Mission Versus Parochialism

One of the most respected ecumenical leaders of our era, John Alexander Mackay, came to his worldwide service in mission out of a Scots Presbyterian home and church that exhibited at once both deep piety and petty parochialism. In this issue of the INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN Samuel Escobar traces the path by which Mackay’s commitment to mission overcame the parochialism of his formative years. In Mackay’s own words, “Christian churches who took seriously their missionary obligation and crossed the frontiers of non-Christian lands began to transcend the barriers by which they had been themselves divided in their own home countries.”

Mission-overcoming-parochialism is also evident in Louis J. Luzbetak’s “My Pilgrimage in Mission.” In his case, it was anthropology that provided the doorway: “My mind was made up; I would now work with other like-minded Christian anthropologists and missiologists, whatever their tradition.” Even before ecumenical cooperation was widely encouraged, Luzbetak gave lectures to Lutheran missionaries in Chicago, to a “definitely motley group” at Stony Point, New York, and to evangelicals at Fuller Theological Seminary as church growth lecturer, “the first Roman Catholic to be so honored.”

A new vehicle that will contribute to the advance of mission over parochialism is introduced in this issue. “New Directions in Mission and Evangelization” is a series of important missiological studies and documents published by Orbis Books. Stephen Bevans and James A. Scherer offer BULLETIN readers an introduction to the series and to the first volume, New Directions in Mission and Evangelization 1: Basic Statements, 1974-1991.

As Bevans and Scherer point out, “New Directions” succeeds an earlier series well known to the mission community: “Mission Trends,” edited by Gerald H. Anderson and Thomas F. Stranksy. As “Mission Trends” covered the period from the late 1960s into the 1980s, “New Directions” will take us through the 1990s.

New Directions 1 provides the formal foundation documents of the conciliar, Roman Catholic, Orthodox, and Protestant evangelical communities, beginning with the Lausanne Covenant of 1974.

All followers of “New Directions” may discover support for a spiritual pilgrimage from parochialism to mission that leads to Christ’s coming kingdom.

On Page

98 Mission Statements: How They Are Developed and What They Tell Us
Stephen B. Bevans, S.V.D. and James A. Scherer

105 Wilfred Cantwell Smith and Kenneth Cragg on Islam as a Way of Salvation
Richard J. Jones

108 Noteworthy

110 Where Is It? A New Index to Non-Western Christian Literature
Douglas W. Geyer and Sharon Vlahovich

116 The Legacy of John Alexander Mackay
Samuel Escobar

124 My Pilgrimage in Mission
Louis J. Luzbetak, S.V.D.

130 Messianic Judaism: A Case of Identity Denied
Walter Riggans

133 Book Reviews

142 Dissertation Notices

144 Book Notes
Mission Statements: How They Are Developed and What They Tell Us

Stephen B. Bevans, S.V.D., and James A. Scherer

Official mission statements are produced by church and associational bodies to provide guidance and challenge to the Christian community. While admittedly not always the most inspiring reading, they nevertheless help to clarify the mission task and goals at the time or for the occasion on which they were formulated. Naturally they are dated and may quickly become outdated. Even then they continue to be of considerable historical interest, as they enable scholars and students of missiology to trace the continuity and changes in the theology of mission over the decades. Therefore we believe the mission community will welcome the newly released volume New Directions in Mission and Evangelization 1: Basic Statements 1974-1991.

This publication brings together in one volume the most significant statements about mission and evangelization of the past two decades. It is the first in a series planned as a successor to the "Mission Trends" series which for some years made available low-cost collections of reprints of important missiological literature. Subsequent numbers will deal with such subjects as missiological foundations and problems, Gospel and culture, theology of religion and interreligious dialogue, mission and social justice, and spirituality for mission.

Volume 1 with its collection of basic statements serves as a general introduction. The statements are grouped under four headings: Conciliar-Ecumenical, Roman Catholic, Eastern Orthodox, and Evangelical Protestant. Including an introductory essay, New Directions 1 runs to 350 pages.

In New Directions 1 we attempt to document the "emerging paradigm" of mission (as David Bosch has described it) and to demonstrate how it is reflected in the statements of each of the traditions surveyed. The earliest statement is the Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization's Lausanne Covenant (1974). The most recent are a Vatican statement entitled Dialogue and Proclamation and a message from the World Council of Churches' Seventh Assembly at Canberra (both 1991).

As a context and background for the statements included in this volume, we sketch briefly the origins and characteristics of missiological thought in the four traditions represented by these statements. Readers will be struck by the recurrence of key themes and the manner in which each of the four traditions attempts, in its own way, to deal with the momentous challenges of modernity.

Conciliar Ecumenical Missiology

The claim to be ecumenical is not the prerogative of any single church, denomination, or group of churches. Indeed, each of the four missionary traditions examined in this volume may rightly lay claim to being ecumenical in some sense. We use the term "conciliar ecumenical" to refer to the movement among churches and their related mission agencies that sees membership in organized church councils as the primary visible expression of Christian unity. These Christian communities and their agencies participate in the manifold activities of such councils—"faith and order" discussions, world service, relief and development activities, mission and evangelism coordination, advocacy of justice, peace, and human rights—as the best way to promote Christian unity and cooperation and to advance the purposes of God's reign. The World Council of Churches (WCC), organized in 1948, together with various national regional Christian councils, is a primary expression of this conciliar ecumenical movement. The WCC, with 317 member churches in all six continents, is "a fellowship of churches which confess the Lord Jesus Christ as God and Saviour according to the Scriptures and therefore seek to fulfill together their common calling to the glory of the one God, Father, Son, and Holy Spirit." This statement constitutes the basis for membership in the WCC and concisely explains the council's purpose.

Conciliar ecumenical missiology as expressed in WCC statements is in a real sense the lineal successor to the tradition of world mission conferences going back to the nineteenth century. But the Edinburgh World Missionary Conference (1910) became the prototype for other worldwide mission conferences that followed, organized under the auspices of the newly formed International Missionary Council (IMC, 1921). With the integration of the IMC into the World Council of Churches as its Commission on World Mission and Evangelism (CMWE) at the New Delhi Assembly (1961), it now fell to the CMWE to organize succeeding world mission conferences: Mexico City (1963), Bangkok (1973), Melbourne (1980), and San Antonio (1989). Our survey includes excerpts from the Melbourne and San Antonio world mission conferences, along with statements from the WCC Nairobi (1975), Vancouver (1983), and Canberra (1991) assemblies. We also include the very significant Ecumenical Affirmation: Mission and Evangelism (1982) and a few other specialized ecumenical reports. The message from the San Antonio CMWE Conference (1989) offers a synthesis of the emerging ecumenical paradigm with its balanced emphasis on spiritual and material
International Bulletin of Missionary Research


Published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Overseas Ministries Study Center
490 Prospect Street, New Haven, Connecticut 06511, U.S.A.
Telephone: (203) 624-6672
Fax: (203) 865-2857

Editor: Gerald H. Anderson
Associate Editor: James M. Phillips
Assistant Editor: Robert T. Coote

Contributing Editors
Catalino G. Arévalo, S.J. 
David B. Barrett 
Samuel Escobar 
Barbara Hendricks, M.M. 
Norman A. Horner 
Mary Motte, F.M.M. 
Leslie Newbigin 
C. René Padilla 
Dana L. Robert

Lamin Sanneh 
Wilbert R. Shenk 
Thomas F. Stransky, C.S.P. 
Charles R. Taber 
Ruth A. Tucker 
Desmond Tutu 
Anastasios Yannoulatos 
Andrew F. Walls

Books for review and correspondence regarding editorial matters should be addressed to the editors. Manuscripts unaccompanied by a self-addressed, stamped envelope (or international postal coupons) will not be returned.

Subscriptions: $18 for one year, $33 for two years, and $49 for three years, postpaid worldwide. Airmail delivery is $16 per year extra. Foreign subscribers should send payment by bank draft in U.S. funds on a U.S. bank or by international money order in U.S. funds. Individual copies are $6.00; bulk rates upon request. Correspondence regarding subscriptions and address changes should be sent to: International Bulletin of Missionary Research, Subscription Services Dept. IBM, P.O. Box 3000, Denville, New Jersey 07834, U.S.A.

Advertisements:
Ruth E. Taylor
11 Graffam Road, South Portland, Maine 04106, U.S.A.
Telephone: (207) 799-4387

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in:

Bibliografía Missionaria
Christian Periodical Index
Guide to People in Periodical Literature
Guide to Social Science and Religion in Periodical Literature
Missionalia
Religion and Theological Abstracts
Religion Index One: Periodicals

Opinions expressed in the International Bulletin are those of the authors and not necessarily of the Overseas Ministries Study Center.

Copyright © 1992 by Overseas Ministries Study Center. All rights reserved.

Second-class postage paid at New Haven, Connecticut.
POSTMASTER: Send address changes to International Bulletin of Missionary Research, Subscription Services Dept. IBM, P.O. Box 3000, Denville, New Jersey 07834, U.S.A.

ISSN 0272-6122

JULY 1992 99

Readers will be struck by the way in which each of the four Christian traditions attempts to deal with the challenges of modernity.

consultant to assist in the general work of CWME. In 1980, the document “Common Witness,” produced by the Joint Working Group of the Vatican Secretariat for Christian Unity and the CWME, was approved for publication. This joint statement articulates a theological and missiological rationale for closer missionary cooperation between Catholic and conciliar missions at the local level. In 1987, the CWME convened a consultation in Stuttgart, Germany, to deal with concerns of evangelicals within European member churches of the WCC. The report of the Stuttgart Consultation also appears in this volume. Such contacts and conversations have increased the level of trust and may in time help to foster greater unity and cooperation.

What kind of authority do conciliar statements on mission possess? The answer cannot be very precise. In 1948 the WCC was constituted as a council to serve its member churches, with power to act only in matters assigned to it by those churches. It cannot dictate to its member churches. No church is obliged to accept pronouncements of the WCC Central Committee or to endorse statements of WCC units. Statements issued at CWME conferences or by WCC assemblies are as a rule directed to WCC member churches and commended to them for study, inspiration, response, or action, rather than being directed by the council to the world. It is often said that ecumenical statements carry only as much authority as they are entitled to have by virtue of their intrinsic wisdom. Lacking any juridical authority, ecumenical statements must be essentially self-authenticating to carry any weight.
**Roman Catholic Missiology**

Before the Second Vatican Council, Roman Catholic thought on missionary activity was defined by the Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith (Propaganda Fide) and, in the twentieth century, by a number of mission encyclicals (Benedict XV's "Maximum Illud" [1919], Pius XII's "Evangelii Praecones" [1951] and "Fidei Donum" [1957], and John XXIII's "Principes Pastorum" [1959]). These encyclicals were influenced by two prominent Catholic missiological schools. The so-called German school, headed by Joseph Schmidlin, emphasized mission as preaching "Maximum Illud" [1919], Pius XII's "Evangelii Praecones" [1951] headed by Pierre Charles, emphasized mission as the "planting of the church" (plantatio ecclesiae), even in areas already Christian, as long as the institutional church was not yet firmly established.  

At the Second Vatican Council (1962-65), Catholic missiological thought was expressed primarily in the "Decree on Missionary Activity" (Ad Gentes [AG] 1965), but important missiological statements were made by the council's "Dogmatic Constitution on the Church" (Lumen Gentium [LG] 1964), its "Pastoral Constitution on the Church in the Modern World" (Gaudium et Spes [GS] 1965), the "Declaration on the Relation of the Church to Non-Christian Religions" (Nostra Aetate [NA] 1965), and the "Declaration on Religious Liberty" (Dignitatis Humanae [DH] 1965). From these decrees have emerged a number of themes that have marked missiological discussions in the last twenty-five years. The council spoke in several places of the sacramental nature of the church, by which it is both sign and instrument of universal salvation (LG, 1, 48; AG, 1). It also emphasized the church's essential missionary nature (AG, 2) and commitment to "the joy and hope, the grief and anguish of men and women of our time" (GS, 1) and of the world's transformation (GS, 29). Also emerging from the council was a more positive evaluation of other religious ways (LG, 9, 16; NA, 2-5) and a sympathetic treatment of unbelief (LG, 16; GS, 19-21; DH, 1).

Since Vatican II the Catholic missiological tradition has been officially articulated by papal statements, by various Roman congregations and commissions, and by statements and pastoral letters from various bishops' conferences. Paul VI's 1975 apostolic exhortation Evangelii Nuntiandi (EN) was the first papal document to deal with the issue of the liberating dimension of evangelization; it also contained a strong statement about the interrelation of faith and culture (EN, 20, 63). Both of these emphases—liberation and what has come to be called inculturation—have become recurring themes in official Catholic teaching. Pope John Paul II's most recent missionary encyclical, Redemptoris Missio (RM) [1990], also reflects on these themes, although in a somewhat more cautious way.

The tradition of a strong "teaching office" (magisterium) in the Catholic church has its roots in the practice of the various ecumenical councils (e.g., Nicea, in 325) of issuing authoritative decrees, but since the late eighteenth century the power and prestige of the magisterium, particularly that of the pope, has grown considerably. Especially since the pontificate of Pius IX (1846-78), the popes and the various Roman curial offices have published many official documents, and it has become important to note the classification of a statement when it is published in order to know the level of authority that it expresses and the degree of assent that it requires.

An encyclical is a statement of very high authority issued by the pope. Originally the encyclical was written as a letter to Catholic bishops throughout the world, with the intention that its contents should be disseminated among Catholics in their respective dioceses. Since John XXIII (1958-63), however, it has been the practice to address encyclicals to "all people of good will" as well. Such statements possess the highest magisterial authority.

Especially during the pontificate of Paul VI (1963-78), another form of papal document came into prominence: the apostolic exhortation. This is a document that is a bit less formal than an encyclical but nevertheless carries a great deal of weight. In addition to these papal actions, a number of Vatican offices regularly publish official documents as well, and these are often given express approval by the pope. For example, the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith has published several mission-related documents in the last several years, such as its "Instruction on Christian Freedom and Liberation." As a magisterial document, it calls for high respect, but its authority is considerably less than one issued by the pope himself. Finally, the Vatican has set up a number of quasi-magisterial commissions, among which is the International Theological Commission, whose statement "Faith and Inculturation" was published in 1988. This is clearly an unofficial document, but it takes its authority from the fact that it was published by theologians who were all appointed to the commission by the Vatican.

Magisterial statements are also issued by bishops' conferences, both on the regional and national levels, although the exact status of these teachings is still being discussed in the church. Statements such as that of the Latin American Bishops' Conference at Puebla (CELAM III, 1979), however, have had an enormous impact not only on the church of Latin America but also on the church at large, and several recent pastoral letters of the U.S. bishops have had a great influence on U.S. Catholic thinking.

**Eastern Orthodox Missiology**

The Eastern Orthodox missionary tradition, though possessing a rich and noble legacy of missionary outreach during the first millennium of Christianity, "can be at once described as known and unknown." After a period of vigorous external missionary activity, Orthodoxy in recent years has been perceived, especially in the West, as indifferent, or even hostile, toward the missionary movement from the West. If we wish to understand Orthodoxy's vigorous reentry into ecumenical discussions of mission theology in recent years, we must be conscious not only of historical forces that gave rise to the earlier "unmissionary" image but also of newer factors that have challenged the Orthodox attitude toward mission. Orthodoxy's recent contributions are indispensable to an ecumenical appreciation of the theology and practice of mission.

Beginning in 1920, Eastern Orthodoxy, under the leadership of the ecumenical patriarch of Constantinople, embarked on a bold ecumenical initiative to promote Christian unity. In the
encyclical "Unto the Churches of Christ Everywhere" the ecumenical patriarch urged the "creation of some form of a league of churches." This ecumenical appeal was primarily concerned with "faith and order" issues and did not identify itself positively with the Western missionary movement, which was gaining momentum after the Edinburgh Missionary Conference (1910). Indeed, Orthodoxy used its new ecumenical contacts to complain bitterly about the proselytizing of Orthodox believers by Protestant missions, while at the same time attacking Eastern Rite ("Uniate") Roman Catholics in the Middle East, Asia, and the Ukraine for sowing conflicts and causing tensions between Orthodoxy and Catholicism. Thus "foreign missions" acquired a generally negative image of Protestant or Roman Catholic incursions into traditionally Orthodox territories with a view to alienating Orthodox believers and adding them to Western churches. Compounding this factor was the impact of the October Revolution in Russia (1917) and the spread of atheistic ideology in Eastern Europe after 1945. The oppressive legacy of Islam, first under the Ottoman Turkish Empire but after 1945 under Islamic successor states in the Middle East, further diminished Orthodoxy's ability to engage in external missions.20

Under these circumstances, the Great Commission (Matt. 28:19) tended to become, in the words of Bishop Anastasios Yannoulatos, "the forgotten commandment." Orthodox member churches in the World Council of Churches as late as 1961 opposed the integration of the International Missionary Council into the WCC at the New Delhi Assembly, believing that the Western missionary movement was hostile to their own identity and inimical to ecumenical understanding.21 Subsequently, however, Orthodox participation in the ecumenical discussion of mission and evangelization dramatically changed.

During the late fifties, a group of younger Orthodox theologians, stung by the reproach of Orthodox missionary indifference and engaged in a broad-gauged movement for Orthodox renewal on several fronts, began the task of reconstructing the Orthodox missionary legacy and clarifying its understanding of mission from the standpoint of Scripture and tradition. In 1958 Anastasios Yannoulatos initiated an Orthodox missionary society named Poreftentes ("Go Ye") out of the Pan-Orthodox Youth League, SYNDESLOS, and began editing an Orthodox journal of mission studies. Orthodox theologians began taking part in deliberations of the WCC's new Commission on World Mission and Evangelism at its first meeting in Mexico City (1963) and played an important role in subsequent meetings.22 Well-defined Orthodox preparatory statements now began to have considerable impact on WCC Assemblies, especially Nairobi 1975 and later ones, and on CWME Conferences, such as Melbourne 1980 and San Antonio 1989.

Orthodox consultations also sought to clarify the various mission contexts and questions with which Orthodoxy is currently engaged. These were seen to be (1) Eastern Europe and the Soviet Union following the collapse of Communism: what is the meaning of Orthodox presence, and what is its missionary witness? (2) Orthodox patriarchates in the Middle East in the continuing Palestinian crisis and in the aftermath of the Gulf War: can Orthodoxy still live and witness in the Middle East, and what should its relationships be with the other two monotheistic faiths of the region? (3) the Orthodox missionary diaspora in the secular West: can Orthodoxy survive amid the pluralistic culture of the West, and what can it learn from its minority status? (4) the new Orthodox mission churches of Africa and Asia: how might their contributions and experiences best be incorporated into and enrich Orthodoxy?23

Orthodoxy presents us with an alternative vision of mission, at once very old and yet strikingly new.

The Orthodox texts and reports that appear in New Directions mostly originated in consultations of the Orthodox Advisory Group to the CWME during the 1970s and 1980s. They deal with

Orthodoxy has an alternative vision of mission, at once very old and yet strikingly new.

Evangelical Missiology

Evangelicalism is too complex a phenomenon to be dealt with in detail. Its predominant features would seem to be confidence in the power of the Gospel and in the authority of the Scriptures, coupled with a passionate desire to reach out and share the good news with others. It has roots in nineteenth-century evangelical movements, above all the Evangelical Alliance (1846), but these movements, in turn, stand on the shoulders of earlier post-Reformation evangelical movements, such as Pietism, Moravianism, Methodism, and similar awakening movements.

Evangelicalism lays strong emphasis on mission, spiritual unity among Christians, and prayer for the advance of the kingdom. At times it has been a staunch advocate of social change, but its record in this regard is not consistent. During the last fifty years, and especially since World War II, evangelicalism has shown a new face and has attempted to shed some undesirable baggage from the past. In the past two decades it has carefully presented its missiological stance and goals. Like the other traditions under study here, it shows considerable vigor in responding to the new, postmodern missionary paradigm.

The evangelical movement presents a series of paradoxes. As noted, it is in the process of renewing itself toward the end of the twentieth century, but its roots reach downward toward earlier evangelical movements, and it traces its ultimate origins
to the New Testament. It is characterized not only by what it wishes to affirm (the mandates of Scripture and the power of the Gospel) but certainly also by what it wishes to reject. It could not follow liberal Protestantism in embracing historical criticism, evolutionary theory, or the social gospel. But at the same time it has sought to distance itself from fundamentalist divisiveness and polemics and to avoid unnecessary breaches in fellowship.

Evangelicalism retains many supporters and followers within mainline denominations affiliated with the conciliar ecumenical movement. At the same time, it numbers countless others related to conservative evangelical denominations and missionary associations that view the ecumenical movement with some suspicion. Some evangelicals are by temperament anti-Catholic, while others are open to reconciliation and closer relationships. Evangelicals possess a common creedal stance grounded in the essentials of Christian faith as proclaimed in the Scriptures. Yet they are also likely to allow some liberty in interpreting the essentials of faith and doctrine. In general, they are less inclined than fundamentalists to break off fellowship over disputes about doctrinal interpretation.

Evangelicals wish to promote unity and fellowship among Christians for more effective witness to the Gospel. Their preferred approach to unity is to foster interpersonal relationships of common faith, trust, and prayer, rather than relying on organizational or hierarchical structures. Evangelical diffidence toward structural expressions of Christian unity explains, in part, the cautious attitude that many evangelicals adopt toward the conciliar ecumenical movement.

For purposes of understanding evangelical missiology, we briefly trace the origins and contributions of two evangelical associations: the World Evangelical Fellowship (1951) and the Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization (1974), often simply referred to as the Lausanne Movement. Both organizations, while primarily North American in background, support, and constituency, are seeking to develop a worldwide following and a global program. The two bodies have maintained close and cooperative relationships with each other, and many evangelicals identify with both.

The World Evangelical Fellowship (WEF), organized in 1951, is an alliance of some sixty national and regional evangelical bodies and is open to national fellowships of evangelical believers around the world. Since its inception, WEF has given special emphasis to evangelism, prayer life, spiritual retreats and conferences, scholarship programs for Third World students, and books for seminaries and Bible training institutes in Third World countries. WEF has an international director and regional vicepresidents with responsibility for planning and programming in continental areas. It operates through general conferences held roughly every three years, sometimes in conjunction with major consultations. WEF has functional commissions responsible for theology (with ethics), missions, communications, and family life (including women’s concerns). Recently a commission on church renewal was added.

Lausanne 1974 “marks the highpoint in the development of evangelical mission theology.”


The Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization (LCWE), formally constituted at the International Congress on World Evangelization (ICOWE) held at Lausanne, Switzerland, in July 1974, is in reality the Continuation Committee for the Lausanne Movement. Organized under the personal initiative and leadership of Dr. Billy Graham, with major assistance from the evangelical journal Christianity Today and support from various evangelistic agencies and missionary associations, ICOWE carried forward the momentum of the Wheaton Congress on the Church’s World-wide Mission and the Berlin World Congress on Evangelism (both 1966). Lausanne sought to forge a link between evangelicals concerned with world mission and those primarily interested in local evangelism.

LCWE is not a council of churches or religious organizations but rather a loose coalition of individuals, mission and evangelism agencies, and institutions sharing a common theological position and a common missionary and evangelistic purpose. It is governed by an international committee of seventy evangelical leaders. Identification with LCWE is made by signing the Lausanne Covenant and thereby covenanting with others “to pray, plan, and work together for the evangelization of the whole world.”

In issuing invitations to the 1974 Lausanne Congress, the preparatory committee’s intention was “to hasten the evangelization of all people of the world in obedience to the command of Jesus Christ and in anticipation of his return.” This was to be done by promoting cooperative evangelistic efforts, engaging in biblical studies on evangelism, examining strategies of evangelization, and joining in united prayer. The official report of ICOWE, entitled Let the Earth Hear His Voice, runs to nearly 1,500 closely written pages.

One of the enduring achievements of the Lausanne Congress was the drafting and formal adoption of the fifteen-paragraph declaration known as the Lausanne Covenant. It was to become the ongoing basis for evangelical cooperation and a further catalyst to evangelical unity. The covenant, prepared under the leadership of Anglican evangelical John R. W. Stott, attempts to define sensitive issues of evangelical missiology: the authority of the Bible, the uniqueness of Jesus Christ, the relation between evangelism and dialogue, the relative priority of evangelization and social concern, the centrality of the church in evangelism, the necessity of partnership and cooperation, and many others. Despite the warm reception given the Lausanne Covenant, however, certain issues were not settled by ICOWE, and groups such as the “radical evangelicals” and WEF commissions pressed for further clarifications and refinements. Even so, Lausanne 1974 “marks the highpoint in the development of evangelical mission theology,” and its covenant remains “the most mature and comprehensive statement produced by evangelicals.”

The most recent LCWE statement in New Directions 1, com-
PARADIGM SHIFTS IN MISSIONS:
THE 21ST CENTURY MISSIONARY IN A
RADICALLY CHANGING WORLD

You're invited to join pastors, missionaries and church leaders from around the world who are committed to church-based leadership training. BILD-International's 3rd Annual Conference held in Ames, Iowa, on October 21-23, 1992, will include:
- new and innovative models for establishing churches and training leaders will be examined
- international leaders from every major continent, sharing their visions and strategies, and discussing opportunities to be in partnership with them
- specific training and tools designed to help set up or improve existing church-based leadership training programs in your church
- the introduction of a creative leadership training tool, “The Life Development Portfolio,” to guide you in the life-long learning process

KEYNOTE SPEAKER:
DR. TED WARD
Director of Research
Leadership Doctoral Programs
Trinity Evangelical Divinity School
Deerfield, Illinois

“This is not just another conference... BILD-International, located in Ames, Iowa, has the finest resources and strategies I know to help your church implement leadership training.”

DR. GENE GETZ

To register or request information call
TOLL FREE 1-800-292-BILD or 515-292-7012
or write BILD-International 4911 West Lincoln Way, Ames, Iowa 50010

Helping churches train leaders
ing from Lausanne II in Manila (1989), is the “Manila Manifesto: An Elaboration of the Lausanne Covenant Fifteen Years Later.” The Manila Congress was organized under the umbrella theme “Proclaim Christ Until He Comes: Calling the Whole Church to Take the Whole Gospel to the Whole World.” This holistic theme seemed to echo notes heard at earlier conciliar mission conferences: that mission must be done in unity and that the Gospel touches the whole of life. The Manila Manifesto updates the Lausanne Covenant but does not depart from it in its essential affirmations.

The Manila Manifesto represents evangelicalism’s response to the postmodern missionary paradigm, with special regard for the challenges of modernity and of the year A.D. 2000 and beyond. Together with the Lausanne Covenant, it provides authoritative guidance and inspiration for evangelical workers and sets the tone for evangelical missiology into the 1990s. While possessing no official authority, these documents embody a broad consensus of evangelical opinion and conviction about mission and evangelization. They deserve careful study by all who seek to promote mutual understanding and common witness to the Gospel.

Conclusion

The editors of the “New Directions” series hope this first volume of mission statements will prove useful to all Christians concerned with the advancement of the mission of God, whether used for personal study and reflection or studied in the classroom. Our purpose will have been served if readers are led to greater mutual respect and understanding for persons holding different convictions about mission and evangelization. One of our aims is to further common witness to the coming of Christ’s kingdom. We commend these statements, along with the sources from which they are derived, to the missiological community for careful study and dialogue. At the same time, we solicit comments and reactions from readers of this first volume, along with suggestions for articles to be included in future volumes of “New Directions.”

Notes

12. These documents may be found in Documents of Vatican II, ed. Austin P. Flannery (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1975), and in other editions.
19. A recent statement by heads of Eastern Orthodox churches, referring to Protestant evangelical and Roman Catholic mission strategies in Eastern Europe, complains that “traditional Orthodox countries have been considered ‘mission territories’ where proselytism is practiced with all the methods that have been condemned and rejected for decades by all Christians” (New York Times, National Edition, March 17, 1982).
30. The approved text is found in The Manila Manifesto, pp. 1-38.
31. J. D. Douglas, ed., Proclaim Christ Until He Comes: Calling the Whole Church to Take the Whole Gospel to the Whole World (Minneapolis: World Wide Publications, 1990).
Wilfred Cantwell Smith and Kenneth Cragg on Islam as a Way of Salvation

Richard J. Jones

A question Christians must ask in relation to neighbors of non-Christian faiths is how Jesus’ Great Commission to go and make disciples of all nations relates to his Great Commandment to love God wholly and to love our neighbors as ourselves. One way love of neighbors expresses itself today is by taking their religion more seriously than was often the case in the past. Paying attention to our neighbors’ faith, however, is bound to raise—for those who have not excluded it a priori—a theological question: Is God involved in the code, cult, and creed of other religions?

Christian answers to this question constitute a Christian theology of religion. Theologies of religion have been formulated in exclusive terms (saving knowledge of God occurs only in Jesus Christ) by Karl Barth; in inclusive terms (Christ is the means of God’s saving self-communication, even among persons who do not profess him) by Karl Rahner; and more recently in pluralist terms (there are multiple ways to God, existing in parallel) by John Hick and Hans Küng. These and similar attempts to reconcile the acknowledged phenomenon of other human religions with a faith born in the Christian community and reliant on the Christian tradition have two common elements: 1) they attempt to formulate general conclusions applicable to any and all human religions, and 2) their Christian authors lack sustained, firsthand involvement with another living religion. The question arises: What kind of theological estimate of other religions would be made by a Christian who for decades had studied and shared in the life of a non-Christian religious community?

This article presents theological estimates by two such students, each located at a different point on the Christian theological spectrum, concerning one aspect of a single non-Christian religion. The two students are the liberal Canadian Wilfred Cantwell Smith and the evangelical Englishman Kenneth Cragg. The non-Christian religion selected is a particularly challenging one: Islam.

Among the many questions a theology of religion may profitably pose concerning Islam are questions about the Islamic way of arriving at knowledge of God, whether God the Holy Spirit can be affirmed to be active in the lives of Muslims, and—of particular relevance to Christian mission—whether Islam is to be regarded as a way of salvation. This article presents the findings of Smith and Cragg, both lifetime students of Islam, on a single strand in the endless skein of Islamic tradition and experience: Is Islam to be regarded as a way of salvation?

Their distinctive emphases as Christians have ensured that Cragg and Smith would each affirm and challenge different elements within Islam. Cragg is very conscious of human sin and places correspondingly high value on the self-disclosing and remedial activity of God to which Christian tradition attests. Accordingly, Cragg criticizes Muslim reliance on appeals to human moral sensibility and Muslim reluctance to affirm any revelation by God of his own nature. Smith, in contrast, relies ultimately on human moral responsiveness; he postulates innate individual openness to the divine. Hence Smith can prize as God-guided and salvific the efforts of Muslims to establish a social order pleasing to God.

Smith and Cragg: Similar Approaches, Different Milieux

Wilfred Cantwell Smith and Kenneth Cragg both took part in British and North American Oriental studies of the 1930s and 1940s, gained firsthand acquaintance with living Muslim communities through combined academic and ecclesiastical posts, and have intended their writings on Islamic topics to be read by Muslim as well as by Christian and Western academic readers.

Born in 1916, Smith pursued a classical education involving Hebrew and Arabic at the University of Toronto, followed by theology at Westminster College, Cambridge, and Islams under Hamilton A. R. Gibb. Having worked actively as an undergraduate in the Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions and the Student Christian Movement, it was natural for him to apply to teach Indian history at Forman Christian College, Lahore, in 1941, under the auspices of the Canadian Overseas Missions Council. He recalls these as four of the happiest years of his life, making friends across boundaries that separated Muslim, Hindu, and Sikh. Leaving India just prior to its partition, Smith founded and for fifteen years directed McGill University’s Graduate Institute of Islamic Studies, where it was intended that half the faculty and students be Muslims.

Kenneth Cragg, was born in England in 1913, studied modern history at Jesus College, Oxford, and theology at Tyndale Hall, Bristol. While serving as a chaplain and teacher of philosophy at the American University of Beirut between 1942 and 1947, Cragg learned Arabic and began his sustained involvement with Muslim thinkers and issues. Cragg has shown more interest in the interaction of Islam with modern secular pressures, with Communism, and with Christian thought than in Islam’s medieval treasures. Nevertheless, he cites al-Ghazzali (d. A.D. 1111) as illuminating, “as no other writer does, the meaning of faith,” and Cragg has translated into English for the benefit of Christians numerous Sufi prayers.

Smith, although a historian of religion, has worked from an identifiable theological standpoint. Son of a “continuing Presbyterian” father and a Methodist mother, Smith’s experience of religious groups, in southern Ontario as later in northern India, sensitized him to the threat to human relations of dogmatism and the imperious demands of group loyalty. At Cambridge he was impressed by a theology relying on personal experience to give fundamental and reliable access to God. He studied theology under H. H. Farmer, successor of John Oman, the English trans-

Richard J. Jones has served as an Episcopal priest in Ecuador and the United States. He is now Associate Professor of Mission and World Religions at Virginia Theological Seminary, Alexandria, Virginia. His Ph.D. dissertation “Wilfred Cantrell Smith and Kenneth Cragg on Islam” (1988) is available from the National Library of Canada, Ottawa.
labor of Schleiermacher's *Christian Faith*. Among many scholars such as Oman, the authority of Scripture as a textbook asserting eternal truths about objective states of affairs had been eroded by nineteenth-century textual and historical criticism. According to Thomas Langford, "The question of the status of the Bible precipitated a notable switch . . . to the authority of the person of Jesus." Smith's theological ideas suggest that he in turn moved from the interpretation of Christian life as "response to Jesus" to Christian life as response to God. In India, in his subsequent studies of Islam and in his relating of Islam to other religions, and especially to Christianity, he was drawn particularly to the more mystical strands of Islam found in India and Persia, as contrasted with the dominant Sunni version of the Arab heartland where Cragg worked. Smith found the Sufi emphases congenial with his own emphasis on the personal apprehension of God; he judged less authentic any Muslim reliance on received propositions, objective signs, or external authority.

The piety of Kenneth Cragg's upbringing may be inferred from the fact that his family's involvement with the cause of missions was not through one of the Church of England’s older missionary societies but with the Bible Churchmen's Missionary Society, formed in 1922 to attest to the complete reliability of the Scriptures. Such an evangelical orientation did not prevent Cragg from being impressed, just as Smith was, by Oman’s exploring of the interpenetration of grace and personality, and of God and nature. Yet the title of his 1937 theological essay at Oxford, "The Place of Authority in Matters of Religious Belief," suggests a higher valuation of the community entrusted with a tradition by which fresh personal religious experience may be evaluated. Cragg's intervals of teaching Arabic and Islamics in the West never extinguished his concern for the life and witness of the Christian community in predominantly Muslim lands. His service as a bishop—from 1970 to 1973 he oversaw Anglican congregations in Egypt—and teacher in the church reflects Cragg's conviction that the work of Christ goes beyond teaching humanity about God: "The Cross is finally what God does, answering what humanity did there, and accomplishing the divine purpose in what Christ did." The necessity of incarnation for God to make his love prevail yields, in Cragg's view, a like necessity for the continuing incarnate community, the church, and its received signs of belonging, nourishment, and regeneration. Cragg’s continuing concern to present Christ for Muslim consideration has coincided with his episcopal office, whereas Smith’s career has been primarily academic. Cragg's high estimate of the church, the incarnation, and the Bible, encountering a predominantly Sunni and Arab Islam, prompted him to notice and give considerable weight to analogous elements in Islam, including the Islamic community, the person of the Prophet, and the authority of the Qur'an.

**Smith: Salvation Through Faith**

Smith conceives of salvation as having two aspects: mundane and cosmic. Mundane salvation is a matter for empirical observation—"almost verifiable." It consists of an individual’s having faith. Mundane salvation involves awareness of the moral dimension of life, of “access to a splendour that is not altogether obvious here on earth,” of being in the hands of God—awareness, in a word, of transcendence. Smith takes Luther’s description of the sinner justified through faith (*simul justus et peccator*) and insists that the Muslim, like the Christian, is saved by faith: “faith of an Islamic form, through Islamic patterns; faith mediated by an Islamic context.” The effect of such faith and the mundane content of such salvation is that Muslims are delivered from meaninglessness and foundering. They exhibit multiple gifts:

- their courage, their dignity, their capacity to suffer without disintegrating and to succeed without gloating, their sense of belonging to a community, of accepting and being accepted, their ability to trust and to be trusted, to discipline themselves, to formulate ideals, to postpone reward, to work hard towards a distant goal.

Beyond this analysis of a mundane aspect of salvation observable in the lives of Muslims present and past, Smith affirms also a cosmic dimension of salvation. By cosmic salvation he means being “saved for all eternity.” To know about such eternal matters requires more than empirical grounds. The grounds Smith relies on include Christian ethics, a doctrine of Christ, and his own judgment that Islamic personal faith is more important to the Islamic community than any concern for doctrine or order.

Smith’s ethics reinforces his theological argument for the accessibility of salvation through Islamic faith. Smith argues that Christians are not permitted to believe in the damnation of their neighbor. Such a conclusion is ruled out before the start of any inquiry. “The damnation of my neighbor,” Smith says, “is too weighty a matter to hang on a syllogism.” This objection is made in part to caution against proceeding from the affirmation “salvation is in Christ” to the questionable corollary “outside Christ is no salvation.” Smith also disallows any reasoning that concludes that our way leads to salvation while others’ ways lead to damnation; such logic invalidates itself by partaking of a self-justifying ethnocentric preference for “us” and “ours” over “them” and “theirs.” Finally, Smith would rule out such a conclusion as detrimental to an overriding duty of love to neighbor, which in the present circumstances means chiefly the duty to build world community. One may question whether Smith has given the first commandment of Jesus (love to God) commensurate weight with the second (love to neighbor). One may also ask why God’s will that humans refrain from passing final judgment on one another should limit God’s own freedom to judge the adequacy of human responses to him. Smith, however, for his part, considers a negative finding about Islam as a way of eternal salvation, or about Muslims’ being eternally saved as individuals, to be ethically unacceptable.

In affirming the positive alternative—the “cosmic” (i.e., eternal) salvation of Muslims—Smith does not rely on Muslim grounds but appeals rather to what he takes to be the central and major Christian understanding of God’s saving will demonstrated in the outreaching love of Jesus. Smith infers Muslim salvation from God’s self-revelation in Jesus Christ. He has suggested interpreting Karl Rahner’s “anonymous Christian” proposal by an alternate formula: “There is neither Christian nor Muslim nor other; for we are all one in being offered grace, and potentially one by accepting it.” Smith is confident that God saves through any and all religious texts, devotional acts, art, or persons that serve to arouse or nurture generic faith. "God is
more imaginative than we Christians used to think,” Smith asserts. “And man more responsive.”

Smith’s affirmation that God saves Muslims eternally by means of Islam thus rests primarily on his view of the Cross. Islamic data enter in only to corroborate this judgment from Christian tradition. Corroboration proceeds from the argument that the essential feature of Islam is personal faith. Islamic teaching on heaven, hell, and judgment represent for Smith decidedly secondary concerns. They are metaphors that once met a need, or intellectual constructions that derive from a vital sense of constant personal accountability for one’s actions and attitudes before God. Such metaphors and ratiocination remain for Smith incidental to the fundamental, characteristic Muslim disposition of faith. The relationship to God that “faith” signifies for Smith eludes description in its cosmic dimension. The most he affirms is that “cosmic salvation too [like the mundane] is the same for an African tribesman and for a Taoist and for a Muslim as it is for me, or for any Christian.”

Smith typically describes salvation as something obtainable by the individual, despite his repeated protests that his concept of personal salvation does not exclude a community dimension.

Even more noteworthy is Smith’s insistence that eternal salvation via one form of faith or another will be “the same” for all persons. This assertion seems particularly precarious in relation to Islam. The faith that characterizes Muslims, by Smith’s account, is a “faith in God, and in the obligatoriness of what He has enjoined. A Muslim is saved not in the final analysis by doing good works; but by recognizing that they are good, that he ought to do them.” The will of God as something that can be known and obeyed is the focus of what Smith calls the Islamic form of faith: he sees righteousness serving in Islam as mediator between the human and the divine, analogous to the role played by rationality in Greek philosophy and by Christ in Christian tradition.

A word of critique of Smith’s argument may be inserted at this point. Latent in the Islamic focus on obedience and righteousness (and often not so latent), observers other than Smith have noted, is a keen concern about disobedience and unrighteousness. The opening surah of the Qur’an, described by Pickthall as “an essential part of all Muslim worship, public and private,” reveals this negative concern:

Guide us in the straight path, the path of those whom Thou hast blessed, not of those against whom Thou art wroth, nor of those who are astray.

If the focus of Muslim faith is on conforming all of life to the will of God, should no weight attach to Muslim concern over avoiding deviance from agreed community standards, avoiding the haram (that which is forbidden) in personal choices, and avoiding being found among the unbelievers? Smith acknowledges such historical phenomena in Islam as overinterpreting the shari’ah and excessive certitude in judging transgressors, but he offers three responses:

1. such is not true Islam; true Islam expresses itself in other ways (a question of definition and of observation);
2. we should look at the best, not the worst, in another faith when we wish to compare it with the best or theoretical version of our own faith (a question of method);
3. expressions of faith that to an observer might seem trivial or superstitious may in fact overlie, and on occasion reignite, a genuine devotion to the transcendent.

To affirm Islam as a way to a cosmic salvation indistinguishable from the cosmic salvation that is the object of Christian hope, Smith is obliged to minimize as an element in Islamic faith its repugnance for disobedience. This minimizing of a concern that is prominent in the Qur’an and in Islamic doctrine raises a serious doubt about Smith’s theological estimate of Islam. If Smith’s aim is to portray an Islam that most Muslims can claim as their own, he appears here to violate his own canons.

Cragg: Salvation as Reconciliation

Cragg’s wrestling with Islam as a way of salvation has no such clear outcome as Smith’s. When he turns to Christian Scripture and tradition for insight into the extent of God’s saving will and work, Cragg finds contradictory indications. The New Testament yields for him conflicting inclusive and exclusive apostolic testimony regarding the activity of the Holy Spirit beyond the church, testimony arising in response to encounters with both the philosophies and religions of the ancient Mediterranean. Cragg’s essential inference from Scripture is to expect the Holy Spirit to be “unceasing and unfailing . . . everywhere at work,” including in disconcerting ways and unexpected places, yet always to act in some continuity with what God has previously revealed of himself in creation and in Christ. In the end Cragg refrains from voicing God’s judgment on the cosmic (in Smith’s sense) or objective salvation of Muslims.

It is possible to infer some of the considerations keeping Cragg silent on this point. To affirm with Smith that God saves Muslims through “faith in Islamic form” would undercut the divine intent Cragg sees in the Cross. Cragg uses the term “salvation” to mean redemption. Societies and individuals alike, he affirms, need to be redeemed from tyranny and pretense into truth, peace, joy, and reconciliation. Cragg’s assessment of the human predicament gives so much attention to enmity, idolatrous self-love, and active rejection of our God-given status as stewards that he necessarily looks for a salvation that does more than simply heighten awareness of transcendence or educate the conscience. For Cragg, the cross of Jesus measures “what human beings do in their wrongness.” The willingness of Jesus there both to suffer and to forgive “makes an end of evil because it freely takes all its consequences upon itself.” Jesus’ resurrection is the victory of this suffering love, validating that God was in Christ and at the same time assuring an eternal dimension to the salvation of all who associate themselves with Christ in his death. As the need for salvation is a collective human need, diversely expressed in individuals, so access to salvation is collective, emanating from one historic life to as many individuals as will link themselves to this life.

Does God save apart from participation in the death and resurrection of Christ? Does God, as Smith says, save through “faith of an Islamic form”? Cragg implies that, if so, God saves in spite of some deficiencies in Islamic awareness of their need and of the mode. Cragg feels bound to make comparisons between
salvation as offered in Islam and salvation as offered in Christianity. As he relates "the good" accessible in Islam and "the good" accessible in Christian community, Cragg finds differences that he takes for deficiencies: in Islamic concepts of salvation, in the Islamic confidence in good works, and in the shape into which Islamic faith is directed.

The prevalent Muslim concept of salvation is the first thing to give Cragg pause. He does not feel at liberty to take the Qur'an's descriptions of heaven and hell only in the metaphorical sense that the most liberal Muslim interpreters might give them. Nor does he take quranic teaching about heaven and hell as only expressive of emotion or referring only to private experience. For Cragg the quranic picture provides Muslims their warrant for theological statements by aiming to describe universally valid states of affairs beyond the presently verifiable. Their picture, he finds, "is of a secure and static bliss and a pointless, hapless anguish"—whereas the expectation he would himself affirm, on the basis of Christian tradition, is of purgation in remorse, growth in service, and an ultimate beatific vision. He finds the two sets of expectations irreconcilable.

Concerning the commitment to justice and solidarity instilled in Islamic society over fourteen centuries, Cragg recognizes the intent that a person's relation to God should pervade also one's relations to one's fellows. He recognizes with Smith the personal virtues and social achievements that adorn Islamic society over the centuries. Yet Cragg repeatedly questions both the Islamic readiness to use compulsion in establishing a social order intended to translate God's will into operative norms, as well as the durability of the commitment therein to compassion. Short of human beings recognizing that in the suffering love incarnate in Jesus they are encountering God's way of both revealing himself and overcoming evil, Cragg doubts that compassion, justice, or any of the marks of a redeemed community will endure. In his Jerusalem studies for Christians living in Islamic societies, Cragg hazarded a judgment: "In the end, all other systems, somewhere, abandon the necessities of love [i.e., the suffering that love must endure to prevail] which God in Christ undertakes and through him teaches men to undertake."33 Relying on Pauline insight into law's limitations, Cragg doubts that quranic injunction, sunnah example, or shari'ah rulings can overcome the double threat of human pride and sloth.

Insofar as salvation means living in this world in a true awareness of and relation to God, Cragg affirms Muslim piety to be realistic and authentic. He is confident that Muslim prayer is addressed to the one true God and sees it concurring with Christian prayer in its readiness to praise and to align the human will to the divine. He calls attention to aspects of God made accessible to humanity through Muslim acknowledgment, for example, that God is Creator, Judge, and Lord. Cragg warns, however, that access to God based on knowledge of such attributes as are made known in the revealed ninety-nine names is an access neither "finally pledged nor necessarily operative." "[The offering of [Muslim] prayer depends altogether for its acceptability upon the divine will."

Insofar as no Muslim is given grounds to pray "Abba, Father," to that extent a benefit of Islamic societies, Cragg hazarded a judgment: "In the end, all other systems, somewhere, abandon the necessities of love [i.e., the suffering that love must endure to prevail] which God in Christ undertakes and through him teaches men to undertake." Relying on Pauline insight into law's limitations, Cragg doubts that quranic injunction, sunnah example, or shari'ah rulings can overcome the double threat of human pride and sloth.

Insofar as salvation means living in this world in a true awareness of and relation to God, Cragg affirms Muslim piety to be realistic and authentic. He is confident that Muslim prayer is addressed to the one true God and sees it concurring with Christian prayer in its readiness to praise and to align the human will to the divine. He calls attention to aspects of God made accessible to humanity through Muslim acknowledgment, for example, that God is Creator, Judge, and Lord. Cragg warns, however, that access to God based on knowledge of such attributes as are made known in the revealed ninety-nine names is an access neither "finally pledged nor necessarily operative." "[The offering of [Muslim] prayer depends altogether for its acceptability upon the divine will."

Insofar as no Muslim is given grounds to pray "Abba, Father," to that extent a benefit of salvation is lacking in Islam.

Other Religions and Christian Mission

Cragg takes a doubtful view of Islam as a way of salvation, while Smith's view is essentially positive. This contrast should serve, at the very least, to warn us against too confidently identifying any given Christian theologian's estimate with God's-eye view of the subject. Here are two thorough and sympathetic assessments.

Noteworthy

Personalia

The School of World Mission at Fuller Theological Seminary, Pasadena, California, has appointed J. Dudley Woodberry as dean, effective September 1, 1992. Paul Pierson, dean of the school for the past twelve years, retires as dean but will continue on the faculty as professor of history and Latin American studies. Woodberry, 58, has been on the faculty since 1985 and is associate professor of Islamic Studies. Earlier he ministered in Pakistan, Afghanistan and Saudi Arabia.

Wheaton College Graduate School, Wheaton, Illinois, has appointed two new faculty members to its Missions/Intercultural Studies and Evangelism department. C. Douglas McConnell most recently was general director of the Asia Pacific Christian Mission and served as a missionary in Australia and New Guinea for 16 years. A. Scott Moreau served on the faculty of Nairobi International School of Theology for seven years.

Mission scholars around the world were shocked and saddened at news of the death of David J. Bosch in an automobile accident in South Africa on April 15. Bosch, 62, was a missionary in the Transkei during 1957-71. Since 1972 he had been professor of missiology at the University of South Africa in Pretoria and was dean of the faculty of theology at the university in 1974-77 and 1981-87. He was general secretary of the Southern African Missiological Society since its inception in 1968 and editor of its journal Missionalia since it was founded in 1973. He also served as national chairman of the South African Christian Leadership Assembly in 1979 and of the National Initiative for Reconciliation since 1989 as part of his tireless ministry to bring about reconciliation between racial, denominational, and theological groups in South Africa and across the world. His books in English include A Spirituality of the Road (1979), Witness to the World (1980), The Lord's Prayer: Paradigm of a Christian Lifestyle (1985), and Transforming Mission (1991). This last book, his magnum opus, has now become his enduring missiological testament.

Announcing

of Islam that seek to rise above the descriptive and analytic to the theological level. Each has attempted to allow Muslims to speak for themselves and has been sensitive to the multiple strands of the living entity that is Islam. Yet the findings are disparate.

Cragg finds Muslims afflicted by a Qur' an-based overconfidence in law, while Smith focuses on the personal faith that Islam engenders. In accordance with his overall theology of religion, Smith describes Islam as furnishing a form to human faith that makes individual persons open to God. Since to have faith is to be saved, Islam, being an expression of human faith, is for Smith an undeniable way of salvation. Cragg, with his more Qur'an- and doctrine-centered view of Islam and his view of faith as dependent on the community that houses it, notices in Islam points of closedness to God. Indeed, convinced that God is rightly understood only in Trinitarian terms, Cragg has to conclude that doctrinal elements in Islam tend to block Muslims from full saving knowledge of God. Convinced that humanity requires more than a mere reminder of its vocation, Cragg remains constrained to proffer to Muslims additional dimensions of salvation not contemplated in the usual pattern of their response to God. Still, Cragg abstains from judgment on whether devout Muslims are saved.

How far do these differing estimates of Islam as a way of salvation go toward accounting for Smith and Cragg's differing theologies of Christian mission? It turns out that their theologies of mission, particularly as far as the ends and the agents of mission are concerned, are formed largely on other grounds. Smith holds as a Christian axiom, independent of his estimate of Islam or other human religion, that mission is God's activity, mysteriously produced. In our time, Smith suggests, God is at work making formerly isolated religious traditions of the world rub shoulders and exchange words with one another. Our participation in mission consists of learning to perceive God at work under our noses. Cragg, for his part, sees mission as the church's task, because the once-for-all incarnation has axiomatic relevance to all human beings, and the church makes God's incarnation universally accessible to human beings.

Where Smith and Cragg's understandings of God's activity within Islam have been brought to bear is in the matter of the means of mission that might be considered permissible and pleasing in the sight of God. Both men describe dialogue and shared service to humanity as the means for advancing mission in present world circumstances. Cragg's interest in dialogue, however, reflects his theological judgment that others' awareness of God stands to be thereby enhanced. He accordingly welcomes opportunities to correlate doctrine bilaterally between the Christian tradition and any other. Smith, persuaded that any apprehension of God is partial yet salvific, seeks to move dialogue as quickly as possible beyond doctrine to appreciate whatever awareness of the transcendent may be induced in persons—others and ourselves—by doctrine. Such being the outcome hoped for, Smith is pleased when conversations between religious traditions become multilateral colloquy.

**Smith views mission as God's activity, while Cragg sees it as the church's task.**

Smith and Cragg's theologies of mission also owe their differing shapes in part to the concerns of the specific communities and particular times in which they were thought out. Smith conceives of mission as peacemaking interreligious dialogue, in which the continuation of the church as a boundaried human community is subordinated to the rescue of the larger society from communalism and colonialism. Such a theology was compelling for postpartition India and the agenda of demoting colonial ideologies tainted by racial pride. It remains to be seen whether this is a theology of mission for future, more egalitarian intercultural conditions.

To implement a Smithian concept of mission requires the availability of representatives of each tradition emotionally and intellectually equipped not only to enter into conversation with outsiders but to sustain conversation even when it begins to arouse internal contradictions or reconceptions. Cragg's concept of mission entails reaching out first to understand the other and then additionally to explain ourselves. This theology reflects the situation of Christian communities entrenched as ingrown minorities in predominantly Muslim societies. It remains to be seen whether the communities among whom this view of mission was formulated, and others similarly situated, can find the strength to act it out.

**Notes**


6. Cragg, *Call of the Minaret*, p. 272, emphasis added.


Where Is It? A New Index to Non-Western Christian Literature

Douglas W. Geyer and Sharon Vlahovich

In researching missions and non-Western Christianity, and in globalizing theological education, it is important to have extensive bibliography and, in the best of all possible worlds, to have full access to the sources revealed by the bibliography. Locating necessary materials may be easy if the researcher is interested only in a few well-known books and periodicals and concerned only with a fairly broad overview. For the work of continent-wide or worldwide organizations and agencies, such sources may suffice. Research problems arise, however, when one has a narrower scope of interest.

Materials that may help with this narrower interest might be known but may not be easy to use because they are known only generally or vaguely. Researchers might recall, for example, a series of conference proceedings from Singapore or two or three unusual and rare journals from Ghana but not have any practical way to make use of these items because they are aware of them only generally. Who are the authors? What are the topics discussed? Without knowing these things, researchers naturally question whether they should spend time and money to identify and acquire such documents. The result is that these types of conference documents and rare periodicals remain unused.

Researchers may head for the libraries they are familiar with, content with the assumption that there they will painlessly find non-Western trade publications and periodicals, either through computer on-line services (and the subsequent interlibrary loan of desired materials) or through the cataloging services there. But there are disheartening difficulties, even when research goals are general. The accumulation of catalog records in national databases exhibits an array of different cataloging philosophies, uneven cataloging methods, varying forms and standards of entering key information such as imprint geographic names, and other anomalies that make it very difficult to search for specific headings, names, and groups. Even the most careful searches will yield uneven results.

In addition, a search for slightly more general topics produces too many citations, leaving the researcher stymied in the attempt to sort through the mass of data. The problem of too much information can be called an indexing problem. When researchers cannot pick out accurate smaller pieces from single blocks of search retrievals, it is usually because there are inadequate distinctions to instruct them where to begin to look. Particular names, places, groups, agencies, or ideas are invisible, or not indexed. The only solution to this problem—reading through the text of every document—is not feasible.

Another research problem antagonizes as well, with equally devastating results. This is the dilemma of unknown documentation. Vital non-Western "grey literature" required for detailed research often lies just beyond a researcher's line of vision. Included also in this grey literature are articles from unestablished non-Western periodical literature (issued irregularly) as well as essays, reports, and contributions in non-Western multi-author works. These materials are often totally unknown bibliographically to students or researchers and, together, add up to a vast reservoir of untapped resources.

Douglas W. Geyer is Project Director for the International Christian Literature Documentation Project. Sharon Vlahovich is Indexer for the project. The authors gratefully acknowledge the assistance of David Bundy and Robert Droonik in the preparation of this article.
ICLDP: Solving the Researcher's Dilemma

The American Theological Library Association (ATLA), funded by a grant from the Pew Charitable Trusts, has initiated the International Christian Literature Documentation Project (ICLDP) in order to solve such dilemmas in missionary and non-Western Christianity research. ICLDP is an indexing project. Its mission is to create an index of materials that document Christian life and mission in the non-Western world. Such an index employs a standardized descriptive language for subject access to monographs, articles in multi-author works, and articles in some periodicals. This means that the subject headings applied to all these different types of materials are coordinated for maximum access to detail (e.g., particular personal names or names of agencies) as well as for helpful grouping of documents that are similar in content (e.g., all documents having to do with Christian education). Once all these citations are combined into one database, the subject index of this database will file together all types of documentation, including chapters of standard conference proceedings, non-standard and obscure pamphlets, typed manuscripts, unique devotionals, well-known monographs, rare consultation reports, journal articles, and many other items. With the cooperation of eight participating libraries, the ICLDP database also includes the specific location of each of these documents. The bibliography that is indexed by ICLDP is then linked with documentation availability. Bibliographic citations found in the index point to the actual location of the document, thereby resolving the researcher’s quandary. ICLDP is dedicated to bibliography that is finely detailed, even down to rare articles of just two or three pages, and that gives the user a chance to find such rare items on at least one library shelf.

ICLDP takes consultation from an advisory committee of missiologists and librarians. Editorial staff is located at the ATLA offices in Evanston, where multi-author works are indexed, monograph records sent by participating libraries are processed, and search for new holdings of non-Western Christian literature continues. Staff is also at work under the direction of Joan Duffy at the Yale Divinity School Library, where new records are being produced for the extensive Yale pamphlet and special collections. Users of the Yale Divinity School Library will find these records already on-line in Yale’s automated local catalog. More than 3,600 pamphlets have been brought into public catalog access for the first time as a by-product of ICLDP development. In Evanston these records are integrated into the project database. Future users of ICLDP will find all of this unique material combined with thousands of additional items from other participating libraries. The whole, which includes these specially made records from Yale, is searchable as one database.

Perhaps the most important feature of the project is its close working partnership with participating libraries. ICLDP is not only a bibliography but also a holdings list of targeted documentation from these libraries. The user knows exactly where any cited document can be found, since the collection and the call number of the document at that collection are clearly presented. In this case, if ICLDP was used at any participating library, one would have in hand a detailed guidebook to books and articles immediately on site at that library. If ICLDP was used at a collection that did not hold the materials, then the user would know exactly where to go to find them. This feature is part of the ICLDP’s mandate to facilitate document availability, a service that is several steps beyond mere compilation of a bibliography. Document availability is based on the willingness of libraries to participate in ICLDP to make their holdings accessible through interlibrary loan or whatever other means that, as privately operating collections, they have elected to use.

In the manner of established ATLA products, ICLDP develops a database that provides access to a large volume of bibliographic citations by means of standard-language subject headings and descriptors. One particularly useful feature of ICLDP is the way in which it gives access to bibliography through corporate names (the “sponsoring agency” of a given document) and the names of conferences. A similar feature is also found in other indexes, such as *Theology in Context: Information on Theological Contributions from Africa, Asia, Oceania, and Latin America,* *Bibliografía teológica comentada del área iberoamericana,* or *Sociología de la religión teología: Estudio bibliográfico,* but ICLDP increases both the breadth and the depth of coverage.

The particular focus of ICLDP overlaps with that of other Christian literature and missions literature documentation projects, both those now available and those in development. The massive work of Archie Crouch, *Christianity in China: A Scholars’ Guide to Resources in the Libraries and Archives of the United States,* lists the reported holdings of archives in the United States for documentation of Christianity and missions in China. Included in this volume are union lists of serial titles, oral histories, dissertations, and theses. The archival materials listed in this volume are indexed by topics, personal names, and repositories. As with ICLDP, bibliography in Crouch’s project is supplemented with complete holdings information (the user knows immediately where to find specific documents). But unlike ICLDP, bibliographic citations are not listed on the page immediately in the vicinity of their indexed subject headings or personal names.

Also useful to a researcher is the work compiled by Aloha Smith, the *Guide to Federal Archives Relating to Africa,* and its companion, the *Guide to Non-Federal Archives and Manuscripts in the United States Relating to Africa.* The first contains separate indexes for subjects, places, personal names, and ethnic groups. The companion contains a single index of keywords listing place names, personal names, and subject descriptors. Some archival documentation relating to Christianity in Africa stored across the United States can be discovered using Smith’s work, but this material makes up only a small fraction of what is in these volumes. It is not the focus of this work. In comparison, ICLDP provides more access to extensive collections of archival materials, monographs, essays in multi-author works, and some periodicals from across the non-Western world that have to do specifically with Christianity, all indexed in one logical alphabet.

Distinct Advantages of ICLDP

ICLDP does overlap in scope and purpose with a variety of other special bibliographies. Its coverage and the extensive indexing of its references, however, goes far beyond available research tools. This can be seen by comparing it to several bibliographies specifically about Africa.

American and Canadian Doctoral Dissertations and Master’s Theses on Africa series is comprehensive, with author, school, and subject indexes. Headings such as “Christianity” or “Education, Religious” bring to light several dissertations. The majority of citations in this reference, however, are not to dissertations dealing either with Christianity or religion. Dissertations are indexed in ICLDP.

_Spirit Possession and Spirit Mediumship in Africa and Afro-America: An Annotated Bibliography,* by I. Zaretsky and C.
Shambaugh, lists 2,054 items. It is indexed in only fifteen major subject classifications, from “Ethnic Groups” and “Miscellaneous Groups” to “Speaking in Tongues.” There is much material on Christianity in Africa to be found here, but no indication (as with most special bibliographies) where documents are located.

The work of H. W. Turner, *Bibliography of New Religious Movements in Primal Societies,* and the preservation of the cited documents on over 800 microfiche, are seminal. The volume on black Africa lists 1,906 items and has a single index of “Authors and Sources” and a “Select Thematic Guide.” The bibliography itself is organized by major continental areas, then by political units, again, location of documents is not given. ICLDP, in comparison, already has compiled over 4,000 documents on black Africa.

*Bibliography of the Tswana Language: A Bibliography of Books, Periodicals, Pamphlets, and Manuscripts to the Year 1980,* by M. André Peters and Matthew Mathéthélé Tabanem, lists 1,257 items, with a single keyword index at the back of the bibliography. In this keyword list, numerous Christian documents are indexed, especially items relating to the Methodist Church of Southern Africa, versions of the Bible, and catechetical materials. Within the layout of the bibliography itself, Bible translations, hymnals, and materials from the Church of the Province of South Africa (Anglican) are grouped together. The location of documents is not given, but it is presumed to be in collections in South Africa. ICLDP lists these various materials in the Tswana language in a separate subject classification and indexes them under relevant subject headings.

The volume by Yvette Scheven, *Bibliographies for African Studies, 1970-1986,* contains a section (pp. 292-303) of specialized bibliographies dealing with religion. Bibliographies listed range from full monographs to research articles. Citations are annotated, but only brief indexing for them appears in the single keyword index at the back of the book. The location of the documents is also not given.

Finally, there are numerous general bibliographies of African, such as the *International African Bibliography* (including J. Pearson’s helpful 1982 cumulative volume), the annual *Africa Bibliography,* or J. Asamani, *Index Africanus.* These do not by any means include a majority of citations to materials on either religion or Christianity and, though helpful, do not compare to the bibliographic focus of the ICLDP.

Given its general mission of bibliography and document availability, what are some particular highlights within the ICLDP database? A selection of a few multi-author books displays some of the bibliographic personality of the project.

ICLDP includes unusual multi-author works, such as a collection of testimonies given by Chinese and Korean clergy to the U.S. House Un-American Activities Committee during the Eighty-sixth Congress. Five indigenous ministers (Peter Chu Pong, Shih-Ping Wang, Tsin-Tsai Liu, Samuel W. S. Cheng, and Kyung Rai Kim) gave autobiographical testimony about their persecution and their view of Communist “brainwashing” and propaganda. The unique feature of ICLDP is that this type of document is accessible not only by looking, for example, for the group name “Committee on Un-American Activities” but also by looking under a variety of topical headings such as “Refugees, Political” and “Christian Biography.”

Individual articles within more conventional and perhaps more well-known works may also be overlooked by a researcher. *Ministry of Missions to African Independent Churches,* which concerns the cooperative ministry of a Mennonite mission with the West African people, includes a range of work. In this work, Marie-Louise Martin’s article is a sociological study of the present organization of the churches originally founded by Simon Kimbangu. James R. Krabill studies the phenomenon of schisms in a church founded by William W. Harris. Other articles research more familiar mission topics such as attempts to bring theological education extension programs to members of these different churches; see Stan Nussbaum, “A Biblical Narrative Approach to Strengthening the Christology of Independent Churches in Lesotho,” and T. J. (Jack) Thompson, “TEE and AICs: Challenges and Problems of an Inter-Denominational Programme in Malawi.” In “A Beginning Ministry Among Refugee Ghanaian Independent Churches in Abidjan, Côte d’Ivoire,” Lew W. Cass explores the unique complications of relationships among Independent Churches, churches organized along Western lines, and traditional African religions.

In a collection of papers from the Third Asia Youth Resource Conference, held in Japan in 1982, *Oppressor and Victim,* ICLDP indexes the more formal presentations about concerns of Japanese Christians. Among them are “A Confessing Church” by Shoji Tasuku (with the text of a confession of responsibility during World War II by Kyōdan), which concerns a church’s view of possible rearrangement in the face of the country’s past, and “Minamata: Poisoning People for Profit,” which describes the damage caused to the health of a Japanese village by a corporation’s dumping of mercury-laden waste water. The book also includes short reports brought by the delegates concerning issues in their homelands. Such reports are often brief; when gathered together, however, they can be very useful. Each report is indexed to give the user easy access to societal concerns and social service of individuals and small groups in particular countries. In this case there are reports from twelve different countries concerning such issues as economic development (Thailand), the impact of militarization on a civilian population (Sri Lanka), the struggle for independence in Sarawak, and the concern over disposal of radioactive waste (Taiwan).

When ICLDP indexes multi-author works by the names of organizations and agencies, a wide range of material is filed together that may not have been apparent in another format. Documents disseminated from specific agencies or about specific agencies are grouped together. The names of these groups are called “corporate names,” the scope of which is far-ranging: from “World Student Christian Federation” to “Southern African Catholic Bishops’ Conference” to “Negotiating Committee for Church Union in North India and Pakistan.” Inactive as well as active groups are included. Individual papers, reports, and proceedings of a general assembly are easily found. In addition, indexed under the organization’s name can be found conference preparation papers—for example, *Bible Studies and Section Papers on the Theme “Jesus Christ Sets Free to Serve”*; *In Preparation for the Eighth Assembly of the Christian Conference of Asia.* Smaller conferences sponsored by one or more organizations can be found...
under each agency’s name. For instance, Christian Response to Race and Minority Issues in Asia: Proceedings and Findings of a Regional Consultation Organized by CCA in Cooperation with WCC is indexed under “Christian Conference of Asia” and “World Council of Churches.” Reports on the work being done by the commissions of an organization between its general conferences are also found under that organization’s name. In this manner the ICLDP indexes such volumes as EACC-UIM Project Reports, 1971 and Report of Situation Conferences (conferences of the members of the East Asia Christian Conference in 1952). The ongoing work of a particular organization and its commissions is thus apparent at a glance.

These brief examples of some of the types of documents indexed may be multiplied by thousands. Researchers in missions and in non-Western Christianity will find such riches throughout ICLDP, in a format that is easily used and friendly to the experienced investigator as well as to the browsing reader. Nuanced bibliography and document availability bring much-needed aid to the burgeoning North American study of the phenomenal growth of Christianity in the non-Western world.

Interested parties may contact the Project Director at the American Theological Library Association, 820 Church Street, Suite 300, Evanston, Illinois, 60201, or can telephone 708-869-7788 for information and to be added to an information mailing list about this project. Distribution of the first cumulated index is scheduled for early 1993, when initial indexing will be done and the next stages of ICLDP will be in sight. It will be released in full, cumulated form in both printed volumes and in the ATLA CD-ROM. At the same time, selected segments of the whole database will be available so that researchers who have specific geographic interests may purchase bibliography that pertains only to those interests.

Notes

1. The term “non-Western” in this paper is used specifically to refer to publications that neither document Christianity in North America or Western Europe nor are produced by culturally established presses or organizations in these places. The practical aspects of missions research and the globalization of theological education, as scholarly agendas, provide the form and substance of this new index. The changing consensus about the scope and meaning of terms such as “non-Western,” “Two-Thirds World,” “Third World,” or “developing nations” is taken as a creative force in this project’s life.


4. Perils the indigenous publishers themselves face, both in production and distribution, are well known. For example, see Jean Dihang, “Publishing and Book Distribution in Francophone Africa: The Example of Editions CLE, Yaoundé,” in Publishing in Africa in the Seventies: Proceedings of an International Conference on Publishing and Book Development Held at the University of Ilf, Il-Ife, Nigeria, 16-20 December 1973, ed. E. Oluwasanmi, E. McLean, and H. Zell (Ile-Ife, Nigeria: Univ. of Ilfe Press, 1975), pp. 128-33. The Centre de Litterature Evangelique had the first press publishing in French in Africa and was a combined initiative of various Protestant bodies. Usefulness in this search are the volumes published jointly by the Catholic Media Council, the World Association of Christian Communication, and the Lutheran World Federation, Christian Communication Directory: Africa (Paderborn: Schöningh, 1982). Individual collecting from the bodies listed within these directories is, however, a time-consuming task. It is in some cases also a waste of time, for some libraries have already begun the process of contacting these bodies and collecting their materials. But how will a researcher know who is doing this, and how will other libraries know who is doing this? ICLDP can help.

5. Religion Index Two: Multi-Author Works (Evanston, Ill.: ATLA) has indexed some of these works since 1970. Not all libraries and researchers are yet aware of this bibliographic tool and the treasures it cites.

6. Monographs as a category include works for which an author or a group of authors are responsible for the whole. This group of works may be easy to acquire through the standard trade, or they may be rare pamphlets and booklets available only through cultivated institutional or personal contacts.

7. Multi-author works include conference proceedings, reports of consultations, books of essays, Festschriften, and congress reports.

8. The eight are (1) Pitts Theology Library, Emory University, Atlanta; (2) Burke Library, Union Theological Seminary, New York; (3) Union Theological Seminary Library, Richmond; (4) Sprer Library, Princeton Theological Seminary, Princeton, N.J.; (5) Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley; (6) Yale Divinity School Library, New Haven; (7) United Library, Evanston, Ill.

9. Presently the committee consists of Robert Dvorak, Winnetka Covenant Church; Douglas W. Geyer, ICLDP director; William Hook, director, Vanderbilt Divinity School Library; Albert E. Hurd, ATLA executive director; Ralph Klein, dean, Lutheran School of Theology in Chicago; Alan Neely, Henry W. Luke Professor of Ecumenics and Mission, Princeton Theological Seminary; Stephen Peterson, director, Trinity College Library (Hartford, Conn.); Dana Lee Robert, professor of international mission, Boston University School of Theology; Darrell L. Whiteman, E. Stanley Jones School of World Mission and Evangelism, Asbury Theological Seminary.

10. These materials include the Missions Pamphlet Collection, Manuscript Group No. 31; the London Baptist Missionary Society; and previously cataloged Yale missions acquisitions.

11. Users of this library should be aware that computer searches for these pamphlets on site will need some careful attention. Joan Duffy or Martha Smalley in the special collections department at Yale Divinity School Library can provide written instruction for local searching of these materials.

12. These agencies include schools, denominations, study centers, ecumenical centers, missionary organizations, or other similar entities.

13. Annotated bibliography, with summaries, book surveys, reports of conference, and indexes by authors and keywords (Aachen: Institute of Missiology). Coverage is mostly of periodicals, documentation that the ICLDP has so far avoided indexing.

14. This index, produced in Buenos Aires by Instituto Superior Evangelico de Estudios Teologicos, is distributed by the ATLA in Evanston. For information, contact Sang Hui Oh at 708-869-7788.


An example of the latter is the developing International Association for
Mission Studies/Documentation, Archives, and Bibliography Network (IAMS/DAB). The DAB project has been in development through the 1980s. Researchers will also be aware of the microform products of the Inter Documentation Company in the Netherlands, where bibliography and document dissemination are combined. This includes the famous CIDOC collection, *The History of Religiosity in Latin America* (under the direction of Valentina Borremans, El Colegio de México), Protestant Missionary Work in Chinese from the Harvard-Yenching Library, and numerous archives. Similarly, the researcher will also be familiar with the microfiche collection from the Selly Oak Colleges Study Centre for New Religious Movements in Primal Societies (894 fiche; 1983). See note 22 below.

22. To date *Bibliography of New Religious Movements in Primal Societies* is in four volumes (Boston: G. K. Hall, 1977-90). The microfiche collection was developed at Selly Oak Colleges, Study Centre for New Religious Movements in Primal Societies, and is produced by Advanced Micrographics in Wolverhampton, England. A *User’s Guide to the Microfiche Collection on New Religious Movements in Primal Societies* was published by Selly Oak Colleges in 1983 (71 pp.). According to an OCLC search, the complete microfiche collection is available in the United States at Emory University, Fuller Theological Seminary, Asbury Theological Seminary, Assemblies of God Theological Seminary, Westminster Theological Seminary, and Columbia Bible College. The *Guide* alone is available at the Billy Graham Center at Wheaton College.

23. Volume 4 of *Bibliography of New Religious Movements in Primal Societies*, dealing with Europe and Asia, lists 1,741 items and has indexes of “Authors and Sources” and “Main Movements and Individuals.” The bibliography is organized by political units, with a helpful section on “Particular Movements,” which includes the Iglesia ni Cristo, Philippine Independent Church, and the Unification Church (Korea).
Wednesday mornings, Asbury's ESJ students and faculty gather as a community of believers bent on making disciples.

See it in their eyes...vision that looks beyond borders, over barriers, to fulfill Christ's call to mission.
Hear it in their voices...the burden of rigorous study enhancing their effectiveness.
Feel it in their hearts...God preparing them at Asbury to go forth to minister to their own people and to other cultures.

Now, do more than see it in their eyes...discover how you can learn to make strong disciples.

Write or call for information.

Call Admissions TOLL FREE in the continental U.S.: 1-800-2-ASBURY or (606) 858-3581 in Kentucky (Eastern time).
The Legacy of John Alexander Mackay

Samuel Escobar

The missionary legacy of John A. Mackay can be measured by the deep mark that his life left in both the church and the world during the twentieth century. When Mackay died in 1983, the impact of his life and teaching upon Latin American culture was summarized by Luis Alberto Sánchez, well-known historian and literary critic in the Spanish language, who at that time was also vice president of Peru. He wrote that Mackay had been “one of the men to whom Peru and Latin America are indebted the most,”1 because of his interpretation of the Latin American spiritual condition. We could add the key role played in Peruvian culture by the school he founded,2 and the decisive formative influence he had on the lives of two giants of Latin American history in our century: José Carlos Mariategui and Víctor Raúl Haya de la Torre.3 In many of the books of Mackay’s library in Princeton, the dedicatory words of Latin American authors from the right and the left—Christian and non-Christian alike—express affection and recognition of the influence that he exerted on them.

At Mackay’s funeral William Felmeth, vice president emeritus of Princeton Seminary, summarized Mackay’s work for the church universal, described him as “one of the great pioneers of the Christian ecumenical movement.”4 A cursory look at the main points of Mackay’s career shows how it is intertwined with the great milestones of missionary and ecumenical history in our century. The writings of Latin American ecumenical theologians like Emilio Castro and José Míguez Bonino, or evangelicals like René Padilla and Pedro Arana, show Mackay’s pervasive influence. In Latin America he pioneered a new form of evangelism to reach the unchurched and paganized elites, especially university students. He drafted documents that are points of reference of church history in our time and created metaphors and aphorisms that are part of the theological heritage of the church universal. His life and career were a unique blend of the best of the evangelical and the ecumenical movements.

Stages of a Missionary Life

Mackay’s former students and colleagues in Peru give testimony to the impact of his presence on their lives in the early years of his missionary career, coinciding in this with the testimony of those who shared his retirement life in Meadow Lakes, New Jersey.5 Writing about Mott, Unamuno, and Speer, Mackay expressed his conviction that one life can exert decisive formative power upon other lives, and he patterned his own life according to that conviction. Mackay’s biography can be constructed around decisive moments that he himself identified when he was invited to “ascend the balcony of remembrance . . . and in retrospective mood describe the road I have traversed, interpreting the things learned on the way.”6 The vast reservoir of his life experiences can be arranged in five stages.

Childhood and early youth in Scotland (1889-1906). John Alexander Mackay was born May 19, 1889, in Inverness, Scotland, in the home of Duncan and Isabella Mackay. His earliest memories included the Scottish landscape of “shores of the sea loch and the hills behind the shore” and family life centered around the Bible and prayer, with which the day started and ended.7 The Mackays were members of the Free Presbyterian Church, and John recalled more than once the piety and devotion in that community, but also its petty and almost sectarian parochialism. However, he could not forget that in its membership there were men and women, like his parents, “who were saintly Christian people in the deepest sense.” In 1903, “at a communion service celebrated on a hillside under the auspices of this denomination Jesus Christ spoke to my boyhood heart and I became his forever.”8 As an octogenarian in 1970, he recalled, “I experienced a revolutionary change of attitude toward God, toward myself and toward others. Of a sudden I found myself a new being . . . Moments of rapture were not uncommon in those first months. In solitary hikes among the Scottish hills I conversed with God. Jesus Christ became the center of my being.”9

Student days and training for mission (1906-16). The Royal Academy of his hometown prepared him for entrance in the University of Aberdeen in 1907. There he studied philosophy, became active in student groups, and discovered a missionary vocation. In 1910 Robert E. Speer visited Aberdeen and had a powerful impact on Mackay, who recalled the encounter: “I felt when I saw him and heard him that I had never listened to a more extraordinary speaker in my life.”10 Mackay’s missionary vocation was clarified and focused by his friendship with Jane Logan Wells, a student of the Training Center for Teachers, who later on became his wife and partner of adventures. He received his master of arts in 1912 and the following summer sailed for the United States to study theology at Princeton, where he became involved in the Student Volunteer Movement. In the Christmas vacation of 1913 there began a friendship with “three men who became the heroes of a host of young people, as they became mine: John R. Mott, Robert E. Speer, Samuel M. Zwemer.”11 The relationship thus formed was to be decisive for the church in our century.

Mackay graduated from Princeton in 1915 and spent four months taking an exploratory trip of Latin America for the Free Church of Scotland.12 From it came the conviction that Peru would be the country where he would go as a missionary. Following advice from B. B. Warfield, one of his teachers at Princeton,13 Mackay spent the 1915-16 academic year in Madrid,
where he studied Spanish intensively and lived in the “Residencia de Estudiantes,” a center of intellectual ferment. During the Christmas vacation of that year in Salamanca, he met Miguel de Unamuno, Christian thinker and mystic who exerted a deep influence on Mackay’s missiological outlook. About his student pilgrimage, Mackay says: “At the core of my movement from one academic center to another was a preoccupation with what I had come to regard as God’s call to be a Christian missionary. Isought the cultural preparation that seemed most expedient to equip me for effective missionary service.”

Missionary service in Latin America (1916-32). Mackay married Jane in August 1916. Of their relationship he said: “We were one, both in our evangelical commitment, our religious experience, and also in a desire to devote ourselves to missionary activity.” After some weeks of visits to local churches promoting interest in the new mission field opened by the Free Church of Scotland, they sailed for South America, arriving in Lima, the capital city of Peru on November 21. Mackay’s exploratory trip had convinced him that he would not be entering Peru “as an unwelcome intruder,” and that in Lima, there was “a great and unique sphere for a Free Church Educational Mission.” With his wife’s help he took over a school that the Regions Beyond Missionary Union was at the point of closing, and both dedicated their energies to turning it into a model educational institution. Those who have studied the impact of Mackay’s school—Colegio Anglo Peruano (later to be named Colegio San Andrés)—judge his effort to have been successful. In response to the social conditions in the country, Mackay developed financial and educational policies that would allow him “to touch the community at as many points as possible of its social structure.” Three of the Mackay’s children were born during their time in Peru: Isabel Elizabeth, Duncan Alexander Duff, and Ruth. Their daughter Elena Florence was born in Scotland.

Mackay entered San Marcos University and took an active part in the cultural life of Lima. In that way he attracted as teachers for his school a group of young intellectuals and writers that constituted a liberal generation open to change and reform. He remained in Lima, where he remained in hiding until the secret police caught him in October 1923.

In 1925, in Montevideo, Uruguay, Mackay had another encounter with Robert E. Speer, who was attending the Congress on Christian Work in South America. Mackay’s trips had opened a new field to his vision, and he decided to leave his educational work in Peru for evangelistic work among students all over Latin America, under the auspices of the YMCA. He moved to Montevideo in 1926 and then to Mexico. “For a little over six years,” writes Latourette, “Mackay traveled and lectured not only in South America but also in Mexico, and made a profound impression upon audiences of the educated of these lands. He gave about three or four months annually to lecturing, and the rest of the year to writing, to teaching in the secretaries training college, and to the Association in Buenos Aires.” Two books that Mackay wrote in Spanish during this period are the result of his evangelistic and teaching ministry: El sentido de la vida and Mas yo os digo. Both have been reprinted many times. On the basis of his missionary experience, when Mackay participated in the first meeting of the International Missionary Council in Jerusalem (1928), he was able to speak convincingly about “the evangelistic duty of Christianity” and “the power of Evangelism in Latin America.” These themes became distinctive notes of his contribution to the ecumenical movement: the imperative of evangelism for the church, and the legitimacy of evangelical missionary work in Latin America.

In 1929 the family spent a furlough in Europe, and Mackay again visited Unamuno, then exiled in France. Then he spent four months in Bonn, where he became a close friend and the first tutor in English of Karl Barth. This theological giant had a decisive influence on Mackay’s theology and on his move from the YMCA into a new sphere of service directly related to the church. Though confessing that he agonized about it, Mackay says that “the decision, when finally made, was influenced by the place which the Church and life in a local parish had had upon the thought of Karl Barth.” So in 1932 the Mackays left Mexico, and he became secretary for Latin America in the Board of Foreign Missions of the Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A.

Active service to mission from North America (1932-59). A wider sphere of influence opened for Mackay’s missionary passion. An important part of his job description was the education of persons and congregations for mission. Though some of his literary dreams could not be accomplished because of what he called “a violent transition from literary freedom to administrative responsibility,” it was in 1932 that he published what may be his most famous book: The Other Spanish Christ, an effort to interpret the spiritual reality of the Iberian and Iberoamerican nations.

In 1936, Robert Speer was again influential in Mackay’s decision to accept an urgent invitation to become the president of Princeton Theological Seminary, and professor of missions and the history of religions. A Methodist friend had convinced him that “a theological seminary campus could also be a mission field” and that consequently “his missionary vocation need not end.” Mackay’s alma mater had been torn apart by bitter controversies and theological battles, and among the Presbyterians to whom it was related, the situation had become one in
which “an alternative was needed which moved beyond both
Fundamentalism and Modernism.” He committed himself to
work for what he called the restoration of theology, giving again
a central place to the Bible as God’s authoritative Word and at
the same time insisting upon the missionary thrust that should
characterize theological work.

The magazine Theology Today, which Mackay founded in
1944, became a key factor in the impetus for what has been called
the biblical theology movement. He wrote in one of his editorials:
“The Bible is . . . more than a repository of great literature and of
high religion, more than the source book of revealed truth; it is
above all else the supreme medium of divine-human intercourse.
This view of the Bible stands closest to the pristine Christian
tradition, and is that which is representative of Protestant Christ­
ianity at its best . . . . Here God speaks directly to men today in
all the complexity of their need, in all the phases and aberrations
of their human situation.” Some of Mackay’s key convictions as
they took shape in this stage of his life are encapsulated in three
books that he came to see as “an undesigned trilogy” with a
message summarized in his famous aphorisms: A Preface to
Christian Theology (1941), where his message was “Leave the
balcony for the road”; Heritage and Destiny (1943), which embod­
ied the thought, “The road to tomorrow leads through yester­
day”; and Christianity on the Frontier (1950), whose burden was,
“Take the road to the frontier.”

Under Mackay’s leadership at Princeton a doctoral program
was begun in 1940, and an Institute of Theology for continuing
education began in the summer of 1942. Facilities like the Cam­
pus Center were built as an expression of a pedagogical philoso­
phy that was consistent with Mackay’s theology. Cintrén rightly
comes to the conclusion that “as President of Princeton Semi­
inary Mackay brought to an end an old order of theological rigidity and
inaugurated an era of dynamism and progress in all aspects of
the life of the theological institution.” Many who graduated
from Princeton in those years remember the personal touch of
Mackay’s relationship with the students, and the energetic and
efficient cooperation of his wife, Jane, to keep the doors of their
home always open to students, teachers, and staff.

During this period Mackay participated in the development
of the ecumenical movement, at the service of which he put his
unique administrative and diplomatic skills. Trying always to
bring to it the fire of his evangelical zeal, he also demonstrated a
high regard for church order, historical awareness, and ecclesias­
tical strategy. His participation as chairman of Commission V in
the “Conference on Church, Community, and State” in Oxford
(1937) was the source of one of the famous slogans that Mackay
coined, “Let the Church be the church.” Between 1947 and 1957
he was honorary chairman of the International Missionary Council
and presided at its meetings at Whitby, Willingen, and Ghana.
He took an active part in the preparations for the Amsterdam
Assembly of the World Council of Churches (1948), where he
preached the opening address, entitled “The Missionary Legacy
to the Church Universal.” The burden of this message was that
the ecumenical movement should keep true to its origins in the
missionary movement and that for the Christian church to be
truly the church, it must be a missionary as well as a worshiping
fellowship. After the formation of the WCC he served as member
of its Central Committee from 1948 to 1957. He was also active
in the formation of the Federal and National Council of Churches in
the U.S.A. From the ground of this practice as an enthusiastic
servant of the church universal came his creative reading of
Scripture, evident especially in his commentary on the Epistle to
the Ephesians: God’s Order: The Ephesian Letter and This Present
Time (1953). To these years belong also the series of lectures he
presented at Austin (1952) and Buenos Aires (1953), published

Mackay was also active in the service of his own denomina­
tion. In 1954 he was elected president of the World Presbyterian
Alliance and traveled widely, especially to Eastern and Latin
Europe and Latin America. He interpreted the Presbyterian
heritage for our times and at the same time interpreted the
realities of Protestantism in other regions of the world for the
North American public. His book The Presbyterian Way of Life
(1960) is what he calls “the embodiment of a paradox” in his life:
“On the one hand, I am today a more convinced and loyal
Presbyterian than I ever have been before. On the other hand, I
am less of a Presbyterian absolutist and sectarian than at any time
in my life.” At the time of ideological inquisition brought to
American life by the anti-Communism of Senator Joseph
McCarthy, Mackay was moderator of the General Assembly of
the Presbyterian Church and drafted the letter that was after­
ward adopted by the 166th Assembly of the church. This “Letter
to Presbyterians Concerning the Present Situation in Our Coun­
try and in the World” has the distinctive note of Mackay’s
prophetic voice and was a ray of light and hope in the darkness
of those moments. Mackay was seventy when he retired from the
presidency of Princeton in 1959.

A seasoned teacher in action (1960-1983). After retirement
Mackay continued teaching and in 1961 was appointed adjunct
professor of Hispanic thought in the American University of
Washington. He returned to the love of his youth for the Hispanic
world. In the agitated sixties, the explosion of a long-due social
revolution, of which Fidel Castro became a symbol, had in
Mackay a careful interpreter. Two articles in the Christian Century
after his visit to Cuba (1964 and 1965) brought a great amount of
controversy. In his interpretation of Latin America, Mackay
kept both evangelical conviction and great sensitivity to political
realities. Several of the themes that had demanded his attention
through decades of missionary reflection and action were elabo­
rated in a systematic way in his book Ecumenics: The Science of
the Church Universal (1964). In it he aimed to address “everything
that concerns the nature, functions, relations and strategy of
the Church Universal, when the latter is conceived as a missionary
community.”

The seasoned teacher was also open to acknowledge the
changes that were taking place in the Roman Catholic Church.
For a man who had been a watchdog for religious freedom in
Latin America against restrictive policies of conservative Cathe­
colicism, it was a great occasion to be asked in 1967 to address
a conference of the Catholic Inter-American Cooperation Pro­
gram (CICOP) on the subject of “Historical Perspectives on
Protestantism.” In that piece Mackay welcomed the signs of
change in Rome, but he also rejoiced in events and movements as
varied as the growth of Pentecostal churches, the work of the
Wycliffe Bible Translators, and the Church and Society (ISAL)
movement, which was a forerunner of liberation theologies. His
teaching and journalistic activity continued even after he
moved with his wife to a life of quieter retirement in Meadow
Lakes, New Jersey. Mackay went to be with his Lord on June 9,
1983.

The Theological Ground of Missionary Action

In his prolific writing as a theologian and a journalist, Mackay set
the hard facts of everyday history under the light of biblical truth.
As he said, “Relating itself to the realities of life theology must
God Has A Dream For Our Cities...

Life began in a garden, but now, both here and abroad, some 80 percent of the world’s population lives in large cities teeming with amazing cultural and ethnic diversity. There is an increasing gap between the rich and the poor. The middle class is being squeezed like never before. Everyone feels constricted by the pressures of life.

In the midst of all the struggles and increasing hopelessness, God still has a dream for our cities… a dream of reconciliation, empowerment, justice, opportunity, physical and mental wholeness.

At Fuller Theological Seminary, we offer you an opportunity to catch God’s dream for today’s cities while studying Urban Ministries through our Schools of World Mission and Theology.

Our Southern California location will expose you to one of the most culturally diverse metropolitan areas in the world. Fuller’s faculty is the largest multidisciplinary resident faculty at any seminary — anywhere. We are committed to evangelical faith rooted in God’s Word, the Bible.

Come to Fuller. Study hard. Dream big. Get hands-on experience. And become a world-changer in our Urban Ministry program.

For more information, call today: 1-800-235-2222 and ask for an admissions representative at extension 5400.

FULLER THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

School of World Mission

In Los Angeles, there exists a city within a city, a place where today’s masses of urban poor encamp beneath the shadows of skyscrapers housing some of America’s most significant corporations. God loves the tent dwellers — and the high-rise executives. He has a dream for their lives. At Fuller, we can help you become part of making that dream a reality.
reinterpraret to the milling crowd, to those locked in daily strife, as well as to wayfarers and pilgrims on the march, the meaning of their existence and the hope of salvation. His writings convey a sense of movement and advance, and his books have a clear and logical structure because he did what his teacher Unamuno proposed: he married a few basic ideas and lived with them in order to procreate theological reflection. In one of his last autobiographical notes he recalled the “major realities” that had “shaped his thinking and his living down the years,” namely “the reality of God as a loving and sovereign presence” and “the incarnational approach to the human situation.” These were the source of his missionary style and the core of his missionary legacy.

Though attentive to the whirlwind of theological developments in our century, and forward-looking in his missiological thrust, Mackay’s theology retained from his Reformed roots a sense of wonder, solemnity, and devotion when he referred to God. The motto of his school in Aberdeen, which he also adopted order to procreate theological reflection. In one of his last autobiographical notes he recalled the “major realities” that had “shaped his thinking and his living down the years,” namely “the reality of God as a loving and sovereign presence” and “the incarnational approach to the human situation.” These were the source of his missionary style and the core of his missionary legacy.

Mackay married a few basic ideas and lived with them to procreate theological reflection.

Lessons from a Missionary Style

Missionary life for Mackay had to be a Christ-centered life. He recalled many times the motto of Raymond Lull: “I have one passion in life and it is He.” The mark of greatness of his heroes Mott and Speer was for him that they could be described as Christ-centered persons. The blend of theology and commitment that this meant he repeatedly explained throughout the years: “I caught from St. Paul in his letter to the Ephesians a vision of Christ as the center and meaning of all things. As I have so-journed since then from land to land and from post to post, my faith has not wavered that Christ is the Saviour and the Lord of life. He has been in his historical and cosmic relations the master light of all my seeing; he has been the companion of my way.”

This relationship with Jesus Christ brings also an imperative call to missionary involvement: “Jesus Christ, the world’s Saviour, summons his whole Church to missionary action. He bids His Church to go in the Spirit of his love to all men everywhere for their physical succour. He commands His Church to bring all men everywhere to His living self for their spiritual redemption.” From the ground of this Christ-centeredness we can better grasp what Mackay called his incarnational approach to the missionary task.

Incarnational style and cultural sensitivity. It is amazing how many Latin Americans came to regard Mackay as one of their own. In preparation for his missionary service in Peru, he had learned to speak Spanish with perfection. Before presenting the Gospel to Latin American youth, he took pains to understand the Iberian soul, as is evident in the book The Other Spanish Christ, which has become a classic; as Sanchez points out, it is “a fundamental book to appreciate Latin American culture.”

Mackay formulated his incarnational style in a principle: “the evangelical word must become indigenous flesh. The person who represents Christ and seeks to communicate the Gospel of Christ . . . must identify himself in the closest possible manner with his human environment.” With that sensitivity, from his watchtower at Princeton Mackay kept an attentive eye on the Iberian world, but also on Asia and Europe, doing his best to be a well-informed missionary interpreter of other parts of the world for his American audience. This cost him much pain in the dark days of McCarthyism. As he stood for fairness and dialogue with China, and later on as he tried to provide a context for an understanding of the Cuban situation, he was attacked by those for whom anti-Communism had become a new form of idolatry. In this point he was in the noble succession of so many true missionaries who became interpreters of foreign realities to their own people, holding a prophetic self-criticism even at the cost of rejection and misunderstanding.

A sense of history and strategy. Mackay’s outlook was permeated by a deep awareness of momentous times and movements, which can be understood only within the frame of God’s kairos in history. His strategic vision was nourished by this unique perception. When he arrived in Peru, he realized that the restless-ness of university students was a sign of the emergence of a new historical moment in which young people were the protagonists. The morass of a dying feudalistic order was going to be shaken by a new generation influenced by socialism and anarchism. In their search for justice, Mackay could detect in these young men a spiritual search, and he wanted to connect his missionary action with it through creative evangelism.

His moves to mission administration or theological education were also strategic shifts. He saw the timeliness of working to bring a renewed sense of mission and community to the theological task in his alma mater. He wanted to correct what he
called "the root weakness of popular American Christianity ... namely its untheological character, its virtual disdain of theology, its supreme and exclusive preoccupation with so-called practical issues."58 Years later he explained how the launching of the magazine Theology Today, the efforts to create new facilities, and even the schedule of meals at his president's home were set within the frame of that strategic vision.59 Mackay's writings about the Second World War in the forties60 and against the Vietnam War in the sixties61 were also born of this strategic sense of the historical.

An evangelical and contextual stance. As we have seen, the evangelical note of Mackay's missionary practice and theology is loud and clear. He had a definite Protestant outlook, but he saw with great concern the growing "religious nominalism and theological illiteracy" that had become characteristic of Roman, Orthodox, and Protestant traditions, in which “appearance has replaced reality.”62 He also wrote, "Protestantism, let it be emphasized, has not yet reached its religious majority, nor discharged its full historical mission. It is still in process of becoming; its heyday is not behind but before it."63

As he spoke in ecumenical forums from the background of his incarnational immersion in the Latin American reality, Mackay opened a way for the recognition of the right of Latin American Protestantism to exist in nominally Roman Catholic lands. In North America he continued to be a defender of that type of evangelical presence in Latin America and Latin Europe. His ecumenical vision was open to new developments in Rome but also firm in the conviction that the ecclesiological assumptions of the Roman Catholic Church were unacceptable and that "no amount of graciousness or evasiveness" should hide the differences. Still, he could write, "But Jesus Christ is Lord. Let dialogue and friendly relations, in the spirit of Christ, and under the guidance of the Holy Spirit, continue between Protestants and Roman Catholics."64

A missionary ecumenism. A deep sense about the significance of our century as the "ecumenical era" moved Mackay to invest time and energy in the great ecumenical conferences, of which many documents reflect Mackay's hand and style. Since 1948 he kept insisting on the need for ecumenism to remain faithful to a missionary vision, because the roots of the ecumenical movement were missionary: "Evangelistic fellowship on the missionary road preceded ecclesiastical fellowship in the home sanctuary. Christian churches who took seriously their missionary obligation and crossed the frontiers of non-Christian lands began to transcend the barriers by which they had been themselves divided in their own home countries."65 He regretted the trend toward making institutional and structural oneness the ecumenical ideal at the expense of missionary fervor, and he said that "the pursuit of unity on the part of the Christian forces dare never be made an end in itself."66

Conclusion

Mackay's theology and missionary style are a legacy that has a unique relevance to the contemporary situation. His criticism of nominal Christianity and his insistent call to conversion and to follow Jesus Christ on the road point logically to the kind of holistic evangelism from which a socially transformative faith is born. His sense of history informed by biblical categories gave him a clear and informed grasp of the demonic potential of some aspects of Marxist ideology that would lead to totalitarian regimes. This is a valid corrective to the uncritical acceptance of Marxist readings of history in some liberation theologies, a corrective especially relevant today in face of the collapse of Marxist theory and praxis in Europe. But equally relevant is Mackay's insistence upon the biblical demand and the moral validity of the struggle for justice. His epistemology rooted in biblical and Reformed emphasis on obedience to truth would coincide with the current insistence upon praxis, though he would prefer the term "obedience"—not a human initiative or achievement, but human response to God's initiative in Christ.

Mackay's reading of the Protestant heritage has much to say for North America in view of the current mood of retreat in Protestant thought and action, and there is unique relevance also in his criticism of an ailing ecumenism that has lost a sense of mission. The deep theological roots of Mackay's missiology, matched by his evangelical fire, can be one of the necessary correctives to the theological shallowness of the managerial trends that are corrupting the evangelical missionary enterprise today. In one of his final writings he said: "The supreme need in the Church of our time is new men and women, persons committed to Jesus Christ and to the timeless values of the Church's faith, who at the same time are dedicated to cooperating with fellow Christians in showing the present day significance of those values."67 John Alexander Mackay was one of those persons.

Notes

22. See especially the references in JAM, That Other America (New York: Friendship Press, 1935), chap. 3.
28. Ibid. 8:121-25.
30. Ibid., p. 290.
33. Ibid., p. 121.
43. JAM, Heritage and Destiny, p. 77.
44. JAM, "Life's Chief Discoveries," p. 291.
45. JAM, Christianity on the Frontier, p. 88.
52. "In Spain he had learned a magnificent Castillian," said Luis Alberto Sánchez ("Mackay y el Anglo-Peruano," p. 49).
54. JAM, Eumcenes, p. 173.
56. This understanding was forcefully expressed in A Preface to Christian Theology (New York: Macmillan, 1941), and God's Order (New York: Macmillan, 1955).
63. JAM, Christianity on the Frontier, p. 123.
64. JAM, Eumcenes, pp. 220-21.

Selected Bibliography on John A. Mackay

Books by Mackay

Books marked with an asterisk have been published in Spanish as well as in English, and most of them are currently in print. The best guide to the vast number of articles in magazines that Mackay left is found in the bibliography of Cintron's work below.


1934 The Other Spanish Christ. New York: Macmillan.*


Works about Mackay


Religion and Personal Autonomy
*The Third Disestablishment in America*
by Phillip E. Hammond

"Rather than rely on anecdotal evidence of religious individualism, Hammond uses survey data from four regions of the nation to provide an intimate look at the relationship between personal autonomy, parish involvement, and the 'meaning' assigned to this involvement."—Roger Finke, Purdue University

Cloth, 184 pages (est.), tables & charts, ISBN 0-87249-820-4, $29.95 (June)

Ritual Masks
*Deceptions and Revelations*
by Henry Pernet

Provides a thorough survey of masks and masking traditions in Africa, Oceania, and the Americas, based on a close analysis of the literature in several languages.

Cloth, 128 pages (est.), photographs & sketches, ISBN 0-87249-793-3, $29.95 (June)

by Joseph B. Tyson

Addresses the various ways in which Jewish religious life and Jewish people are presented in the Gospel of Luke and the Acts of the Apostles.

Cloth, 218 pages, ISBN 0-87249-794-1, $29.95

**Character and Ideology in the Book of Esther**
by Michael V. Fox

"With the lucidity we have come to expect of his work, Michael Fox addresses, with skill and precision, the finer points of exegesis in Esther and speaks, with profound sensitivity, to the theological and existential questions that the book raises from the modern reader. A helpful, readable and thought-provoking book."

—Danna Nolan Fewell, Southern Methodist University


Additional titles are available. Please call or write for a complete listing.

**UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH CAROLINA PRESS**
1716 College Street, Columbia, South Carolina 29208
1-800-763-0089
803-777-0160 (Fax)

Mention this ad when ordering directly from USC Press and receive a 20% discount. Code: IBMR
Mail orders must include $3.00 for the first book and $.50 for each additional book to cover shipping & handling charges.
My Pilgrimage in Mission

Louis J. Luzbetak, S.V.D.

Despite a number of major surprises along the way, my pilgrimage in mission, as I am now able to see it, has been actually in a more or less single direction. God does indeed work in marvelous ways.

My pilgrimage began in a deeply Christian home and family. My parents were of hardworking Central European peasant stock. They came to the United States in the early 1900s from Slovakia, while still teenagers. Although simple in their piety, they were religiously well informed and quite tolerant toward other Christian traditions. However, they did have very little use for two types of individuals—those that never went to church, whether they were Catholic or not, and those that were overzealous proselytizers, invading our neighborhood at more or less regular intervals and pressuring my parents to abandon their “misguided” faith and to “save” themselves and their offspring from almost certain hellfire while there was still time.

Joliet, Illinois, where I was born on September 19, 1918, was a small industrial city thirty-five miles southwest of Chicago, known especially for its steelworks and railroad yards, a city now twice its former size and different in many ways. But perhaps to most non-Jolietans the city was known simply as the site of a famous state prison.

My immediate neighborhood was remarkable for its cultural and religious diversity—a cultural diversity that has been largely responsible for my appreciation of ethnic diversity wherever I would later find it, and a religious diversity that has been at least partly responsible for my later ecumenical interests and commitment. Adjoining our small yard and modest, but comfortable, home were the homes of a Scottish family of the John Knox persuasion on our left and that of a strict Orthodox Jewish family, which for some time was also the home of the local rabbi, on our right. The other homes on the block were mostly those of Polish, Slovak, Ukrainian, Russian, Lithuanian, Norwegian, Hungarian, Syrian, and Irish families. To my parents, as to most immigrants from Slovakia, the parish church and school were of primary importance second only to their faith and family. Although my elementary school companions were therefore mainly Slovak and Catholic, my relationships outside of school hours reflected the heterogeneity described.

From my earliest years I could not but be deeply impressed by the life of dedication of my teachers, a community of Benedictine nuns, mostly of Slovak ancestry, not a few of whom were from the home parish itself, all totally committed to the ideals my parents valued and so profoundly cared about. I can still hear my first-grade teacher reminding me over and over again: “Just do your best and God will do the rest.” This truth was so much a part of my teacher that it also became a part of me. The sisters believed in the value of their religious life and teaching ministry, leaving no doubt, even in the youngest minds, that a church vocation was indeed the greatest of all vocations. The fact is that I cannot now recall ever having seriously thought about any career for myself other than a commitment to the mission of Christ. Not clear to me, however, and actually not of special concern, right into my college days, was the specific nature of the church vocation to which I felt I was called.

With the blessing and encouragement of my parents and my mission-minded pastor, I entered the Divine Word Mission Seminary at Techny as a high school freshman. I soon realized that the Society of the Divine Word, a modern missionary organization founded in Holland by a German and ethnically diversified even more than my neighborhood, could offer me an even wider scope of opportunities in mission than I had imagined possible. I had no doubt that this society would eventually find the slot for which I would be most suited. The Divine Word Missionaries became my second family, no less important in my pilgrimage than the first. In fact, all my general and theological education and spiritual formation from high school to ordination (almost fourteen years in all) was provided by this missionary society, which is named after, and totally dedicated to, the Incarnate Word and his Good News.

From my early college days I felt particularly proud of the role that the Divine Word Missionaries played in the development of an indigenous clergy around the world. In fact, I secretly hoped that I might someday be associated with this particular apostolate. I felt that this was one way in which it was possible for me actually to multiply myself as missionary a hundred times over. In fact, unexpectedly, my very first assignment was clearly in the direction of seminary teaching. Several months before assignments were normally given to the newly ordained, I was appointed for further theological studies at the Gregorian University in Rome. The first milestone on my pilgrimage was reached; I was heading for seminary work.

From Theology to Anthropology

The thought that I might someday be a professional anthropologist, however, had not as much as crossed my mind. At the close of my second year of postordination studies at the Gregorian University, I was one day called to the office of the superior general. (My residence during my studies in Rome was at the international headquarters of the society.) He suggested that I give up my theological studies at the Gregorian University, transfer to the University of Fribourg, and prepare myself to join Father Wilhelm Schmidt’s team of anthropologists. This “preposterous” idea, it seems, originated with Father Schmidt himself, one of the most respected and influential intellectuals and church leaders of his time.1 While on an official business visit to the Vatican in July 1947, Schmidt approached my superiors personally to convince them that postwar conditions demanded the presence of an American in his institute. Somehow it became clear that I was the “logical” and, in fact, “available” person.

The superior general must have read my mind, stunned as I

Louis J. Luzbetak is a Roman Catholic anthropologist, a member of the missionary Society of the Divine Word, and now in semiretirement. He serves as consultant at the society’s headquarters at Techny, Illinois, where he is continuing his mission-related study, research, planning, strategy development, and writing. He has formerly served as professor of missions, executive director of the Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate (CARA), editor of the international journal Anthropos, and as staff member of Vatican’s Pontifical Council for Culture. His best-known works are his handbooks The Church and Cultures: An Applied Anthropology for the Religious Worker (1963) and The Church and Cultures: New Perspectives in Missiological Anthropology (1988).
was at the thought of changing from theology and church law to the profane science of anthropology. As I stood motionless and silent, I asked myself: "Would not these two important years at the Gregorian University be wasted by making such a transfer?"

In anticipation of this objection, the superior general's reply and reasoning was simple enough: "A bit of extra exposure to theology has never hurt anyone." As I now reflect on my pilgrimage, I must admit that he was very much on the mark. My extra exposure to theology was not enough to make me into a great theologian or canonist, but it was an essential part of my pilgrimage and helped me develop a great interest in the theological and canonical dimensions of my future work as anthropologist.

Wilhelm Schmidt, whom I had always admired, was now my mentor and constant inspiration in my attempt to serve faith through science. It was my privilege to live for several years during my anthropological training with this great man in a community of about a dozen of his collaborators and students. In fact, as it turned out, I was the last student to receive a doctorate under his tutelage before he gave up his university post. It was by knowing this great scholar and seeing him serve his God, the church, and his missionary society that the specifics of my own vocation became clear to me. Somehow I felt that Wilhelm Schmidt was asking and personally challenging me over and over again: "If we are to love God with all our heart, with all our soul, with all our mind, and with all our strength, and our neighbor as ourselves, must we who live in the Age of Science not also love God and neighbor correspondingly with all the scientific strength with which our age is thus blessed?"

**From Anthropology to Applied Mission Anthropology**

The third critical point in my pilgrimage in mission was as totally unexpected as had been the first two. But first I must explain how it came about. It was Schmidt's practice to assign a specific geographic area to each member of the Anthropos Institute so that eventually the specializations would cover the whole globe. I was assigned an area I hardly knew existed, the southwest corner of the Soviet Union, the Caucasus region. As I soon learned, this was culturally and linguistically a very complex and extremely important area worthy of serious study. Many ancient ethnic groups, each with its own history, culture, and language, lived there almost unknown to the outside world. They had been tucked away in this high mountain passageway between Asia, Europe, and the Middle East since the great migrations of peoples many hundreds of years ago.

Ethnological literature in the major European languages about such groups was almost nonexistent. My first task, therefore, was to acquire a reading knowledge of Russian as I pursued my studies in general ethnology and my two minor fields, linguistics and comparative religion. I also spent two semesters at the University of Vienna, where there were a number of outstanding authorities in Soviet archaeology and linguistics, in the Caucasus in particular. Since my anthropological training took place during the height of the cold war, there was no hope, especially for an American, to do any ethnological fieldwork in the Soviet Union. It was in London that I found most of the Russian literature that I needed for my doctoral dissertation.

These otherwise uninteresting details form the background for what I regard as the third, and perhaps the most critical, point in my pilgrimage. To provide the necessary field experience that every anthropology student needed, and to broaden my anthropological vision (and, with the Caucasus being out of the question), I received permission to accompany my confrere and friend, Father Martin Gusinde, on a field trip to Angola. When this plan was foiled by serious flooding, I was assigned to New Guinea instead. This alternative I at first opposed, but I ended up spending almost four fruitful and enjoyable years in New Guinea (1952 to 1956), doing field research and guiding missionaries in ethnographic and linguistic work.

It was especially in New Guinea that I began to feel more and more the inadequacy of the traditional accommodational approach to missionary action, despite its many positive aspects. Such thoughts and frustrations as the following repeatedly ran through my mind: the Gospel message not only must be preached but must touch the very heart and soul of the people. But does it? The Christian faith, whether in the Third World or in one's own home parish, must be expressed in terms of nothing less than one's innermost self, one's innermost premises, basic attitudes, and fundamental drives, otherwise Christianity is not authentic. But is it actually being expressed in this manner? Evangelization and religious education everywhere in the world must deal not only with the whole mission of the church (including its teaching mission and its sacramental, social, institutional, and all other roles) but also with the whole culture and with culture as a whole, actually integrating the Gospel message with real life here and now. The evangelizer and the religious educator must deal with culture not as with a heap of unrelated odds and ends but as a living organic system. But how does one best analyze such an organism and how does one deal with it? Such and many other thoughts and problems, theological as well an anthropological, occupied my mind. The more I thought of such problems, the more I became convinced that the place to look for light would be in my own field, in the modern science of culture.

In fact, I became so convinced of the importance of cultural anthropology for the mission of the church, and so frustrated was I by the fact that so little attention was being given to the relation between faith and culture, that I was determined to do everything in my power not to return to my original specialization but rather to devote all my energy in the future to the application of anthropology to mission. This, I felt deeply, was my true and specific vocation, even if the very thought overwhelmed me. Nevertheless, with this decision my whole life seemed to fall into place. What I really had to do now was exactly what I learned in the first grade of parochial school: Do your best and God will do the rest.

My mind was made up: I would now work with other like-minded Christian anthropologists and missiologists, whatever their tradition, in a common effort toward the development of an applied anthropology specifically for mission. I would study, research, teach, and write anthropology, but it would be an anthropology at the service of missiology. I would go to missiology to identify the issues but to cultural anthropology to study and research such issues; I would lecture, teach, and write about missiological issues, viewing them through the eyes of an anthropologist. This was not an easy decision, because many an-
throphologists, even some of those closest to me, believed, and still believe, that my two fields are irreconcilable and that they should have nothing to do with one another. Others regarded, and still regard, any application of anthropology to mission or to anything else as totally unbecoming of a true scientist. I realized also that some of my colleagues would never be able to understand the Christian meaning of mission and would make it synonymous with proselytization in the sense of pressure, force, and manipulation, which I have always rejected, condemned, and avoided. The decision, as difficult as it may have been, was made a trifle easier for me when the sad news of Father Wilhelm Schmidt’s death reached me in New Guinea in February 1954; my hero might not have given his blessing to my abandoning the Caucasus, a specialization he personally had chosen for me and believed in most intensely.

A New Beginning

My mind was definitely made up. In season and out of season, I would “preach” anthropology to mission agencies, church administrators, missionaries in the field and those in preparation, and colleagues in anthropology, missiology, and other disciplines—not because I considered anthropology to be a panacea or because I felt that I had ready answers; rather, I was hoping that as disciples of Christ living in the Age of Science we together—practitioners and theoreticians, bishops, pastors, and their people, mission societies and boards—might look for the full and true relationship between the church and cultures.

My New Guinea experience offered me unparalleled opportunities to make both anthropological and missiological observations. The experience also provided me with rich linguistic opportunities not only to learn but, in some small way at least, also to contribute. In partnership with a government linguist, I was directly involved in standardizing the spelling of Neo-Melanesian, more popularly known as New Guinea Pidgin, or “business” English. This interesting trade language is a true language, very expressive, easily learned by the indigenous population, and useful for the economic, social, and religious development of this second largest island in the world. New Guinea was nothing less than a veritable Babel of no less than 600 languages. Since the local languages nevertheless have to this day remained important, I tried to do in some small way what the Wycliffe Bible Translators are doing today: besides doing a very modest amount of translating, I analyzed and described in simple terms the grammar of one of the languages and worked on several other languages with fellow missionaries. Since most of the New Guinea highland languages were either still without an alphabet or the existing alphabets left much to be desired, I sought to develop orthographies for several of the indigenous languages, basing the spelling on a strictly phonemic analysis, with one distinct symbol for one meaningful sound, in the hope of facilitating literacy programs and other work of missionaries in areas where the use of Pidgin English was greatly limited. In any case, I have always felt that the language preferred both by the Creator and most human creatures is not any foreign tongue or way of life but the language and the culture that reflect the soul of a people—their own spoken and unspoken forms of communication.

I realized that the best way to achieve my goals was to try to do so through teaching, researching, and writing, sharing with others what I so strongly believed in. Over the years I have taught cultural anthropology, linguistics, and missiology: in Washington, D.C. (at the Catholic University of America and Georgetown University); at Techny, Illinois, to theology students at my alma mater; at Epworth, Iowa, as president of the Divine Word Seminary College; and again in Washington, D.C., as director of postordination pastoral and academic programs. For a number of years I also had the privilege of giving orientation courses in anthropology to large groups of missionaries in Cuernavaca, Mexico, and at the Catholic University of Puerto Rico. Even years before ecumenical cooperation was understood and encouraged, I gave a course to a Lutheran missionary group in Chicago (Maywood); lectures to evangelicals at Fuller Theological Seminary as church growth lecturer (the first Roman Catholic to be so honored) and to a very friendly, dedicated, but definitely motley group at Stony Point, New York; and to many other Catholic and non-Catholic groups in the United States and elsewhere.

The division among Christians has always pained me deeply. The old slogan “There is much more that unites us than divides us” has been more than a mere slogan to me. As a Roman Catholic, I have always welcomed the inspiration and friendly relationship with such organizations as the United Bible Societies, World Vision, the Summer Institute of Linguistics, the Overseas Ministries Study Center, and many others. Perhaps more than anything else I have appreciated the genuine ecumenical spirit of such professional associations as the International Association for Mission Studies and the American Society of Missiology. I felt greatly honored by having been chosen the second president of the ASM. It was also a privilege to be personally invited as a Roman Catholic observer to the International Congress on World Evangelization in Lausanne, Switzerland, in July 1974 and some years later to its follow-up consultation on Gospel and Culture at Willowbank, Bermuda, and to serve on committees and attend a number of important assemblies of the World and National councils of churches. I strongly feel that the hopes for mission that I have always expressed and the dreams I have today will be impossible without such close ecumenical cooperation and mutual enrichment.

Church-related Research

A very important part of my pilgrimage has been my role in church-related research, planning, and strategy development. I was the director of the Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate (CARA) during its first decade of existence. This U.S. Roman Catholic organization was founded in Washington, D.C., by the superiors of men and women religious, leading lay organizations, and a number of far-seeing bishops. CARA’s concerns were precisely where my own hopes were placed: in the total mission of the church especially as envisioned by Vatican II and by the many developments after the council. CARA’s staff included as many as thirty highly dedicated lay men and women, religious, and clergy, all working together researching, planning, and coordinating dozens of theological, psychological, sociological, anthropological, and other projects (often interdis-
NEW VIEWS ON CONTEMPORARY ISSUES

Conflicts Mediation
Across Cultures
Pathways and Patterns
David W. Augsburger
Believing that conflict is inevitable, essential and potentially constructive, the author provides, “...a book that, as the Book of Common Prayer puts it, must be ‘read, marked, and inwardly digested.’ ... It is a fresh, vitalizing force.”—Wayne E. Oates
Hard $24.95

Six Billion and More
Human Population Regulation and Christian Ethics
Susan Power Bratton
“Bratton has pioneered in laying the theological groundwork for developing a Christian contraceptive ethos. Few other texts could be as pivotal at a time of profound sociopolitical and environmental concerns.”—Carol Benson Holst
Paper $12.95

Envisioning the New City
A Reader on Urban Ministry
Eleanor Scott Meyers, Editor
Foreword by Harvey Cox
“A fascinating assortment of articles about urban ministry—some inspirational, some challenging, and some extremely practical.”
—Kimberley Bobo
Paper $22.95

Divided We Fall
Moving from Suspicion to Solidarity
T. Richard Snyder
Foreword by Gayraud Wilmore
Encouraging people to overcome the divisions of race, sex and class, “Snyder provides a role model for others.”
—Letty M. Russell
Paper $11.95

Social Ministry (Revised Edition)
Dieter T. Hessel
Providing new materials for his highly acclaimed earlier work, Hessel includes interviews with clergy and lay leaders, deriving fresh insight into what congregations are doing in society and the problems they are encountering.
Paper $13.95

At your bookstore, or
call toll free 1-800-227-2872
WESTMINSTER/JOHN KNOX PRESS
100 Witherspoon Street, Louisville, KY 40202-1396
ciplinary in nature), seeking ways of making the U.S. Catholic Church more effective and relevant in the modern world, at home and abroad. CARA research included the dissemination, interpretation, and application of the results of research through workshops, consultations, and publications and dealt with problems affecting U.S. minorities; overseas missions; renewal of religious orders; diocesan planning; diocesan rebuilding after a natural disaster; selection, training, placement, distribution, and effectiveness of church personnel; and countless other challenges, all calling for attention in the spirit of Vatican II. To be so closely associated with the American Catholic Church as I now was (including the hierarchy, their committees and diocesan offices, the laity, as well as religious orders in their drive for renewal) and to be associated with practically all aspects of mission was indeed an invaluable learning experience for me: I was able to observe mission with my own eyes in its fullness, complexity, and actuality.

Since I realized that after almost a decade at the helm of CARA it was time for a change on the executive level, I accepted the invitation of the Board of Directors of the Divine Word Seminary College at Epworth, Iowa, to become the president of this mission training center. Here one of my chief concerns became to develop in collaboration with the faculty a new, meaningful college-level and distinctly mission oriented program. This challenge was clearly a continuation of my pilgrimage in mission, an interesting experience that lasted five years.

A Link in Wilhelm Schmidt’s Legacy

My college presidency came to an end when the superior general of my religious order on a visitation to the United States approached me in the name of the Anthropos Institute, now located in Germany, suggesting that I accept the post of editor for its publications, especially for its internationally acclaimed periodical *Anthropos*. Originally the journal (founded in 1906 by Father Wilhelm Schmidt) was intended as an “archive” in which the linguistic and ethnographical studies of missionaries might be published and preserved. The journal, however, developed into a strictly professional publication with only a relatively few contributions by untrained anthropologists. As editor and acting director of the Anthropos Institute, I made a deliberate effort to tie the institute and its publications organizationally and programmatically even more closely to missionary goals, without sacrificing the professional character of the institute.

After my agreement with the Anthropos Institute expired in 1982 and as soon as I was able to propose a suitable successor, I returned to the United States to carry out an important earlier commitment: I was to update and rewrite my 1963 handbook in missionary anthropology, *The Church and Cultures*. The rewriting of this work, then almost twenty-five years old and often reprinted, had been generously and patiently subsidized by the Maryknollers, but my responsibilities at the Anthropos Institute had made the completion of this immense task impossible. Moreover, the developments in missiology and anthropology in the twenty-five years since my original *Church and Cultures* appeared were overwhelming. My return to the United States provided the necessary peace and time that such a gigantic rewrite demanded. I feel that somehow my whole journey in mission is reflected in this new work of almost 500 pages.

Upon completion of the new manuscript, my pilgrimage brought me to the Vatican; I was invited to serve on the Pontifical Council for Culture. Needless to say, to work at and with the most important office of the Roman Catholic Church specifically focused on the area of my deepest concerns was an enriching and in many ways an important milestone in my pilgrimage in mission. I had agreed to serve at the Vatican for a two-year term. Now, at the age of seventy-three, I am completely free for research, writing, and occasional lecturing—in a word, free as never before, to share my pilgrimage with others.

I feel strongly that my hopes for mission will be impossible without close ecumenical cooperation.

Notes

NEW SONG IN THE ANDES, By John Maust, 1992, 143 pages, paperback.
Darkness for centuries dominated the lives of the Quichuas living in the shadow of Mt. Chimborazo, in Ecuador. Missionary work went on among them for decades with little, if any, fruit. Then God, by his Holy Spirit, broke through and an incredible harvest began. You will be challenged and lifted by the narrative as you read this remarkable story of God’s grace and the dedication of His people.
WCL219-0, RETAIL $9.95
Special postpaid discount - $7.00

One of the pressing issues facing the missions community today is the care of its people. Evangelizing the unreached is not without its costs. Missionaries thus need and deserve the best care possible to keep them resilient and effective. This book, a handbook for supporting and developing missionary personnel, is a collaborative effort of over 20 authors to address some of the cutting edges of missionary care. Dr. O’Donnell was co-editor of Helping Missionaries Grow.
WCL233-6, Retail $17.95x
Special postpaid discount - $14.00

A faithful, loving account of a unique organization, and a highly crucial movement within the larger cause of global missions, written by the man who gave it direction for over 30 years. It shows the God-given, God-guided, spiritual passion for the whole world in its classical role of a warm-hearted minority vision and cause, bursting out in fully legitimate structures before there ever were “denominational missions.” It portrays that holy energy within the IFMA continuing to serve selflessly and impartially, in wholesome mutual inspiration and accountability.
WCL235-2, Retail $13.95x
Special postpaid discount - $12.25

Theological Education by Extension (TEE) is often portrayed as a vision and a movement for the renewal of ministry in the church and in the world. The task of evaluation is to translate that vision into concepts and criteria that can be applied to the various components of TEE programs. This handbook is concerned primarily with self-evaluation in relation to planning, i.e. ways in which people who are engaged in TEE can clarify their goals and assess results in order to pursue those goals more effectively.
WCL229-8, Retail $7.95x
Special postpaid discount - $6.75

Theological Education by Extension (TEE) is often portrayed as a vision and a movement for the renewal of ministry in the church and in the world. The task of evaluation is to translate that vision into concepts and criteria that can be applied to the various components of TEE programs. This handbook is concerned primarily with self-evaluation in relation to planning, i.e. ways in which people who are engaged in TEE can clarify their goals and assess results in order to pursue those goals more effectively.
WCL229-8, Retail $7.95x
Special postpaid discount - $6.75

What do churches around the world have in common? The selection and development of local church leaders! While the forms of leadership development vary, the need for vision, guidance, motivation, coordination, and encouragement exist whenever Christians gather. Dr. Elliston, associate professor of leadership and development at the Fuller School of World Missions, writes on understanding leadership, values for Christian leaders, and patterns of spiritual leadership development.
WCL236-0, Retail $8.95x
Special postpaid discount - $7.00

A Bible-centered approach which first introduces the dynamics of conflict and the styles of conflict management and, with a solid Biblical background, identifies types of conflict and how to develop conflict management skills, applying them to cross-cultural situations.
WCL231-X, Retail $6.95x
Special postpaid discount - $6.50

A marvelous collection of previously published articles dealing with topics such as the missionary’s first years on the field, leadership training, opposition, persecution and competition, mission theory and practice, and others. Excellent for new missionaries and students in mission classes.
WCL234-4, Retail $12.95x
Special postpaid discount - $12.00

TO ORDER...
Send check or money order to:
WILLIAM CAREY LIBRARY
P.O. Box 40129
Pasadena, California 91114
Add $1.00 for handling. California residents add 7.25% for tax, L.A. County add 8.25%. To place your order using MASTER CARD or VISA phone TOLL FREE 1-800-MISSION (647-7466)

PRICES ARE SUBJECT TO CHANGE WITHOUT NOTICE
Messianic Judaism: A Case of Identity Denied

Walter Riggans

A truism of contemporary interreligious dialogue is that representatives of the various faith communities must accept and in fact welcome religious diversity and religio-cultural pluralism. If dialogue is to have integrity, each participant must be allowed to speak for and to be himself or herself. In no other sector has this point been more emphasized and modeled than in the Jewish-Christian dialogue. All are agreed that bridges need to be built between the Jewish and Christian communities to provide a better perspective on theological issues, to foster cooperation at socio-ethical levels, and to bring about Christian repentance of anti-semitic attitudes and actions, all hopefully leading to reconciliation and mutual respect.

However, one group that might serve as such a bridge—the Messianic Jewish community—is in fact rejected by both Jews and Christians involved in interreligious dialogue. Many people refer to such groups of believers as “Jewish Christians” or “Hebrew Christians.” These titles suggest a potential for bridge building. Here are people who might be expected to have sympathetic understanding of both Judaism and Christianity.

The truism of contemporary interreligious dialogue is that representatives of the various faith communities must accept and in fact welcome religious diversity and religio-cultural pluralism. If dialogue is to have integrity, each participant must be allowed to speak for and to be himself or herself. In no other sector has this point been more emphasized and modeled than in the Jewish-Christian dialogue. All are agreed that bridges need to be built between the Jewish and Christian communities to provide a better perspective on theological issues, to foster cooperation at socio-ethical levels, and to bring about Christian repentance of anti-semitic attitudes and actions, all hopefully leading to reconciliation and mutual respect.

However, one group that might serve as such a bridge—the Messianic Jewish community—is in fact rejected by both Jews and Christians involved in interreligious dialogue. Many people refer to such groups of believers as “Jewish Christians” or “Hebrew Christians.” These titles suggest a potential for bridge building. Here are people who might be expected to have sympathetic understanding of both Judaism and Christianity.

Yet this is the very point of contention. The overwhelming response of those engaged in interreligious dialogue is that Jewish Christians, and particularly Messianic Jews, are the least able to act as bridge builders. They are disqualified altogether from participation in the dialogue, let alone from any sort of leading contribution. Participants in the dialogue nevertheless do not refrain from speaking about Jewish Christians in a prejudicial way. Even as the right of self-definition is denied to Messianic Jews, both Jewish and Christian dialogue participants impose their own definitions upon them. Indeed, Messianic Jews are accused of syncretism, deception, cultic attitudes, and aberrant behavior, and their religious convictions and intentions are routinely called into question.

Messianic Jewish Distinctives

Broadly speaking, there are two wings within the community of Jewish believers. All hold in common the testimony that they have come to believe and experience Jesus of Nazareth not only as founder and head of the Christian church but also as Israel’s promised Messiah, Savior, and Lord. There are those who prefer the traditional title “Jewish Christians” or “Hebrew Christians”; others insist upon the title “Messianic Jews.” While many Jewish believers may accept both designations, a distinction exists that may be expressed in this fashion:

Those who wish to be known as Jewish or Hebrew Christians are signaling that the most important fact about their religious identity is that they are Christians; their Jewish origin is of secondary importance. They have chosen this identity in spite of the problems associated with Christians and Christianity in Jewish history. These believers will typically be members of traditional churches (Baptist, Presbyterian, etc.).

Those who insist on being known as Messianic Jews are making the statement that they are Jewish people who, in distinction from most Jewish people, and in conflict with the traditions of both church and synagogue, remain Jewish, and indeed discover a richer meaning in their Jewishness since coming to faith in Jesus. Jewish customs such as the celebration of Passover play a central role in the community and family life of Messianic Jews.

Perhaps the most distinctive feature of Messianic Jews is their commitment to planting Messianic Jewish congregations of believers. Although these congregations are open to non-Jewish membership (and indeed leadership), the ethos, ambience, and pattern of life and worship are in keeping with Jewish cultural traditions and sensitivities. These congregations are the prime social unit for the nurture and education of Jewish believers, and they provide a setting to which nonbelieving Jewish family members and friends can be invited without fear of frightening them off with offenses other than that of the Gospel itself.

Although there have been experiments with various forms of Messianic congregational life before (notably in the late nineteenth century in Bessarabia), the explosion of Messianic Jewish life in this century, especially in Israel and North America, is new. Messianic Jewish spokesmen sometimes use a metaphor taken from photography to describe their movement. They say that just as one must not judge a photograph while it is still developing but must wait until it is fully developed, so one must not make ultimate judgments about Messianic Judaism when it is yet in its infancy. While such comments cannot be used to plead for a moratorium on evaluation and analysis, perhaps the most important task at present is to become aware of the self-perception, the presuppositions, and the goals of the movement.

A History of Antagonism and Distrust

Both Christians and Jews fall back on historical and theological reasons for their distrust of Jewish Christians. Christians are suspicious of the claim that Jewish people can find fulfillment in Christ without first rejecting and discarding their Jewish traditions and distinctions. The church has insisted for so long on stereotyping all things Jewish as legalistic and based on works-righteousness that Christians tend to make a priori judgments.

Walter Riggans is a minister in the (Presbyterian) Church of Scotland who served for nine years in Israel before taking up his present post as Tutor in Biblical and Jewish Studies at All Nations Christian College in England. His Ph.D. dissertation on the contemporary Messianic Jewish movement was done through the Center for the Study of Judaism and Jewish-Christian Relations, in the Selly Oak Colleges at the University of Birmingham, England.
about the spiritual value of Jewish insights and traditional ways. For instance, when a Messianic Jew reports that he and his family celebrate the Passover, this is seen as a compromise of the crucifixion and resurrection of Jesus. My Messianic Jewish friends would answer that it is only when we appreciate the foundational context of the Passover that we can understand the full significance of the Last Supper, Jesus’ inauguration of the new covenant, and the creation of a community of believers under God. The Passover is just one example of Messianic Jewish values and practices that Christians stumble over.

Messianic Jews are often ridiculed on the grounds of plain naiveté in the face of history and the historical development of theology, both Jewish and Christian. It is certainly true that sometimes there can be a rather simplistic assumption that the Messianic Jewish movement will recover the pristine worship, theology, and lifestyle of the first generation of Christian believers. Talk of restoring the church to its former glory is bound to create a less than enthusiastic response from church leaders who are trying to apply their faith to today’s circumstances. Throughout history, however, many non-Jewish Christian movements have arisen (I am not referring simply to sectarian movements) making the same point about the need for a return to first- and second-century Christianity.

The other major issue is the fact that both the church and the synagogue have developed a great deal in their self-definitions, especially vis-à-vis one another, since the days of the early church. After centuries of horrific treatment of Jewish people by Christian churches and communities, it is little wonder that Jews distrust Christians in general and Jewish Christians in particular. Of course, Judaism defines itself in such a way that it excludes the possibility of Jesus being the Messiah. Given this background, Messianic Jews are seen as hindering rather than helping Jewish-Christian rapprochement.

Clearly, this is a highly emotive issue. This is due in part to the malaise caused when persons from one faith community join another. A Hindu becoming a Muslim in the region of Kashmir would probably be seen as exacerbating tensions rather than helping to restore mutual respect and good relations between neighbors. Likewise, it is no surprise to find a conspicuous lack of tolerance from the Jewish community toward Jewish people who convert to the camp of the traditional enemy, and by so doing become “traitors” and “apostates.”

From the Christian perspective, the supercessionist triumphalism that has dominated the church’s attitude to, and treatment of, both Jewish people and Judaism over the centuries has led to a willful refusal to see any good in the Jewishness of Jewish persons who become followers of Jesus and join local congregations of Christians. Jewish believers were made to discard their heritage altogether and submit to a process of Gentilization. The story is told of the pastor who waited until after the baptism of a Jewish person and then produced a bacon sandwich in front of the congregation, insisting that the individual eat it to prove the sincerity of his conversion. This is cultural insensitivity, personal insensitivity, and theological ignorance and arrogance of the highest order.

Throughout Christian history Jewish believers have been suspected of holding to a deficient Christology. It is difficult for Western Christians to imagine the harmful effect, cumulative over the generations, that this pressure has had on Jewish people who find themselves attracted by Jesus and the power of the Gospel. They experience a crisis of identity as they attempt to live out their faith in Jesus in a community of Gentile believers.

A Quest for Self-Identity

Although Messianic Jews may be an anomaly in both the Jewish and Christian traditions, there is no getting away from the fact that there has been a stream of convinced Jewish believers from the days of the apostles to our own. At various times and places this stream has been strong and fast-moving.

Since the late 1960s a new self-confidence has emerged with the rise of the Messianic Jewish movement, which has resulted in a growing assertiveness of their right to be who they are, to speak about who they are, and to expect to be accepted as they are by others. Is the reality of their life in Jesus to be denied because it does not suit the presuppositions of some Christians and Jews involved in interfaith dialogue? Are we Christians to reject these brothers and sisters in Christ because their existence raises questions for another religious tradition?

One of my most poignant personal experiences occurred during a conversation in Jerusalem between a Messianic Jewish friend of mine and a small group of non-Jewish Christians, of whom I was the only one supportive of my friend’s position. At one point a minister from Europe declared in no uncertain terms that the Jewish people have no need whatsoever for Jesus, that he was not Israel’s Messiah, and that fulfillment would come to the Jewish people simply from their on-going covenant relationship with God. My friend, for whom even the other antagonists were embarrassed, stood up, walked over to the minister, and said quietly to him, “Are you saying that I would be better off if I had not come to know Jesus as my Messiah, my Savior, and my Lord?” Suddenly everyone was aware of the reality of this Jewish believer’s relationship with Christ; he had to be listened to.

Agenda for Making a Way Forward

Both sociological and theological considerations must be addressed if a way is to be found to open the channels of communication with the Messianic Jewish community. By and large, studies of Messianic Jews have focused on sociological concerns: are these people simply marginalized individuals who in no way represent a significant tradition or community? Are they simply yet another cultic manifestation of deep psycho-religious neuroses within Jewish people? Are they motivated, consciously or subconsciously, by self-interest and the need for attention? All of these criticisms have been leveled by Jewish sociologists and historians.

My experience with Messianic Jews leads me to conclude that Messianic Judaism is not some cult or lunatic fringe. Jewish believers in Christ are in every way typical members of society: teachers, nurses, engineers, homemakers, students, unemployed; good parents and children, loyal friends and family members; stamp collectors, scout leaders, classical or rock music lovers, and so on. They are not people who are psychologically damaged or deficient, nor are they victims of coercion and manipulation at the hands of unscrupulous and mercenary missionaries. Yet this stereotype surfaces repeatedly in the media and from various religious platforms.

From the theological perspective, the central questions are, Where do Messianic Jews belong as a religious group? and, Do they have a distinctive role to play in interreligious dialogue?

Traditionally, Jewish believers have simply joined local churches and blended in with the Gentile majority. If they have been involved in evangelism, it has been in general parish outreach. Most theological studies have dealt with Jewish believ-
ers who have shown little interest in developing uniquely Jewish expressions of their faith, in terms of either drama, dance, art, or teaching about the Jewish roots of the church.

What is needed is a theological appraisal of the Messianic Jewish movement. From the very beginning of the life of the church there have been doubts about the orthodoxy of Jewish believers. Generally, however, scholarly attention has focused on the known and suspected aberrant groups, like the well-publicized Ebionites. The question before us is whether there is something inevitable about Messianic Jewish heterodoxy. Certainly, an examination of various statements of faith that have been produced by Messianic congregations and organizations fails to reveal any heterodoxy. The vast majority of Messianic Jewish people today belong to what is generally known as the conservative evangelical wing of the church. This will not suit all

If Jesus has nothing to say to Jewish people, then he has nothing to say to anyone!

Christians, but that does not diminish their right to be acknowledged as bona fide Christians.

A second concern is the nature of evangelism within the Jewish community and the methods used in that evangelism. The commitment of the Messianic Jewish community to evangelism is strong, one of the watchwords being that if Jesus has nothing to say to Jewish people, then he has nothing to say to anyone! A basic argument for establishing distinct Messianic Jewish congregations is to have effective evangelistic bases for reaching out into the Jewish community. According to Messianic Jewish leaders, only in such a community can one find adequate knowledge and understanding of the Jewish agenda and the sensitive support necessary for the nurture of inquirers and new believers.

Two factors that have played significant roles in the growing contemporary movement are the newly found social and political freedoms of Western Jewry as a whole, and the importance given to the missiological principle of contextualization. In the West, Messianic Jews have no cause to fear civic or political authorities when they meet openly for worship and evangelism. (Social structures and pressures are something else again, of course.) Moreover, there is now widespread sympathy among missiologists for the development of Christian worship and lifestyles that reflect the traditions and serve the needs of local cultures and subcultures wherever the Gospel is known.

Another matter for investigation is the charge that the Messianic Jewish movement is a deviant cult founded on authoritarian leadership, opposition to culture, ethnic exclusivity, religious legalism, brainwashing, and so forth. In my experience there is no evidence for this, but it is a handy stereotype for opponents of Messianic Judaism.

It is surely time that the Messianic Jewish community be acknowledged by both Jewish and Christian communities as being motivated by conviction, living with integrity, and being socially as well as theologically viable.

Those involved in interfaith dialogue who persist in denying the integrity and relevance of the Messianic Jewish movement are engaged in the most basic kind of betrayal of their own presuppositions and goals. They must ask themselves whether they are not indulging in their own kind of supercessionist triumphalism.

Selected Bibliography

Book Reviews

Translation as Mission: Bible Translation in the Modern Missionary Movement.


Anything written by William A. Smalley is bound to be comprehensive, accurate, and insightful, and in the preparation of this excellent volume he fully lives up to his reputation. This volume not only treats in remarkable detail the history of Bible translating in the missionary world, but it also deals with the more profound issues of the theological implications of translating, the linguistic and cultural aspects of

Eugene A. Nida, a linguist, anthropologist, and biblical scholar, has served the American Bible Society and The United Bible Societies as a consultant since 1943. His work with translators in more than 200 languages and in more than 85 countries has provided the basis for a number of books and articles on translation theory and practice.

Translation as Mission: Bible Translation in the Modern Missionary Movement.


Anything written by William A. Smalley is bound to be comprehensive, accurate, and insightful, and in the preparation of this excellent volume he fully lives up to his reputation. This volume not only treats in remarkable detail the history of Bible translating in the missionary world, but it also deals with the more profound issues of the theological implications of translating, the linguistic and cultural aspects of

Eugene A. Nida, a linguist, anthropologist, and biblical scholar, has served the American Bible Society and The United Bible Societies as a consultant since 1943. His work with translators in more than 200 languages and in more than 85 countries has provided the basis for a number of books and articles on translation theory and practice.

From Everywhere to Everywhere: A World View of Christian Witness.


Bishop Michael Nazir-Ali brings a rich combination of gifts to this overview of mission today. Brought up in an Islamic society, he is respectful of the faith of Muslims while also committed to sharing with them the good news of Jesus. A keen biblical and patristic scholar, well aware of the importance of critical philosophical study, he is also an eager interpreter of the neglected experience of the early churches in Asia. Formerly Bishop of Raiwind in the United Church of Pakistan, he remains an Anglican and has been close to the

Martin Conway is President of the Selly Oak Colleges, Birmingham, England, a federation of adult education colleges, four of which are the historic mission training centres of the main British world mission agencies apart from the Roman Catholic. An English lay Anglican, he has previously served with the World Student Christian Federation and the World Council of Churches.

In the heart of Anglican thinking and spirituality in his service as co-ordinator of studies for the 1988 Lambeth Conference. He also expounds sympathetically both Minjung theology and the experience of the base Christian communities of Latin America.

Yet I kept on asking myself: precisely who is this book for? The approach presupposes readers who will need no persuading to take theology seriously. The very opening paragraph takes us deep into the nature of God as Trinity. Eventually I came to see it as his manifesto for the Church Missionary Society, of which he became General Secretary two years ago, intended primarily for his colleagues in mission leadership.

The writing is always irenic. The only people directly attacked are those who insist on the "homogeneous unit principle." So it feels rather like a textbook, crying out for readers who

Catholic Theological Union offers contemporary responses to missionaries at home and abroad.

Creative missiologists include: Claude-Marie Barbour, Stephen Bevans, SVD, Eleanor Doidge, LoB, Archimedes Fomasari, MCCJ, Anthony Gittins, CSSp, John Kacarow, MM, Jamie Phelps, OP, Ana Maria Pineda, SM, Robert Schenrier, CPPS. Contact:

CATHOLIC THEOLOGICAL UNION
Admissions Office—IBBOK
5401 South Cornell • Chicago, IL 60615 USA
(312) 324-4000

THIRSTY FOR FRESH IDEAS?

Try Catholic Theological Union's World Mission Program. Whether you're coping with fresh water shortages in the Philippines, water conservation in rural America, or helping parishes meet urban challenges,
will raise critical questions, test what he writes against their own practical experience, and draw the author into revealing first-hand stories of handling the inevitable difficulties. Given this, it will help many of us as an all-round, holistic discussion of world mission today and tomorrow.

For a quick taste of Bishop Michael's thinking, how's this for a missionary view of catholicity:

Mutual accountability between Christians of different backgrounds within the fellowship of the local church and between local churches within the fellowship of the Universal or Catholic Church is also an element in that transformation of individuals and communities which is brought about by the proclamation and the presence of the Gospel.

—Martin Conway

“A rare combination of theological clarity and experiential vigor.”

“Simply the finest collection of essays in any language on an important topic for the study of religion and interreligious dialogue today. . . . This is required reading for anyone working in interreligious dialogue and interfaith understanding.”

—Robert J. Schreiter

“Any teacher offering a course on interfaith dialogue who wishes to avoid both the heel-digging and abstract meandering such courses can set loose, and who knows that both relativism and absolutism must be avoided will see immediately how essential this book is.”

—Harvey Cox

ISBN 0-8028-0505-1 Paper, $27.95

Also in the Currents of Encounter Series:

DIALOGUE AND SYNCRETISM
An Interdisciplinary Approach
Jerald D. Gort, Hendrick M. Vroom, Rein Fernhout, & Anton Wessels, Editors Paper, $22.95

RELIGIONS AND THE TRUTH
Philosophical Reflections and Perspectives
Hendrick M. Vroom
Papers, $29.95

HINDUS AND CHRISTIANS
A Century of Protestant Ecumenical Thought
Wesley A. Ariarajah
Paper, $24.95

———


This book shows that Bible translation can be an exciting activity, and that a book about it can make exciting reading. The work gives as background the adventurous life of the first mission to Tahiti, including much information about that mission that is not commonly known. It shows the infinite patience and attention to detail that were required of the missionaries as they translated the Bible, first learning and achieving familiarity with its cadences and characteristics and then learning to understand the thought world of the people and reorienting their own concepts to fit into that world as they tried to produce a translation that would be both faithful and understandable.

The task required over twenty years (1813-1835), though of course various parts of the Bible were published as their translation became available. The translators started, oddly enough, with the last six chapters of 1 Kings, evidently making their first attempt on a book where misunderstandings would not produce great damage. Then they went on to the Gospels. They paid attention to what might be pronounceable by Tahitians, using “Messiah” instead of “Christ,” for example. They labored diligently to uncover the entire theological vocabulary of the Tahitian language so that they could use it to the full and with exactitude, rather than introducing unnecessary Western terminology. In this task it is impressive how much was contributed by Pomare, the King of Tahiti, a highly intelligent, if dissolve, person, who was one of a very small group of men fully initiated into the secrets and, therefore, the vocabulary of traditional Tahitian religion. He is seen in this book as the first Tahitian theologian of modern times, without whose extensive contribution the Tahitian Bible could not have acquired its necessary fluidity and exactitude.

The book is splendidly produced with several maps and many large illustrations. As a doctoral thesis this work won the prize of the Canton of Vaud as the best thesis in any field of study in 1988. It will also be a prized addition to mission history.

—Charles W. Forman

Charles W. Forman is Professor of Missions Emeritus, Yale Divinity School, New Haven, Conn.


Amaladoss brings unique qualifications and insight to the topic of mission and evangelization within contemporary Asia. He is Asian, served in India as Jesuit vice-provincial for formation, taught theology, and edited Vidyajyoti: Journal of Theological Reflection. Presently, he is assistant on the Jesuit General Council with special responsibility for the fields of evangelization, ecumenism, inculturation, and dialogue with other religions. It is this rich background that provides a deep wellspring for his creative theological-missiological writing.

This work centers on the Christian mission of "making all things new," and it focuses this task within an Asian perspective. As a collection of previously published papers, the book has been organized into three parts—each captured in one word: Dialogue, Pluralism, Evangelization. In broad strokes these three themes reflect the focus of the individual chapters; yet, each of the fourteen chapters and the conclusion could easily be read independently.

The author displays a facility to organize his material creatively and systematically. Using an Oriental-centric manner of presentation, Amaladoss sets forth his main theses (to note a few): the Second Vatican Council inaugurated a paradigm shift in the theology of mission; it is impossible to grasp the meaning of contemporary mission without a profound sense of mystery; mission is always God's project; the Asian context for evangelization is its poverty and its religiosity; the focus of mission centers on the Reign of God and on prophecy; the many cultures, religions, and peoples necessarily determine mission approaches in Asia.

This reviewer noted that some chapters end rather abruptly; some important theological questions in Christology, ecclesiology, and ministry are left unresolved; there is a fair amount of repetition due to independently authored chapters. Yet, Amaladoss certainly has provided readers a fine introduction to the questions, nuances, challenges, and initial successes of mission and evangelization in Asia in the decade of the 1990s.

—James H. Kroeger

How to Reach Secular People, by George G. Hunter, III. 0-687-17930-0. Paper, $9.95

George G. Hunter has a passion for reaching secular people with the Christian faith. He shares that passion with many churches, yet few of these churches know what to do to reach out beyond their ingrown programs, or even how to understand who secular people are. Hunter spent years researching and "doing evangelism." Here he gives us a powerful and compelling treatise on the way it is, why it is the way it is, and how to go about changing the status quo. Chapters include:

- How the West Was Lost
- Profiling the Secular Population
- Themes and Strategies for Reaching Secular People
- Communicating with Secular People
- What Kind of Christians Reach Secular People?
- What Kind of Church Reaches Secular People? (with What Effective Apostolic Congregations Do).

"For years to come this will be the manual for preparing practitioners of evangelism in the Western World."

—John R. Hendrich, Professor of Mission and Evangelism, Austin Presbyterian Theological Seminary

Required Reading

Order from your local bookstore, or call toll free: 1-800-672-1789.
The Truth Shall Make You Free: Confrontations.


Gustavo Gutiérrez: An Introduction to Liberation Theology.


Liberation Theology and Its Critics: Toward An Assessment.


Gustavo Gutiérrez is the father of liberation theology. Dissertations, theses, festschriften, books, and countless articles about Gutiérrez and his work have already been published, and the flow continues. This is as it should be, for Gutiérrez's light on the theological horizon is both brilliant and inspiring.

Yet Gutiérrez, as he himself claims, is first and foremost a Christian, not a theologian. He takes humility seriously. Thus, serious studies of Gutiérrez, like the above trio from Orbis Books, naturally point beyond the man and his theology to the social condition that directs his concern, i.e., desperate, dehumanizing poverty.

Gustavo Gutiérrez: An Introduction to Liberation Theology is a colorful overview of the man and the movement, with references to personal histories, principal players, critiques, ecclesiastical battles, and future trends. Robert McAfee Brown, professor emeritus at the Pacific School of Religion, knows Gutiérrez and his work perhaps more intimately than any other North American theologian. His insights into the man and his message are thus both novel and refreshing, written with a popular, clever flair.

Although the dramatic metaphor employed by Brown at times wears a little thin, the work is replete with incisive phrasing, a fine explication of significant, though slippery, terms such as "praxis," and, in the extensive notes, helpful suggestions for further research. This is an adroit, flavorful introduction to the "doyen" of liberation theology.

Interestingly, Brown, at the outset of his study, gives a hearty acknowledgment to Liberation Theology and Its Critics: Toward an Assessment. McGovern is indeed to be thanked for this solid resource, which combines a lucid style with a balanced, nonideological analysis of the major tenets and critiques of liberation theology. It is, perhaps, one of the most useful, thorough, and enlightening treatments of the provenance and scope of Latin American liberation theology currently available.

McGovern pinpoints the essence of Gutiérrez's new theological method—critical reflection on praxis—and provides fascinating vignettes of the history behind the sundry attacks on liberation theology, including those lodged by Lopez Trujillo, Roger Veerman, Cardinal Ratzinger, and Michael Novak.

A Jesuit professor of philosophy at the University of Detroit, McGovern shows how liberation theology, from its inception, has had to defend itself against baseless charges, and has thus been deflected from developing additional and much needed dimensions of its perspective.

One of the work's greatest strengths, however, is the wonderful sense of the evolution of liberation theology it provides, from the religious and political ferment of the late 1960s and early 1970s, through the embrace of, and the distancing from, dependency theory, to the current development of liberation spirituality and a lessening of political and economic analysis. McGovern reveals himself to be a prodigious researcher and an astute social scientist, providing an excellent analysis of dependency theory and its relationship to liberation theology.

The Truth Shall Make You Free: Confrontations is an appropriate title for this collection of Gutiérrez's response to Vatican critiques, as well as the discussion of his work by various professors at the theological faculty at the Catholic Institute of Lyons, France, where Gutiérrez was awarded a doc-
torate in theology in 1985. By submitting himself and his life's work to a doctoral defense at the zenith of his career (a giant looming over his examiners), Gutiérrez reveals a profound humility.

This work is thoughtful and well edited, and provides one of the most lucid statements of Gutiérrez's preferential option for the poor (pp. 158-60). On the whole, the material is heavily theological, and will prove invaluable for liberation theology scholars—unlike the books by Brown and McGovern, which will be more suited to those with less academic interest in the movement.

Just as Gustavo Gutiérrez returned from Europe in the 1960s with a liberal theological training that proved inadequate for Latin America's impoverished world, we in North America are emerging from our middle class, economically enhanced past to a world of homelessness, drugs, high infant mortality, ecological destruction, and deeply rooted despair. Our theology, like that of Gutiérrez, has to be contextualized and rendered anew.

All three of these works are pointing to a future, a future in which all of us, especially the poor, live with a sense of justice and friendship.

—Stephen B. Scharper

A Handbook on Inculturation.


An important contemporary concept in missiology is what Catholics call "inculturation." Until now, it has been difficult to find an overview of the subject in one book, but Peter Schineller, superior of the Nigeria-Ghana Jesuit Mission, has responded to this lacuna by writing a very clear and readable introductory text. He begins by noting that "Wherever the gospel is lived, wherever it is preached, we have the obligation to search continually for ways in which that good news can be more deeply lived, celebrated, and shared. This process is none other than the process of inculturation" (p. 3).

The first sixty pages of the book review the meaning, theological bases, and history of inculturation, contrasting it with other inadequate terms (imposition, translation, adaptation) and distinguishing it from similar concepts such as indigenization, contextualization, and incarnation.

The second half of the book addresses the more difficult and more practical question of how inculturation is done. Working with a model Schineller calls the pastoral (hermeneutical) circle, he notes that the process of inculturation involves the interaction of three elements: the situation, the Christian message, and the pastoral agent or minister. While acknowledging the "difficulty of building a community that is both Christian and true to its own cultural heritage" (p. 72), he proceeds to illustrate inculturation in Nigeria (chap. 6) and in Latin America (chap. 7), where he sees liberation theology and basic Christian communities as the paradigm for inculturation in that context of poverty and oppression. He concludes his illustrations of inculturation by turning to the modernized context of the United States (chap. 8), suggesting that this may be the most difficult context in which to inculturate gospel values.

Despite many strengths of this book, I want to note three limitations. The author's strength as a Catholic becomes his weakness; he cites very few non-Catholic sources and seems to be unaware of similar developments toward contextualization in evangelical and conciliar Protestant circles. I found it frustrating at a number of points to be reminded that this was only a handbook, precluding the author from going into greater depth. A bibliography and index would have made this handbook much more useful. Despite these detractions, we are fortunate to be able to add Schineller's excellent introductory text to the growing literature that discusses how Gospel and culture interact in mission.

—Darrell Whiteman

In Memoriam

DAVID J. BOSCH
1929-1992

"...who bore witness to the light."

ORBIS BOOKS
Maryknoll NY

Darrell Whiteman is Professor of Cultural Anthropology in the E. Stanley Jones School of World Mission and Evangelism at Asbury Theological Seminary. He has mission and research experience in Central Africa and Melanesia.


Professor of church history at the Assemblies of God Theological Seminary, Dr. Gary B. McGee has provided a helpful survey of the history of mission outreach of his denomination during the last thirty years (1959–1989). In this second volume of This Gospel Shall Be Preached, McGee records the period of explosive growth worldwide of the Assemblies of God.

The volume is rightfully dedicated to J. Philip Hogan. So great was the influence of this executive director of the Division of Foreign Missions, the period covered by the book may be considered the “Hogan Era.” It was during this era that pentecostals moved out of relative isolation and began to enjoy the benefits of increased cooperation and accompanying respect of other denominations and mission organizations.

In light of the increasing influence of the charismatic stream in the church around the world, this brief history is of great significance. McGee provides an excellent survey of the theological foundations, the guiding principles, the developing strategies, the leading personnel, and the amazing results of the movement. This history is not limited to the Assemblies of God. McGee acknowledges the present diversity of pentecostalism in classical denominations, charismatic renewal movements, independent congregations, and indigenous ethnic churches. All are considered a part of the twentieth-century revival that centers on Spirit-baptism and the accompanying signs considered to be evidence of divine power.

Missiologists and church leaders will profit from this concise historical survey. It provides a helpful case study of balance between the spontaneous work of the Spirit and the strategic work of Christian men and women.

—J. Ronald Blue


During a time of unprecedented change in the U.S.S.R., Eastern Europe, and Southern Africa, conflicts in the Middle East continue with little hope of similar breakthroughs. The long-standing Israeli-Palestinian clash occupies center stage in the volatile region where convoluted conflicts in Lebanon and the gulf region defy rational analysis. In the view of Rosemary and Herman Ruether, highly charged historical dynamics have helped produce the peculiar and tragic dimensions of the confrontation in the Holy Land.

The Ruethers bring an unusual combination of interests and history to
this book. Rosemary Ruether, a well-known scholar and prolific feminist theologian at Garrett Theological Seminary, wrote on the Christian roots of anti-Semitism in *Faith and Fratricide* fifteen years ago; Herman Ruether is a former director of the U.S.-based Palestine Human Rights Campaign. They lived and studied at the Tantur Ecumenical Institute (near Bethlehem) during the winter of 1987.

This provocative book is divided into three parts. Following a short introduction on the classical foundations of Judaism, Christianity, and Islam, they zero in on the historical development of the conflict. The focus here is on Zionism, Palestinian nationalism, and what the Ruethers call “contradictions of the Jewish state.” Finally, the text explores and critiques various elements of Christian relations to Judaism and Zionism.

The Ruethers do not offer political solutions. They do advocate a hard-nosed search for accurate understanding and truth-telling among Israelis, Palestinians, and others outside, whose interest and support figure prominently in the mix. They suggest that a deeper change of attitude, even repentance, must inform an authentic search for a lasting political solution.

This controversial book is bound to elicit strong responses and provoke heated debate. The debate, if focused on the central issues addressed by the Ruethers, should contribute substantially toward the difficult search for justice and peace in this war-weary part of the world.

—Charles A. Kimball

---

**Interreligious Dialogue in the Catholic Church Since Vatican II: An Historical and Theological Study.**


This volume has not received the attention it deserves. One problem is that the title is inaccurate and inadequate. The book is actually a comparative study of interreligious dialogue activity in the Catholic Church and in the World Council of Churches (WCC).

In the case of the Catholic Church, the study focuses on the Secretariat for Non-Christians from its beginning in 1964 until the issuance of a major set of dialogue guidelines in 1984. In the case of the WCC, it is the Sub-unit for Dialogue with People of Living Faiths and Ideologies (DFI), from events in 1967 (preliminary to its founding in 1971) until 1979, when the Central Committee approved the “Guidelines on Dialogue” that had been drafted at the Chiang Mai consultation in 1977. It is unfortunate that the study of the WCC does not include the important discussion and developments about dialogue that occurred at the Vancouver Assembly in 1983.

The book first examines what the two agencies have said about the nature and purpose of interreligious dialogue, then analyzes “the underlying theology of religions that underpins their activity” (p. 3).

Several major findings emerge from the study. First are the differences between the two agencies. The

---

*No Other Name*

"Indispensable for the study of the final destiny of the unevangelized."

—CLARK H. PINNOCK*

“Sanders has written a landmark work on the question of the ultimate destiny of those who do not hear the gospel in their lifetime. **No Other Name** is the most comprehensive review available of historic and contemporary positions on this subject. And it includes a fair-minded citation of the pros and cons of each point of view. Weaknesses of both restrictive and universalist perspectives are exposed, and a ‘wider hope’ category of views is affirmed with due acknowledgement of its own ambiguities. Must reading for those struggling with the issues of religious pluralism.”

—GABRIEL FACKRE

**ISBN 0-8028-0615-5**

"Brilliantly crafted . . . a model of systematic, constructive theology . . . Drawing on extensive research, Sanders has conducted a thorough, biblical, historical, and theological investigation of the issues. The book leaves people free to choose what they should believe, but whatever one’s position, no reader will fail to come away from reading it wiser and better informed."

—CLARK H. PINNOCK (in the foreword)*

**NO OTHER NAME**

*An Investigation into the Destiny of the Un evangelized*

JOHN SANDERS

Paper, $16.95

---

Gerald H. Anderson, Editor of this journal, is Director of the Overseas Ministries Study Center, New Haven, Connecticut.
Secretariat (with rare exceptions) does not itself sponsor dialogue meetings, but devotes its efforts to preparing the study that two unresolved issues dominate the discussion about interreligious dialogue in both agencies. The first is what Sheard describes as “the persistent problem of mission” (p. 283), namely, the relation between mission and dialogue. The second concern is that dialogue leads to syncretism, and the whole issue of radical relativism in the theology of religions.

In the concluding pages the author (about whom we unfortunately learn nothing) indicates his personal preference for a theology of religions that would include elements of Karl Rahner, John Hick, Paul Knitter, and John Macquarrie. Whether or not one shares his conclusions and preferences, the book is a rich resource of documentation on the development of interreligious dialogue in these two official agencies.

—Gerald H. Anderson

THE EMERGENCE OF LIBERATION THEOLOGY
Radical Religion and Social Movement Theory
Christian Smith

Christian Smith here tells, for the first time, the full social history of the movement that emerged in Latin America in the 1960s, a movement that has affected the Roman Catholic church worldwide. Through personal interviews and documentary research, Smith explains how this movement emerged and why it succeeded. He then analyzes the complex social, political, organizational, and ideological forces that sustain this radical new model of pastoral work.

$35.00 cloth, $14.95 paper

The University of Chicago Press
At bookstores, or for MCVISA orders call:
1-800-621-2736. In Illinois: 312-568-1550

Ans J. van der Bent, now retired, was the librarian and ecumenical research officer of the World Council of Churches.


Langmore examines in this volume 327 European missionaries who worked in Papua between 1874 and 1914 in the London Missionary Society, Sacred Heart Mission, Wesleyan Methodist Mission, and Anglican Mission. She aimed to write a "group biography" that "brings to life the missionaries" (pp. xv, xviii). The first half of the book examines the origins and backgrounds of the missionaries, their lifestyles in Papua, and perceptions of the people and of their own task. Then follows a most useful chapter on the neglected role of women missionaries. The following chapters cover the work of each mission and their relationships to government personnel and other Europeans in Papua. A final chapter evaluates their service records.

Group biographies of this kind are very difficult to bring off successfully. Inevitably there will be a concentration on those missionaries about whom a good deal is already known (either because they were outstanding figures or prolific writers) and a neglect of those marginal figures about whom little is documented. There is also the danger of presenting the reader with many impersonal statistics and generalizations on the one hand, and of disconnected personal statistics and generalizations on the other. Unfortunately, Langmore's book does not entirely overcome these problems. The author is at her best when she strays from her aim of group biography and concentrates on the broader aspects of the missions. In this respect chapters 8 and 9 are especially good.

As an overview of Christian missions in Papua this book will be a very useful source, though regrettable the format the author has chosen to adopt makes it more a catalogue of people and opinions than a coherent critical study.

—John Parratt


John Wesley's Mission to Scotland, 1751–1790.


Methodists in Scotland, always rare birds, are thought by some to be approaching the status of an endangered species. Yet John Wesley devoted no less than twenty preaching tours to Scotland, the last when he was already eighty-seven years of age. He met neither the furious opposition nor the demonstrative acceptance he was used to in England. Few scoffed, no one threw stones, ministers were often friendly and local bigwigs hospitable. People heard him with quiet attention and then for the most part went on as before. Wesley's frustrations with the

Andrew Walls, Scottish Methodist, is Director of the Centre for the Study of Christianity in the Non-Western World, University of Edinburgh, Scotland.
Scots regularly burst out in his journal; yet he kept coming back.

This book reflects a similar spirit. It is clearly written out of love of the subject, yet it is not clear what it is for. It cannot be intended to illuminate Scottish Methodism, for the entire literature on that topic is ignored. It presents no new analysis of Wesley’s mission or the Scottish context; it bears no impression from the scholarly writing on such matters published in the last quarter of a century. It does not even provide connected accounts of the patriarch’s Scottish journeys in themselves. The author’s consuming interest is topographical. Each Scottish location mentioned by Wesley is lovingly recorded, each journal or diary account of it faithfully summarized. Anything said about the same place by the other celebrated eighteenth-century literary travelers—Defoe, Smollett, Boswell, and Johnson—is spliced in. The book will not be without interest; Wesley is forever interesting. Nor is it without use; it has carefully made indexes and apparatus (revealing, for instance, that nearly half of Wesley’s Scottish days were spent in the three cities of Edinburgh, Aberdeen, and Glasgow) and a chapter on the potentially interesting topic of Wesley’s reading about Scotland.

Is this cool reaction unduly grudging? Perhaps. But as John Wesley himself said, “Your Scots are such terrible critics that few of our preachers care to go amongst them.”

—Andrew Walls

---

**We’ve Invited Some Good Friends**

Gary McGee  
*Fall 1992*

Lois McKinney  
*Spring 1993*

Guillermo Cook  
*Spring 1993*

**Why not join us?**

**Announcing 1992–1993 Senior Mission Scholars in Residence**

OMSC welcomes into residence this year Drs. Gary McGee, Lois McKinney, and Guillermo Cook as Senior Mission Scholars. In addition to sharing in the leadership of OMSC’s regular Study Program, these highly respected colleagues will offer to our missionary and overseas residents personal consultation and tutorial assistance. Write for Study Program Schedule and Application for Residence.

**Overseas Ministries Study Center**

490 Prospect St., New Haven, CT 06511
Tel: (203) 624-6672  Fax: (203) 865-2857

Senior Scholar, Fall 1993: Dr. Phil Parshall

---

**Dissertation Notices**

Agtarap, Alfredo San Pedro.  
“A Christian Response to Philippine Liberation Movements.”  

Campbell, Margaret M.  
“Critical Theory and Liberation Theology: A Comparison of Jürgen Habermas and Gustavo Gutierrez.”  

Harper, Susan Billington.  
“Azariah and Indian Christianity in the Late Years of the Raj.”  

Sung, Kee Ho.  
“The Doctrine of the Second Advent of Jesus Christ in the Writings of Albert B. Simpson.”  
Sept. 10-12, 1992: **Workshop on Grant Seeking and Proposal Writing for Overseas Mission Projects.** Mary Jeanne Lindinger, Mission Project Service, New York. $75

Sept. 29-Oct. 2: **Toward Century 21 in Mission.** Dr. Gerald H. Anderson, OMSC. Cosponsored by MARC/World Vision and Mission Society for United Methodists. $65

---

Get out of the routine and into Today’s Mission Issues at OMSC

Sept. 14-16: **Developing Your Church and Mission Archives.** Dr. Stephen L. Peterson, Trinity College, Hartford, and Martha Lund Smalley, Yale Divinity School. $75

Sept. 17-19: **Oral History: Helping Christians Tell Their Own Story.** Dr. Jean-Paul Wiest and Cathy McDonald of “Maryknoll in China” project. Cosponsored by F.M.M. Mission Resource Center. $75

---

ATTEND BOTH ARCHIVE AND ORAL HISTORY SEMINARS FOR ONLY $110


Oct. 5-9: “**Passages** and Vocational Renewal in Missionary Life.** Maria F. Rieckelman, M.D., Maryknoll Sisters, and Dr. Donald Jacobs, Mennonite Christian Leadership Foundation. $95

Oct. 12-16: **Writing Workshop: Communicating with the Folks Back Home.** Robert T. Coote, OMSC. $95

Oct. 26-30: **Christians Meeting Muslims.** Dr. David A. Kerr, MacDonald Center for Study of Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations, Hartford Seminary. $95

Nov. 2-6: **Guidelines for a Biblical Theology of Mission.** Canon Graham Kings, Henry Martyn Lecturer in Missiology, Cambridge, England. $95

Nov. 10-13: **Lessons for Mission from Korea and Japan.** Dr. James M. Phillips, OMSC. $65

Nov. 16-20: **Pentecostal/Charismatic Mission Theology and Strategy.** Dr. Gary B. McGee, OMSC Senior Mission Scholar in Residence. $95

Nov. 30-Dec. 4: **Missions and Spiritual Warfare.** Dr. Paul G. Hiebert, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School. Cosponsored by Baptist General Conference, Christian & Missionary Alliance, Eastern Mennonite Board of Missions, Latin America Mission, Mennonite Board of Missions, and SIM International. $95

---

Send more information about these seminars:

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

NAME

ADDRESS

CITY STATE ZIP

---

Publishers of INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN OF MISSIONARY RESEARCH
Book Notes

Ariel, Yaakov.

Ateek, Naim S., Marc H. Ellis, Rosemary Radford Ruether, eds.

Australian Evangelical Alliance.

Barcatta, Bede.
A History of the Southern Vicariate of Colombo, Sri Lanka; Being Also the History of the Apostolate of the Sylvestrine-Benedictine Monks in the Island.

Brierley, Peter.

Haddad, Yvonne Yazbeck, ed.
The Muslims of America.

King, Noel Q., Klaus Fiedler, Gavin White, eds.
Robin Lamburn—From a Missionary’s Notebook: The Yao of Tunduru and Other Essays.

Knox, Elisabeth.

Sanderlin, George, ed.
Witness: Writings of Bartolomé de Las Casas.

Schreiter, Robert J.
Reconciliation: Mission and Ministry in a Changing Social Order.

Väth, Alfons, unter Mitwirkung von Louis Van Hee.

Wiles, Maurice.
Christian Theology and Inter-religious Dialogue.

Wilkinson, John.

In Coming Issues

Claiming Our Heritage: Chinese Women and Christianity
Kwok Pui-lan

Evangelist or Homemaker? Mission Strategies of Early Nineteenth-Century Missionary Wives in Burma and Hawaii
Dana Robert

To Stir the Church: The Student Foreign Missions Fellowship over Fifty-Five Years
H. Wilbert Norton, Sr.

My Pilgrimage in Mission—A Series, with articles by
Simon Barrington-Ward
H. Daniel Beeby
Donald R. Jacobs
Samuel H. Moffett
William Pannell
John V. Taylor
and others

In our Series on the Legacy of Outstanding Missionary Figures of the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries, articles about
Charles H. Brent
Amy Carmichael
Donald Fraser
Melvin Hodges
J. C. Hoekendijk
Jacob Jocz
Lewis Bevan Jones
Johann Ludwig Krapf
Lars Peter Larsen
W. A. P. Martin
Lottie Moon
Constance E. Padwick
John Philip
Timothy Richard
John Ritchie
Ruth Rouse
William Taylor
Franz Michael Zahn