses in 96 languages. Our 25th year.

―Lamin Sanneh

Lamin Sanneh, a contributing editor, is the D. Wilks James Professor of Missions and World Christianity at Yale Divinity School, New Haven, Connecticut.

---

Africa were spared the "trail of tears" that the West had elsewhere reserved for the indigenes, as with the native Indians of North and South America.

In the third period described by Hastings, the period from 1890 to 1960, the period that was phase 2 of missions in Africa, we come upon what might be called the signature tune of African Christianity, namely, the rise and proliferation of African Independent Churches led by charismatic religious figures noted for their appeal to dreams, prayer, and healing. Independence, as the phenomenon is known, was the African response to Christianity, first, to its excessive European political and cultural baggage, and, second, to the creative stimulus of the African environment itself. In its political temper, independence splintered off into varieties of "Ethiopianism," that is, into forms of protest defined by racial and political concerns. In its essentially religious temper, independence assumed the tones and color of "Zionism," that is, charismatic and revivalist expressions that show considerable continuity and overlap with African religions and by virtue of which Christianity was transformed radically into an African religion.

Given Hastings's perspective on Christianity, one could say the central issue for Africa is in the nature of the transition from a territorial, Scholastic church of the medieval period to evangelical, voluntarist forms of the religion, from the concordat approach to mission to independence and lay agency. What emerged subsequently in African Christianity as its hallmark may be described as its Christological emphasis, or at any rate its uncommon devotion to the Jesus of Scripture and history, rather than the cosmic Christ of Scholastic theology.

Hastings's book is a confident, self-assured presentation of the subject and of the enormous literature that has grown especially since about 1960. Anyone who seeks guidance on the broad, general course of Christianity in modern Africa cannot go far wrong in looking to the book. There is, however, an irony in the fact that, priced at $110 with no African concession, the book is a virtual intellectual no-go area for Africans, although the availability in Africa itself of similar but far less expensive continent-wide studies should mitigate the problem of Africa's disfranchisement from accounts of its own heritage.

―Lamin Sanneh
Mission and Democracy in Africa:
The Role of the Church.


At the time of writing, Aboagye-Mensah was director of research for the Christian Council of Ghana, which, after the ban on political activity in Ghana was lifted in the early 1990s, set up a project called The Church, Ecumenism, and Democracy. The project was intended to provide political education for Christians with a view to facilitating a democratic culture in Ghana. The council, in probably the finest such project on the whole continent, has produced considerable impressive material, and this book maintains the standard of excellence.

Mission and Democracy in Africa is written clearly and simply, pitched at the level of an intelligent layperson. It is firmly rooted in Ghanaian—even Akan—history and culture, although this should not be taken to mean that the book has no relevance outside Ghana. The author's treatment of Akan traditional society shows that there were great elements of popular participation within African society. The people were consulted, played a great part in choosing their own leaders, could criticize and contribute suggestions, and could even depose a leader not governing justly. A drawback in traditional societies, however, was the lack of individual freedom. The author argues that here the impact of missionary Christianity was manifestly beneficial, for it fostered the individual's independence.

Aboagye-Mensah goes on to argue that the communal values of Africa's traditional societies must ensure that Africa's struggling democracies avoid the excessive individualism of Western democracies. He confronts squarely the question of ethnocentrism, which has bedeviled African politics for so long. He finally treats the role of Christian virtues (like justice, temperance, courage, wisdom, and above all love) in building up a democratic society. At each step of the argument the author uses examples from across the continent, both historical and contemporary, and is strong in biblical warrants. Most of his emphasis is on the personal contribution of a Christian.

Aboagye-Mensah does not raise the issue of "civil society"—the institutions between the family and the state—terms of which so much of the debate about democratization is conducted today. This is perhaps a lack. The church, as the greatest single element within civil society in most sub-Saharan countries, could make a great contribution here, inculcating democratic virtues, through ensuring that its own structures and leadership are fully democratic.

The author wrote the book as a visiting scholar at the Overseas Ministries Study Center in New Haven, Connecticut. It will be of considerable value to all African Christians promoting more just and democratic societies.

—Paul Gifford

Paul Gifford is Leverhulme Research Fellow, Department of Theology and Religious Studies, the University of Leeds, England. A New Zealander, he conducted research for the All Africa Conference of Churches, 1989-92.

APPLICATIONS INVITED FOR RESEARCH GRANTS IN MISSION AND WORLD CHRISTIANITY

The Overseas Ministries Study Center, New Haven, Connecticut, U.S.A., administers the Research Enablement Program for the advancement of scholarship in studies of Christian Mission and Christianity in Asia, Africa, Latin America, and Oceania. Grants will be awarded on a competitive basis in the following categories:

- Postdoctoral book research and writing projects
- Field research for doctoral dissertations
- Small-scale missiological consultations
- Planning grants for major interdisciplinary research projects

The Research Enablement Program is designed to foster scholarship that will contribute to the intellectual vitality of the Christian world mission and enhance the worldwide understanding of the Christian movement in the non-Western world. Projects that are cross-cultural, collaborative, and interdisciplinary are especially welcome. The deadline for receiving 1997 grant applications is November 28, 1996. For further information and official application forms please contact:

Geoffrey A. Little, Coordinator
Research Enablement Program
Overseas Ministries Study Center
490 Prospect Street
New Haven, Connecticut 06511-2196, U.S.A.
Tel: (203) 865-1827
Fax: (203) 865-2857
E-mail: glittle.rep@OMSC.org

This program is supported by a grant from The Pew Charitable Trusts.


This volume brings together not only the statement of the meeting of North American Catholics and evangelicals held in September 1992 but also elaborates some of the main issues raised. Charles Colson, an evangelical, and Richard Neuhaus, a Catholic, both felt it was necessary for Catholics and evangelicals to come together to discuss some of their common concerns: cooperation in prison ministry, pro-life issues, the charismatic renewal, and the conflicts surrounding evangelization in Latin America.

In the essays included, Charles Colson treats of the influence of the Enlightenment on American religious life. George Weigel discusses the effect of various Supreme Court decisions as imposing a government-enforced secularism on American public life. Mark Noll describes the historical and religious standoff between evangelicals and Catholics from the Reformation to the end of World War II and the dramatic shift that occurred after that time. Avery Dulles expresses the view that of the six models of unity he summarizes, that of spiritual ecumenism and solidarity in action would seem the most appropriate. J. I. Packer attempts to dispel some of the concerns expressed by evangelicals and lays out the basic tenets of evangelical belief. In the final essay Richard Neuhaus details the theological convergences and differences surrounding the doctrine of justification.

If a future meeting is envisioned, it would seem necessary to include some of the issues that have not been treated. First, while the emphasis on the issue of abortion is important, it should occasion a wider discussion of the cluster of pro-life issues. Second, there is a need to examine in greater depth the problem of proselytism. Third, this initiative should be related to the work that has gone before. One looks in vain for a reference to The Evangelical–Roman Catholic Dialogue on Mission, 1977–1984, edited by Basil Meeking and John Stott (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1986). Finally, Catholics—and indeed some evangelicals—may be uneasy with some of the negative references to the wider ecumenical movement. One may wonder if the minimizing of the proselytism—and indeed some evangelicals—may feel it is too high a price to pay.

—Joan Delaney, M.M.

Joan Delaney, M.M., was the Catholic consultant on mission at the World Council of Churches, Geneva, from 1984 to 1990.

Ferdinand Verbiest (1623–1688): Jesuit Missionary, Scientist, Engineer, and Diplomat.


Ferdinand Verbiest was one of the most prominent Jesuit missionaries who served in seventeenth-century China, and yet his exact claim to greatness has remained ambiguous. He was clearly not a seminal figure in the mission in the manner of M. Ricci, nor did he possess the charismatic presence of his predecessor in the mathematical sciences, A. Schall. His thinking did not have the creative force of J. Bouvet, nor did he master Chinese texts in the manner of J. de Prémare. In order to better define Verbiest’s achievements, thirty scholars from fourteen countries were invited to a symposium held in Louvain on September 12–16, 1988, to celebrate the three-hundredth anniversary of Verbiest’s death. The results of that symposium are published in this collection, although an unfortunate six-year delay in publication has dented some of the articles.

The collection is divided into six topics: (1) Verbiest in Europe, (2) scientist, (3) engineer, (4) diplomat, (5) missionary, and (6) impact in China and Europe. Since the range of Verbiest’s work makes him a difficult figure to assess, the symposium’s approach is probably well suited to encompassing this breadth, particularly in its more technical aspects. And yet the effort is not as successful as it might have been because of an editorial failure to
summarize the central issues presented in these articles and to organize them in a manner that effectively elucidates these issues. The reader is not presented with any editorial clarification of what is surely one of the most important questions treated in this collection, namely, Was Verbiest a man who seriously combined the roles of missionary and scientist? Or was he essentially a missionary who used science only to advance Christianity in China, much like Ricci used mnemonic techniques to interest the Chinese literati in this foreign religion?

The article by Professor U. Libbrecht, the former chairholder in Chinese studies at the University of Louvain and former director of the Ferdinand Verbiest Project, leads the charge in debunking "the romanticized image of Verbiest [that] was created in the West" (p. 55). Libbrecht argues that for Verbiest "science was only a vehicle for religion" (p. 59) and that he should be regarded foremost as a missionary rather than a scientist (p. 64). Libbrecht's arguments are not flawless; they appear to be based on dated research, and his is the only contribution among the thirty-one in this collection that lacks any footnote documentation of his sources. Libbrecht's criticisms of Verbiest are not new, and the other articles in this collection effectively rebut several (though not all) of them.

In contrast to the editorial weaknesses in the organization and commentary, the more technical editorial tasks have been well handled by J. W. Witek, whose meticulousness as a scholar is well known. The book is handsomely produced and bound with sixty-nine illustrations and an index containing a Chinese character glossary. In sum, this collection enlightens us on some of the complexities of an eminent seventeenth-century European missionary to China while falling short in resolving the question of whether Verbiest belongs to the first rank of early China Jesuits.

—D. E. Mungello

D. E. Mungello is Associate Professor of History and Director of Asian Studies, Baylor University, Waco, Texas.
Christians were involved in the proclamation.

Given the author's assumptions about Pauline authorship, the texts chosen are probably as good as one can do. First Corinthians 8:1–11:1 is the most apt, but it still falls short of being a mandate to preach. The exegesis is responsible, without quite answering the author's questions. One might have expected eschatology to have been more of a factor in Paul's and his churches' thinking on mission than would appear from this book. The book is clearly written and could prove useful in study groups.

—Abraham J. Malherbe


De uitzaging van Vaticanum II in Oost-Afrika is volume 30 in the series Church and Theology in Context by the Catholic University of Nijmegen in the Netherlands. Two other volumes by de Jong—a Holy Ghost father presently professor in church history in Tanzania—were entitled Missie en politiek in Oostelijk Afrika (Mission and politics in Eastern Africa) and De missionaire opleiding van de Nederlandse missionarissen (The missionary training of Dutch missionaries).

While most studies on the reception of Vatican II are generalizing, this one is extraordinarily concrete, mentioning in detail persons and experiments that otherwise might be easily forgotten.

During 1965–75, an average of 1,046 Dutch Catholic missionaries were active in the countries studied (Tanzania, Kenya, Uganda, and Malawi). The study is so detailed because it profited from an initiative called KomMissie Memoires of the Dutch Catholic Mission Council to interview Dutch missionaries systematically, gathering the data as oral history. De Jong refers to 70 of those interviews besides the 900 written works documented in his bibliography. The author describes the pre-Vatican II development among them from a sometimes total condemnation of African religion to their later policies of translation, substitution, assimilation, and finally christening. A gradual inculturation process was vindicated by the Vatican II outcome, though initially only comprehensively continued by an indigenizing church, in which missionaries often became pastoral auxiliaries, having lost their original calling.

—J. G. Donders, M.Afr.

J. G. Donders, formerly chairman of the Department of Philosophy, University of Nairobi, is presently Chair of Mission and Crosscultural Studies, Washington Theological Union, Washington, D.C. He is a Dutch member of the Missionaries of Africa.

Regnum Books International
Publishing Resources on Church Mission From Global Perspectives

JUNE RELEASE

Douglas Petersen, Ph.D.
Not By Might Nor By Power: A Pentecostal Theology of Social Concern in Latin America

People often suppose Pentecostals bereft either of an articulate theology or social concern. This readable and scholarly book, focused on Latin American Pentecostalism, shows the presence of both. Dr. Petersen is himself one of the Pentecostal leaders able and ready to be a partner in debate.

Pentecostals originally found their voices and so announced their existence in the worship of their own assemblies. But now they are also reflecting on who they are, what their standpoint is, what they have achieved and where they hope to go. Dr. Petersen shows that Pentecostalism has long and essentially indigenous roots and knows just how it seeks personal empowerment and social betterment.

David Martin
Emeritus Professor of Sociology
London School of Economics, London University

Regnum Books International will make available to North America the best of Regnum Books International Oxford, England, including:

- Philip Sampson, Vinay Samuel and Chris Sugden, eds., Faith and Modernity
- Klaus Fiedler, The Story of Faith Missions
- Kwame Bedaiako, Theology and Identity

Regnum Books International
17951 Cowan, #101 • Irvine, CA 92714 • USA
phone 714-752-1392 • fax 714-752-1393

180 INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN OF MISSIONARY RESEARCH
The Unique Christ in Our Pluralist World.


These twenty-two collected essays, originally given in Manila at the 1992 gathering of the World Evangelical Fellowship, provide insight into the state, quality, and diversity of evangelical theological reflection on the subject of the uniqueness of Christ and the implications of this belief for several contemporary issues.

The chapters are a rich mosaic of the varied but generally harmonious ways evangelicals understand and legitimate Christological uniqueness. The first four essays interact vigorously with the theological inadequacies of religious pluralism, such as that of Professors Hick and Knitter. More than one author sounds a call for evangelicals to do a better job of articulating an evangelical theology of religion, though the essays do not seem to advance that cause in substantive ways.

Two sets of three chapters each take up the topics of the challenge of modernity and the difficulties evangelicals have with godless political ideologies. In the context of modern theories of knowledge, Miroslav Volf offers a challenge to evangelicals to rethink the myth of epistemological certitude and calls for them to acknowledge that the “peregrine nature of Christian existence implies the provisional nature of Christian knowledge” (p. 104). The WEF “Manila Declaration,” presented at the beginning of the book, seems to partly adopt this position when it states: “As proclaimers of the gospel, we claim only a provisional certainty” (p. 20). It is worth following the tension between this and the more absolutist position of some other essayists.

Two essays deal with tension between the poles of church unity and diversity in the context of discussing classical and contemporary Christological understanding. The four essays on peace and justice reflect on the role evangelicals should play in applying ideals about Christ’s uniqueness in the real world of human hurts and suffering.

The final essays include reflections on an evangelical vision of the future under the title “The Unique Christ as the Hope and Judge of the World.” Primacy is given to a unique, incarnate, and resurrected Christ attested to by history who brings universal hope but also justice for all in the eschaton.

Most essays are supported with helpful footnotes, which are useful to the reader who desires to assemble a bibliography of materials for further study. One might have wished that the editors would have arranged a more intentionally dialogic format to bring out the variety of positions taken by evangelicals today. Even so, the book is good reading for any who desire to sample the theology of evangelicals from around the world.

—James P. Lewis

“Christian theology proceeds from the central conviction that the kingdom of God is known in and through Jesus. In this accessible, clear consideration, Paul Rowntree Clifford suggests how that conviction may be sustained both in reading the gospels and in engaging the world around us. He shows out of a wealth of experience that the inherent paradox of the kingdom, once understood, becomes a resource of strength in our human relationships and of hope in our approach to God.”

—BRUCE CHILTON

“The Reality of the Kingdom

Making Sense of God’s Reign in a World Like Ours

PAUL ROWNTREE CLIFFORD

“This may prove to be the most important and interesting book of the decade on helping us to understand how the kingdom of God relates to our secular world.”

—GERALD H. ANDERSON

ISBN 0-8028-0867-0
• 141 pages
• Paperback
• $12.00

Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co.
255 Jefferson Ave. S.E. / Grand Rapids, MI 49503

At your bookstore, or call 800-253-7521
FAX 616-459-6540

James F. Lewis is Associate Professor of World Religions at Wheaton College and Graduate School in Wheaton, Illinois. Formerly he served as a missionary with the Christian and Missionary Alliance in Vietnam (1967–70) and professor of Religions at Union Biblical Seminary in Pune, India (1977–81).
ARTICLES

Abineno, Johannes [Ludwig Chrysostomus], [Obituary], 19:117.
Adney, David [Obituary], 18:157.
Amu, Ephriam [Obituary], 19:67.
Annual Statistical Table on Global Mission, 1994, by David B. Barrett, 18:24-25.
Author’s Reply [to H. L. Richard], by Susan Billington Harper, 19:174-175.
Broomhall, Anthony James [Obituary], 20:100.
Can a House Divided Stand? Reflections on Christian-Muslim Encounter in the West, by Lamin Sanneh, 17:164-68.
The Crusade or Catastrophe? The Student Missions Movement and the First World War, by Nathan D. Showalter, 17:13-17.
The Drum, the Church, and the Camera: Ham Mukasa and C. W. Hattersley in Uganda, by Terry Barringer, 20:66-70.
Ecumenical Amnesia, by Lesslie Newbigin, 18:2-5.
The Enigmatic Patriarch of the Kingdom of Bamum, by Paul Jenkins, 19:107-109.
Enklaar, Ido H. [Obituary], 19:117.
Ferrin, Howard W. [Obituary], 17:75.
Forman, Charles W. [80th birthday greetings], 20:162.
From the Evangelical Alliance to the World Evangelical Fellowship: 150 Years of Unity with a Mission, by W. Harold Fuller, 20:160-162.
Gensichen, Hans-Werner [80th birthday greetings], 19:28.
Goff, James E. [Obituary], 19:67.
Guinness, Henry W. [Obituary], 20:100.
Historical Archives in Chinese Christian Colleges from Before 1949, by Peter Tze Ming Ng, 20:106-108.
Hockin, Katherine B. [Obituary], 18:18.
Hunt, Everett N., Jr. [Obituary], 20:100.
Jansen Schoonhoven, Evert [Obituary], 19:117.
The Legacy of Donald Fraser, by Jack Thompson, 18:32-35.
The Legacy of J. C. Hoekendijk, by Libertus A. Hoedemaker, 16:166-170.

Prepositions and Salvation, by Kenneth Cragg, 17.2-3.

Proselitysm, Mission, and the Bible, by Eugene P. Heideman, 20:10-12.

Protestant Theological Education in the Former Soviet Union, by Mark Elliott, 18:14-22.


Readers’ Response [to David Barrett], by Arden G. Sanders, 20:60-61.

Readers’ Response [to Susan Billington Harper], by H. L. Richard, 19:174-175.


Reply to Konrad Raiser, by Leslie Newbiggin, 18:51-52.

Research Enablement Program Grant Awards for 1992, 17:74-75.


Rycroft, W. Stanley [Obituary], 18:75.

Scotchmer, David G. [Obituary], 19:67.


The Student Foreign Missions Fellowship over Fifty-Five Years, by H. Wilbert Norton, Sr., 17:17-21.


Stuhlmueller, Carroll, C.F. [Obituary], 18:75.

Sundkler, Bengt [Obituary], 19:117.

Themes of Pentecostal Expansion in Latin America, by Karl-Wilhelm Westmeier, 17:72-78.

Toward a Global Church History, by Wilbert R. Shenk, 20:50-57.


van der Linde, Jan Marinus [Obituary], 19:150.

Watanabe, Sadao [Obituary], 20:100.

Wodarz, Donald M. [Obituary], 19:28.


CONTRIBUTORS OF ARTICLES


Allen, Catherine B.—The Legacy of Lottie Moon, 17:146-52.


—Annual Statistical Table on Global Mission, 1994, 18:24-25.


Barringer, Terry—The Drum, the Church, and the Camera: Ham Mukasa and C.W. Hattersley in Uganda, 20:66-70.


Stuhlmueller, Carroll, C.P. [Obituary], 18:75.

Wodarz, Donald M. [Obituary], 19:28.


October 1996
Elliott, Mark--Protestant Theological Education in the Former Soviet Union, 18:14-22.

Fuller, W. Harold—From the Evangelical Alliance to the World Evangelical Fellowship: 150 Years of Unity with Mission, 20:160-162.

Harper, Susan Billington—Author's Reply [to H. L. Richard], 19:174-175.


 ___ The Enigmatic Patriarch of the Kingdom of Bamum, 19:107-109.


Newbigin, Lesslie—Ecumenical Amnesia, 18:2-5.
Ng, Peter Tze Ming—Historical Archives in Chinese Christian Colleges from Before 1949, 20:106-108.

Norton, H. Wilbert, Sr.—The Student Foreign Missions Fellowship over Fifty-Five Years, 17:17-21.
Pickering, Carol—Murray T. Titus: Missionary and Islamic Scholar, 19:118-120.

Sanders, Arden G.—Readers' Response [to David Barrett], 20:60-61.
Sanneh, Lamin—Can a House Divided Stand? Reflections on Christian-Muslim Encounter in the West, 17:164-68.
__ The Legacy of Lars Peter Larsen, 18:119-125.
__ The Legacy of Claudius Buchanan, 18:78-84.
__ Toward a Global Church History, 20:50-57.
Showalter, Nathan D.—Crusade or Catastrophe? The Student Missions Movement and the First World War, 17:13-17.
__ Reply to Clifton Kirkpatrick, 19:105-106.
Smith, A. Christopher—Mission Research and the Path to CD-ROM: Report on the Global Quest to Share Information, 19:146-152.
Thompson, Jack—The Legacy of Donald Fraser, 18:32-35.
__ Reply to Clifton Kirkpatrick, 19:105-106.
Von Oeyen, Robert R., Jr.—Readers' Response [to Stanley H.Skreslet], 20:60.
Westmeier, Karl-Wilhelm—Themes of Pentecostal Expansion in Latin America, 17:72-78.
Winter, Ralph D.—My Pilgrimage in Mission, 19:56-60.

BOOKS REVIEWED

Anderson, Gerald H., Robert T. Coote, and James M. Phillips, eds.—Mission in the 1990s, 17:79.

INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN OF MISSIONARY RESEARCH
Larom, Margaret S., ed.--Claiming the Promise: African Churches Speak, 19:141.
LaVerdie, Eugene, ed.--A Church for All Peoples: Missionary Issues in a World Church, 19:38.
Mariz, Cecilia Lorero--Coping with Poverty: Pentecostals and Christian Base Communities in Brazil, 19:82-83.
Marley, Emmanuel--African Theology: Inculturation and Liberation, 18:139-140.
McAlpine, Thomas H., Facing the Powers, 18:45.
Moran, Gabriel--Uniqueness: Problem or Paradox in Jewish and Christian Traditions, 17:185.
Morrison, Dane--A Praying People: Massachusetts Acculturation and the Failure of the Puritan Mission, 1600-1800, 20:138-139.
Morse, Merrill--Kosuke Koyama: A Model for Intercultural Theology, 17:140-41.
Ogden, Schubert M.--Is There Only One True Religion or Are There Many? 17:135-36.
Pierson, Paul, Charles Van Engen, and Dean S. Gilliland, eds.--The Good News of the Kingdom, 18:86-87.
Pope-Levison, Priscilla, and John R. Levison--Jesus in Global Contexts, 18:42-43.
Powell, Avril Ann--Muslims and Missionaries in Pre-Mutiny India, 20:43-44.
Professors of the Pontifical Urban University (Rome)--Dizionario di Missiologia, 19:85.
Ranger, Terence--Are We Not Also Men? The Samkange Family and African Politics in Zimbabwe, 1920-64, 20:140.
Renck, Gunther--Contextualization of Christianity and Christianization of Language: A Case Study from the Highlands of Papua New Guinea, 17:87-88.
Riggans, Walter--Yeshua Ben David: Why Do the Jewish People Reject Jesus as Their Messiah? 20:133-134.
FACULTY POSITION
Evangelism and Global Mission
Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary is seeking a faculty member to teach in the areas of evangelism and global mission. This person will occupy the William A. Friend Professorship of Evangelism and Global Mission.

Applicants should have a Ph.D. or comparable degree in missionology or another appropriate field of theological study. Applications will also be considered from degree candidates who are in the final stages of their work. Application from women and from racially/ethnically candidates are especially encouraged.

This person will be expected to teach M.Div., M.A., M.A.C.E., M.A.M.E.T., Th.M., and D.Min. students. This faculty member should be able to relate the history and theology of evangelism and global mission to contemporary issues confronting the church’s witness in the United States and other parts of the world. Parish experience in this country or in other countries is strongly desirable.

This person should have a strong interest in preparing candidates for the Christian ministry. This person should be committed to helping students understand the church’s evangelical and ecumenical calling and to relating evangelism and global mission with other areas of the theology curriculum.

Rank is negotiable on the basis of experience; appointment will begin in the fall of 1997.

Louisville Seminary follows EEO guidelines and affirmative action procedures. Send dossiers and a list of references to President John M. Mulder, 1044 Alta Vista Road, Louisville, KY 40205-1798.


LOUISVILLE SEMINARY

MARYKNOLL LANGUAGE INSTITUTE
RESPONDING TO THE CHALLENGES OF MISSION IN THE 90s

The basic aim of the Maryknoll Language Institute is to assist Church personnel in the acquisition of communicative proficiency in language skills in the context of mission.

- Basic Courses: Spanish, Quechua, Aymara
- Intermediate/Advanced Courses: 6 weeks six times a year
- On-going Orientation Program: Pastoral vision of Church documents of CELAM: Latin American history, culture, basic Christian communities; role of women in Latin America.
- Rich Liturgical Life.
- Pastoral Theological Reflection Groups; pastoral situations; involvement with local people; orphans, street children, homeless women in Cochabamba.

LOCATION: COCHABAMBA, BOLIVIA IN THE HEART OF LATIN AMERICA

For further information and a brochure write to:
Registrar
Instituto de Idiomas
Casilla S50
Cochabamba, BOLIVIA
Tel. (011) 591-42-4152
Fax (011) 591-42-41187
FOUNDATIONS OF MISSION III: CULTURE AND MISSION

US CATHOLIC MISSION ASSOCIATION

ANNUAL CONFERENCE

OCTOBER 25-27, 1996

EXECUTIVE TOWER INN

DENVER, CO


For more information, contact:

USCMCA

3029 Fourth Street NE

Washington DC 20017-4040

Tel. 202-832-3112 FAX: 202-832-3688

DOCTORAL DISSERTATIONS


BOOK NOTES


Now you can visit OMSC on the World Wide Web!

http://www.OMSC.org

- Our 1996-97 Study Program
- International Bulletin of Missionary Research
- Doane Missionary Scholarships
- Senior Mission Scholars

Overseas Ministries Study Center

490 Prospect St., New Haven, CT 06511

190 INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN OF MISSIONARY RESEARCH
We’re Glad We Came to OMSC

Sign up for these 1997 OMSC Study Seminars!

Ted Ward  
Cultural and Biblical Issues in Leadership Education. How to gain credibility as cross-cultural educators of indigenous church leaders. Cosponsored by MAP International and Mennonite Board of Missions. Eight sessions. $95.

Peter Kuzmic  
Christian Mission in Eastern Europe. Guidelines for Western workers. Cosponsored by Mennonite Central Committee and World Evangelical Fellowship. Eight sessions. $95

José Miguez Bonino  
Memory and Destiny: Prospects for Protestantism in Latin America. Cosponsored by United Methodist Board of Global Ministries. Concludes Thurs. Eight sessions. $95

David A. Kerr  

Duane Elmer  
Conflict Resolution: When Relationships are Tested in Cross-Cultural Mission. A workshop to strengthen interpersonal skills. Cosponsored by Samford University Global Center, Southern Baptist Woman’s Missionary Union, and World Relief International. Seven sessions. $95

Paul Hiebert  
Evangelization Today: Distinctions Between Tribal, Peasant, and Urban Societies. Anthropological insights for mission. Cosponsored by Eastern Mennonite Board of Missions, Mennonite Central Committee, and Wycliffe Bible Translators. Eight sessions. $95

Stephen B. Bevans  
The Unforeseen Challenges of Inculturation. The spiritual and personal implications for missionaries. Cosponsored by Maryknoll Mission Institute, at Maryknoll, NY. Eight sessions. $120

Saphir Athyal  
Asian Christian Leadership Training Amid Religious Pluralism. Leadership training in a pluralistic world. Eight sessions. $95

Tom Houston  
The Effects of Globalization on Christian Mission. OMSC Senior Mission Scholar and Lausanne Minister-at-Large explores strategies for evangelizing in today’s urban metropolises. Cosponsored by Church of the Nazarene, World Mission Division. Eight sessions. $95

Adrian Hastings  
The Africanization of Christianity Today. Case studies reveal the unique character of African Christianity. Eight sessions. $95

Tite Tiênoú  
Theology and Mission in the African Church. The role of African Christians in theological studies and mission outreach. Cosponsored by Africa Inland Mission International and SIM International. Eight sessions. $95

Attend both seminars on Africa, April 14-25, for $130.

Special Workshops


May 5-7: David E. Schroeder—Strategic Planning for Effective Mission. How to prepare for new mission outreach. Cosponsored by Latin America Mission. Four sessions. $75

May 7-9: Rob Martin—How to Write Grant Proposals. Helps you develop effective funding proposals for overseas mission projects. Cosponsored by Latin America Mission. Four sessions. $75

Attend May 1-9, $175; May 5-9, $110.

May 12-16: Missions and Leadership in Latin America. In Quito, Ecuador. $75. For more information, tel: 593-2-452373; fax: 593-2-455500; e-mail: map@map.ecx.ec

Send me more information about these seminars:

NAME

ADDRESS

Overseas Ministries Study Center  
490 Prospect St., New Haven, CT 06511  
Tel (203) 624-6672 Fax (203) 865-2857  
E-mail: studyprogram@OMSC.org  Website: http://www.OMSC.org

Publishers of the INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN OF MISSIONARY RESEARCH
Book Notes

Bowen, Roger

Boyd, Robert.
People of the Dalles: The Indians of Wascopam Mission. A Historical
Ethnography Based on the Papers of Methodist Missionaries.

Clifford, Paul Rowntree.
The Reality of the Kingdom: Making Sense of God’s Reign in a World like Ours.

Froise, Marjorie, ed.

Fyfe, Christopher, and Andrew Walls, eds.
Christianity in Africa in the 1990s.
No price given.

Isasi-Díaz, Ada María, and Fernando F. Segovia, eds.
Hispanic/Latino Theology: Challenge and Promise.

Mundt, William F.
Sinners Directed to the Saviour: The Religious Tract Society Movement in
Germany (1811–1848).

Peelman, Achiel.
Christ Is a Native American.

Samartha, Stanley J.
Between Two Cultures: Ecumenical Ministry in a Pluralist World.

Seaman, Paul Asbury, et al.
Far Above the Plain: Private Profiles and Admissable Evidence from the First
Forty Years of Murree Christian School, Pakistan, 1956–1996.

Soulén, R. Kendall.
The God of Israel and Christian Theology.

Suggate, Alan.
Japanese Christians and Society.

Thornbury, John.
David Brainerd: Pioneer Missionary to the American Indians.

In Coming
Issues

Indigenous Christianity and the
Future of the Church in South
Africa
G. C. Oosthuizen

Jonathan Edwards: Missionary
Theologian and Advocate
Ronald E. Davies

World War I, the Western Allies,
and German Protestant Missions
Richard V. Pierard

The Building of the Protestant
Church in Shandong, China
Norman Cliff

German Centers of Mission
Research
Willi Henkel, O.M.I.

In our Series on the Legacy of
Outstanding Missionary Figures of
the Nineteenth and Twentieth
Centuries, articles about
Norman Anderson
Robert Arthington
Rowland V. Bingham
George Brown
Thomas Chalmers
John Considine, M.M.
François E. Daubanton
G. Sherwood Eddy
George Grenfell
Melvin Hodges
James Johnson
Adoniram Judson
Hannah Kilham
Johann Ludwig Krapf
Vincent Lebbe
James Legge
Robert Mackie
Jean de Menasce
Robert Morrison
Constance E. Padwick
Timothy Richard
Mary Josephine Rogers
William Cameron Townsend
Franz Michael Zahn